Festivals as Integrative Sites
Valuing Tangible and Intangible Heritage for Sustainable Development
Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Forewords</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa Week: Activism, Diversity and Inclusion in Post-Apartheid Johannesburg</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bristol Radical Film Festival: Screening Marginalised Films in Non-traditional Urban Spaces</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curacao North Sea Jazz Festival: Marketing and Branding Jazz Heritage</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dunga Fish Night and Got Ramegi Festival: Preserving Nature, Myths and Sacred Sites</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edinburgh Festivals: City, Culture and Sustainability</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electric Castle: Festivalising Conservation and Restoration</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fietas Festival: Reclaiming Streets, Performing Memory</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gamlestaden Jazz Festival: Jazz Festivals in Urban Spaces</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infecteding the City: Artistic Interfaces and Happenings in Everyday Spaces</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Into the Great Wide Open: Festival as Living Lab</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaapse Klopse: Carnival and Conflict in Cape Town</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manchester Histories Festival: Multiplicity and Plurality in Narratives of the City</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manchester International Festival: Global Aspirations, Local Embeddedness</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musica Sulla Boche: Linking Natural and Cultural Heritage through Landscape</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ordsall Festival: Between State and Community Lies Festival</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poheda Festival: Ideas, Politics and Cultural Expression</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Still Walking: In Search of Hidden Urban Heritage</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summer Jazz Bicycle Tour: Landscape as Heritage, Heritage as Jazz</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Agenda for Research and Practice</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Forewords

Professor Tony Whyton,
CHIME Project Leader, Birmingham City University

This report provides compelling examples of festivals as integrative sites for tangible and intangible cultural heritage. Cases are drawn from the JPI Heritage Plus CHIME project (Cultural Heritage and Improvised Music in European Festivals) and our Associated Partners (Mistra Urban Futures and Julie’s Bicycle) which illustrate different international festival contexts. Cultural events are integrally linked to societal issues and challenges, from the relationship between global change and local interests to the reclamation of urban spaces, from questions of rural sustainability to the relationship between memory and myth-making in historic locations. They demonstrate how cultural heritage remains contested and how festivals directly feed into these debates; between top-down and bottom-up interpretations of heritage, probing what counts for heritage in different cultural settings, and asking questions about the relationship between dominant and minority cultures. This rich collection paints a complex and diverse picture of tangible and intangible cultural heritage to inspire further discussion, debate and analysis.

Professor David Simon,
Director, Mistra Urban Futures

The work in this report is fully consistent with the agenda of Mistra Urban Futures, a Centre using transdisciplinary co-production methodologies to promote locally appropriate urban sustainability. It is now widely recognised that sustainable urbanism is ultimately about people and how we live in towns and cities. Central to human wellbeing in urban areas are the social and cultural dimensions of how people relate to one another and to their built environment. Valuing the architectural and cultural heritage with which urban space is imbued, and the practices and rituals performed within them, is crucial. Indeed, this has been recognised at the highest level, not just by UNESCO but in the inclusion of a specific target in the Urban Sustainable Development Goal 11, devoted to strengthening efforts to protect cultural and natural heritage. Progress in this respect, as with all the urban targets, will require collaborative efforts by national, regional and local government institutions, as well as non-state actors.

Introduction

We commit ourselves to the sustainable leveraging of natural and cultural heritage, both tangible and intangible, in cities and human settlements, as appropriate, through integrated urban and territorial policies and adequate investments at the national, subnational and local levels, to safeguard and promote cultural infrastructures and sites, museums, indigenous cultures and languages, as well as traditional knowledge and the arts, highlighting the role that these play in rehabilitating and revitalizing urban areas, and in strengthening social participation and the exercise of citizenship.

(New Urban Agenda, 2016).

Culture must be seen as intangible and tangible capital; culture is a process and a way of life; culture is value-binding; and culture is creative expression.1

Culture at the margins

The role and value of culture has been historically and persistently marginalised in strategies and policies across multiple scales of action. Cultural production is at the margins of economic development strategies. Economic growth and technological advancement are the pillars on which governments around the globe base their policies, investments and interventions. Culture is valued to the extent that it fosters these aims, through creative industries, entrepreneurship or the production of creative quarters. The development of creative cities discourses reflects the dominance of techno-economic urbanisation processes in the context of economic growth.

