

University of Groningen

Effective public enforcement of cartels

Outhuijse, Annalies

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:

2019

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Outhuijse, A. (2019). *Effective public enforcement of cartels: explaining the high percentages of litigation and successful litigation in the Netherlands*. University of Groningen.

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Effective public enforcement of cartels: explaining the high percentages of litigation and successful litigation in the Netherlands

Annalies Outhuijse

Annalies Outhuijse

Effective public enforcement of cartels: explaining the high percentages of litigation and successful litigation in the Netherlands

ISBN: 978-94-034-1769-1 (Paperback)

ISBN: 978-94-034-1768-4 (Ebook)

Copyright © 2019 Annalies Outhuijse

All rights reserved. No part of this thesis may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any way or by any means without the prior permission of the author, or when applicable, of the publishers of the scientific papers.

Cover design by: Danielle Balk

Layout and design by Danielle Balk | persoonlijkproefschrift.nl.

Printed by: Printing: Ridderprint BV | www.ridderprint.nl



university of
 groningen

**Effective public enforcement of cartels:
 explaining the high percentages of
 litigation and successful litigation
 in the Netherlands**

PhD thesis

to obtain the degree of PhD
 at the University of Groningen
 on the authority of the
 Rector Magnificus prof. E. Sterken
 and in accordance with
 the decision by the College of Deans.

This thesis will be defended in public on

Tuesday 25 June 2019 at 16.15 hours

by

Annalies Outhuijse

born on 1 April 1992
 in Franeker

Supervisors

Prof. J.H. Jans

Prof. H.H.B. Vedder

Assessment committee

Prof. A.T. Marseille

Prof. J. Langer

Prof. W.P.J. Wils

Contents

Chapter one: Introduction

1. Introduction 10
2. Methodology and plan of approach 12
3. Justification methodological choices 16
4. Relation research to previous research 19

Chapter two: Effective public enforcement of the cartel prohibition in the Netherlands: A comparison of ACM fining decisions, District Court judgments and TIAT judgments

1. Introduction 24
2. Analysis of District Court judgments 25
3. To appeal or not to appeal 28
4. Analysis of TIAT judgments 34
5. Negative externalities of the Dutch public enforcement regime 44
6. Developments influencing judicial review in the Netherlands 46
7. Concluding remarks 48

Chapter three: Effective public enforcement of cartels: Rates of challenged and annulled cartel fines in ten European Member States

1. Introduction 52
2. Relevant literature regarding the European enforcement 55
3. The rates and methodological considerations 58
4. Rates, nature of annulments and developments individual Member States 61
5. Summary and concluding observations 84

Chapter four: The effective public enforcement of the prohibition of anti-competitive agreements: Why do undertakings in the Netherlands appeal?

1. Introduction 92
2. Actors, procedures and percentages 93
3. Explanation of appeal behaviour – the theory 101
4. Explanation of appeal behaviour – the interviews 107
5. Explanation of appeal behaviour – the practice 111
6. Concluding remarks 119

Chapter five: The effective public enforcement of cartels: Perceptions on the functioning of the objection procedure and the reality

1.	Introduction	124
2.	Introduction to the cartel objection procedure	125
3.	The objection procedure in practice – experiences	129
4.	The objection procedure in practice – case studies	135
5.	The ability of the cartel objection procedure to resolve disputes	141
6.	Summary and concluding remarks	144
	References	146

Chapter six: The effective public enforcement of the prohibition of anti-competitive agreements: Which factors influence the high percentage of annulments of Dutch cartel fines?

1.	Introduction	150
2.	Introduction to the Dutch annulments	152
3.	Methodology	153
4.	Evaluating the factors	157
4.1	Party features	157
4.2	Case features	165
4.3	Law features	171
4.4	Court features	180
5.	Summary and concluding remarks	195

Chapter seven: Conclusions

1.	Research outcomes	202
2.	Implications research outcomes and explorative recommendations	210
3.	Relevance of the research outcomes, limitations and possible follow-up research	220

Annex

	Annex I: Nederlandse samenvatting	226
	Annex II: Acknowledgments	230
	Annex III: Curriculum Vitae	232