Cultural heritage is at the margins of cultural economy initiatives. Within cultural economy initiatives at multiple scales, heritage is often under-represented or overlooked. Flagship projects, investments in large cultural organisations and the provision of cultural opportunities take precedence over historic buildings, everyday leisure or community assets. Natural heritage, with high environmental but lower economic value, has also been side-lined in favour of prestigious cultural investments. Intangible heritage is at the margins of cultural heritage discussions. Where heritage does form a coherent part of societal strategies, the tangible trumps the intangible. Tangible and visible cultural assets are easier to identify, manage and value. Nurturing intangible forms of expression, cultural practices and the processes through which people make meaning in their everyday lives requires fundamentally different approaches.

From margins to mainstream?

This triple marginalisation of culture has motivated a range of processes to argue for alternative imaginaries of the role and value of culture in development. One mechanism for achieving this has been through campaigning for culture to be a ‘fourth pillar’ for sustainability. The grouping of United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG) has sought to promote the Agenda 21 for culture, to develop the cultural sector and to promote the rightful place of culture in all public policies.1

The 1964 Venice Charter focussed exclusively on physical tangible heritage of the built environment via protection of sites and monuments. It wasn’t until 2003 that UNESCO developed its Convention on Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage. This was significant because it increased debate about the nature, value, meaning and character of heritage. Within the Convention was recognition that heritage protection must involve local communities and communities of interest. It was therefore welcomed as an ‘an attempt to acknowledge and privilege non-western practices and manifestations of heritage’.2

Fast forward to 2016 and the New Urban Agenda, signed in Quito, Ecuador, appears to further correct a cultural-blindness in sustainable development policies and practices by insisting on the importance of cultural diversity in efforts to promote more progressive urban transitions. In particular, it notes the important contribution of culture to addressing the impacts of climate change, promoting equitable and affordable access and developing peaceful, inclusive and participatory cities.

This aligns with UNESCO themes of fostering freedom of expression, protecting heritage and fostering creativity. Underpinning international frameworks is a three-fold approach to build on the power of culture to promote human and inclusive cities; improve the quality of the built and natural environment through culture; and integrate culture in urban policies to foster sustainable urban development.3

Grand statements have been translated into action through the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) – 17 commitments, goals and targets adopted by the international community to end poverty, fight inequality and injustice and foster environmental sustainability by 2030. Culture appears across multiple SDGs, including those that commit to quality education, economic growth, sustainable consumption and production patterns and peaceful and inclusive societies. Significantly, culture is directly addressed in Goal 11, which aims to ‘make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable’. A specific target commits signatories to ‘strengthen efforts to protect and safeguard the world’s cultural and natural heritage’.4

Such international commitments are both encouraging and problematic. On the one hand frameworks provide a more integrated approach to recognising intangible and tangible heritage and challenge dominant approaches to the cultural economy within a wider and more holistic approach to sustainable development. On the other hand, there remains much distance to be travelled. For instance, measuring progress on the implementation of the goals is through indicators relating to the % of budget provided for maintaining cultural and natural heritage and the % of urban areas and historical and cultural sites accorded protected status. This is problematic because, like heritage lists, cultural heritage should be regarded as an ongoing movement and not as an immutable body which is the outcome of reference points to which rigid delimitation criteria have been applied.5

Greater analysis is needed of the assumptions underpinning international frameworks and the relationship to policy and practices in different local contexts. How do grand statements manifest and connect on the ground?6

Festivals as integrative sites

This report seeks to explore this question through the lens of festivals. Festivals are international cultural practices, taking plural forms and expressions across the world. They offer an empirical lens to enrich our understanding about how tangible and intangible cultural heritage combine, collide, conflict and cohere. They offer a space and time for stakeholders and communities to express their agency to promote their cultural identities and histories.7 Festivals provide a window onto the world and how cultural expressions manifest and connect on the ground?

Festivals as integrative sites

This report seeks to explore this question through the lens of festivals. Festivals are international cultural practices, taking plural forms and expressions across the world. They offer an empirical lens to enrich our understanding about how tangible and intangible cultural heritage combine, collide, conflict and cohere. They offer a space and time for stakeholders and communities to express their agency to promote their cultural identities and histories.7 Festivals provide a window onto the world and how cultural expressions manifest and connect on the ground?

What each festival has in common is that they serve as dramatic backdrops to politically charged events and occasions. Each of the festivals in the anthology are illuminated.

What tensions and issues emerge in the instrumentalisation and essentialisation of culture as a tool in sustainable development? What does this mean for action at a local level, and how do we avoid cultural appropriations and exoticisations of content and context? At their best, festivals perform a transformative role in society; they can provide a means of exploring a range of cultural identities, of re-engaging with the past and imagining alternative futures. Festivals encourage renewed perspectives on particular locations and social groups, and raise questions about the role of culture in a sustainable and just society.

In our conclusion we return to concerns which remain over implicit cultural and instrumental biases which inform policy statements at multiple levels. Whose culture, whose heritage matters? How do international frameworks reflect cultural diversities across the Global South and North? What tensions and issues emerge in the instrumentalisation and essentialisation of culture as a tool in sustainable development? What does this mean for action at a local level, and how do we avoid cultural appropriations and exoticisations of content and context? At their best, festivals perform a transformative role in society; they can provide a means of exploring a range of cultural identities, of re-engaging with the past and imagining alternative futures. Festivals encourage renewed perspectives on particular locations and social groups, and raise questions about the role of culture in a sustainable and just society.

What each festival has in common is that they serve as dramatic backdrops to politically charged events and occasions. Each of the festivals in the anthology are illuminated.

What tensions and issues emerge in the instrumentalisation and essentialisation of culture as a tool in sustainable development? What does this mean for action at a local level, and how do we avoid cultural appropriations and exoticisations of content and context? At their best, festivals perform a transformative role in society; they can provide a means of exploring a range of cultural identities, of re-engaging with the past and imagining alternative futures. Festivals encourage renewed perspectives on particular locations and social groups, and raise questions about the role of culture in a sustainable and just society.

What each festival has in common is that they serve as dramatic backdrops to politically charged events and occasions. Each of the festivals in the anthology are illuminated.

What tensions and issues emerge in the instrumentalisation and essentialisation of culture as a tool in sustainable development? What does this mean for action at a local level, and how do we avoid cultural appropriations and exoticisations of content and context? At their best, festivals perform a transformative role in society; they can provide a means of exploring a range of cultural identities, of re-engaging with the past and imagining alternative futures. Festivals encourage renewed perspectives on particular locations and social groups, and raise questions about the role of culture in a sustainable and just society.

What each festival has in common is that they serve as dramatic backdrops to politically charged events and occasions. Each of the festivals in the anthology are illuminated.

What tensions and issues emerge in the instrumentalisation and essentialisation of culture as a tool in sustainable development? What does this mean for action at a local level, and how do we avoid cultural appropriations and exoticisations of content and context? At their best, festivals perform a transformative role in society; they can provide a means of exploring a range of cultural identities, of re-engaging with the past and imagining alternative futures. Festivals encourage renewed perspectives on particular locations and social groups, and raise questions about the role of culture in a sustainable and just society.
Africa Week Carnival and Festival takes place each year in May in Yeoville, Johannesburg. It is scheduled to coincide with Africa Day (25th May) which marks the anniversary of the founding of the Organisation of African Unity, the precursor to the African Union.

The festival is organised by Gauteng Provincial Government and the African Diaspora Forum (ADF) and it celebrates Yeoville as a space of pan-African diversity and coexistence.

This spirit of Africa Week is echoed in its logo: a collaged map made from African flags. The first edition of the festival was held in 2010 and was part of the build-up to the first football World Cup to be hosted by an African nation. The festival can also be understood in the context of the deadly xenophobic attacks that happened in 2008. The victims of these and other violent incidents are commemorated during the festival.

The festival aims to promote human rights, harmony and social cohesion and it is opposed to all forms of discrimination, including racism and sexism. The programme of events is largely aimed at residents and many of the festival’s co-organisers in the ADF are Yeoville residents. The events programme is community-based and offers a mixture of music, dancing, food, films, crafts and exhibitions.

The festival also provides economic opportunity for local people as it creates a showcase for the work of local artists and there are opportunities to sell food. It also seeks to facilitate forms of cultural participation, especially in the carnival parade. A parade is led by musicians along Rockey Raleigh Street, followed by floats, giant puppets and people on foot in costumes.

Many different African diasporic communities live in the suburb of Yeoville. The carnival parade reflects the presence of African identities in the city and the festival further inscribes Johannesburg’s pan-African heritage into the city’s public spaces, making visible the extent to which migrancy has shaped the city and its cultures.

The area has such a cosmopolitan vibe about it. I hope more carnivals like this are held here.

Steven Sack, Yeoville Arts, Culture and Heritage Director

Contribution by: Naomi Roux

How long? 1 week
Frequency: Annual
Year established: 2009
Take place in: Yeoville
Johannesburg
South Africa

This longstanding migrant neighbourhood is known for its cosmopolitan feel. It is a diverse space that reflects many different African origins and cultures and its streets have their own history and mythologies. The area retains a nostalgic association as a creative and activist space in the 1980s that flew under the radar of the apartheid state.

As African people we have many things to celebrate together owing to the fact we are a diverse but united Continent under the umbrella of the African Union.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?
Africa Week draws attention to the importance of everyday spaces as venues in the making of heritage and place. Beyond the physical, the transformation of streets enables Yeoville to be recognised as a valuable space of diversity and inclusion in the face of continual threats of violence.

Celebration is an activist tool for visibility and belonging, in a context where violence against African foreigners is widespread. The festival draws on the tangible heritage of everyday street settings to support cultural cohesion and diversity and overcome xenophobia.

africa.day.festival.carnival
We show all kinds of films, old and new, that address all kinds of issues... As well as showcasing films that engage with the politics of the radical left and the traditions of socialism, anarchism and environmentalism that underpin it, we also want to pose the question: ‘what is radical film?'

Steve Presence, Co-organiser

The Bristol Radical Film Festival (BRFF) presents a selection of socially and politically engaged documentary and fiction films from around the world. It specialises in films that are under-represented on other circuits, such as video activist works and experimental short films.

The festival organising team originally had connections through a film studies degree course at the University of the West of England, where one founding member of the group gained his PhD, with a thesis on contemporary British activist and radical film. The university initially supported the festival, but over time the BRFF has become an independent organisation. BRFF forms ad hoc partnerships on single event screenings with a range of other groups, such as film collectives, or peoples’ history and worker solidarity organisations.

Although the festival has shown films in some of the city’s established arts spaces, its events tend to take place in bars, community centres and social spaces. Screening venues have changed every year, with films shown in bars and cafes, in community run spaces and digital outreach projects, anarchist social centres, drop in centres for sex workers, book shops, bicycle hubs and trade union halls.

At one screening, during a silent Soviet film shown in a café that was also a bicycle repair shop, volunteers from the audience took turns to ride on fixed bicycles beside the screen, pedalling to keep up the power for the LED projector and laptop for music.

The choice of films screened combines effectively with the way the festival presents itself in the city, with an emphasis on non-traditional spaces for film and on drawing attention to other progressive community based initiatives in the city of Bristol. This context matters, it demonstrates an engagement with traditions of socialism, anarchism and environmentalism. The organisers wanted to map the festival onto the existing counter-cultural, progressive activism scene in the city of Bristol. This context matters, it demonstrates an engagement with traditions of socialism, anarchism and environmentalism. The festival is organised by a collective of people, that is the idea, we are trying to move away from this personalisation of things. There is no director. Interviewee

How long? 3 days
Frequency: Annual
Year established: 2011
Takes place in: Bristol
UK

The festival is organised by a collective of people, that is the idea, we are trying to move away from this personalisation of things. There is no director.

The audiences may be primarily made up of activists, academics and rare film enthusiasts, but the programme is arranged in such a way as to try and reach groups often seen as marginalised: Iranian women, black workers, people from a poor area of South Bristol. Screenings are frequently advertised as being free: ‘nobody is turned away due to lack of funds and asylum seekers can come for free’.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

BRFF rescues and exhibits films which are under-represented in mainstream cinema circuits and are distinctive for their content, format or style. Blending academic research, film practice and consumption and political activism, the cultural content of film is a specific draw for the festival. Different films raise issues of political and social justice, for instance, Blacks Britannia (1978), a rare, once-banned film that offers analyses of state and street level racism. The festival challenges mainstream views of what culture matters and the politics of film production and consumption.

Place in the name: Venues carry meaning as much as the content of what is discussed. Events are screened in the mould of Latin American radical film making, shown in coffee shops, factories and community centres, often outside the sprawling city centre.

The ethos of the festival goes deep into its organisation. There is a collective leadership to the festival and multiple interactions between festival organisers, film-makers and festival audience. Non-hierarchical and long post screening discussions take place to support sociability and sharing knowledge. Each screening is therefore both an intervention in supporting marginalised intangible heritage and in the development of subaltern counter-cultures in the city, occupying urban spaces.
Curacao
North Sea
Jazz Festival
Marketing and Branding
Jazz Heritage

Curacao is a small island in the Caribbean that hosts a surprising number of international festivals each year. The annual North Sea Jazz Festival takes place in its capital city, Willemstad, which shares its name with a Dutch coastal town.

The island was once a Dutch colony, during which time it functioned as a slave trading site. Later, a large oil refinery was set up there by Royal Dutch Shell, which is under Venezuelan state ownership today. The Curacao North Sea Jazz Festival is a subsidiary of the North Sea Jazz Festival that originated from the city of Rotterdam, in the Netherlands, in 1976.

The North Sea Jazz brand is owned by American promotions company, Live Nation and, on Curacao, the festival is produced in partnership with a philanthropic cultural organisation, Fundashon Bon Intenshon [Good Intention Foundation].

An economic impact report in 2013 found that 80% of visitors were on the island of Curacao for the sole purpose of the festival. The music festival attracts thousands of international tourists, especially American tourists. Tickets for the events are expensive, but many local people (elites and middle classes) attend the festival too, of international tourists, especially American tourists. Tickets for the events are expensive, but many local people (elites and middle classes) attend the festival too, saving up for a long time to attend. Since 2013 there has also been a free opening night concert, which is broadcast on large screens around the city.

The festival makes use of conference centre venues and suburban offices, located away from the inner urban districts of Willemstad. Equipment and staff are shipped in for the festival from the Netherlands, although some local volunteers work on the food stalls and the clean-up team.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

The story of the festival is an unfinished one. Amid concern that the festival perpetuates unequal boundaries and xenocentrism, there appears to be a mismatch between official impact statements and the perspectives of local people. Local people enjoy the island’s prestigious association with jazz and yet their voices can be under-represented in impact reports which focus on economic benefit to the tourism industry. The UNESCO World Heritage site features in the locational branding, although the festival itself takes place in venues further away. The clear selling point is music in a tropical island setting.

Whilst there have been some efforts to highlight local Curacaos or Cuban musicians, questions are asked about the marginalisation of local jazz and improvisation traditions. The festival’s website reflects a programme that has become more mainstream and pop oriented over time. The stages are named after famous jazz musicians, and the programme’s main focus is on global music, with several line-ups featuring big names. Less visible are issues of how constructions of cultural heritage and authenticity are related to colonial legacies and imbalances of power, or how the festival acknowledges the history of slavery.

However, there is speculation that the North Sea Jazz Festival has revised the local jazz scene. The festival may be at a crossroads, with the possibility of being reclaimed by locals and alternative spaces being forged. In the build-up to the North Sea Jazz Festival, an alternative festival called Punda Jazz Vibes is now being organised at the World Heritage site on the island, which uses makeshift stages, books local amateur musicians, advertises through placing posters around the city and has a local audience.
Lake Victoria region of Kenya is very rich in cultural heritage that remains largely unexploited for economic gain. This rich reservoir consists of historic places, large cultural landscapes, monuments and other built heritage.\(^{20}\)

Kisumu County is one of the 47 Counties in Kenya, with a total land area of 2,009.5 km\(^2\) and another 567 km\(^2\) covered by water. Prehistoric settlements nestle alongside sacred or colonial architectural sites; natural heritage is plentiful in the resources provided in and around Lake Victoria and the beaches of Dunga, Hippo Point and Muyende. Yet far from being the custodians of a rich cultural and natural heritage, sites and practices are being destroyed through human activities, such as deforestation, quarrying, intergenerational value conflicts and processes of urbanisation. This has been attributed in part due to low levels of social, environmental and economic value associated with cultural heritage by local people.\(^ {20}\)

University academics and practitioners around Lake Kisumu have collaborated through the Kisumu Local Interaction Platform to set up two festivals to combine natural and cultural heritage to support sustainable livelihoods for local people. Dunga Fish Night was established to preserve lake ecology, fisherfolk culture and promote the development of ecotourism. Grounded in a celebration of fishing as a way of life, the emphasis has changed over time from ecotourism to promote development and promotion, social inclusion, community empowerment, community cohesion and cultural activities, such as boat racing. Programming reflects local practices and customs: food, music and dancing, basketry from locally-sourced papyrus reeds and pottery. Natural sites are used, such as the beach and Lake Front or community centres and attended by local people. This is a way of branding and marketing the potential of tourism around Lake Victoria to both domestic and foreign visitors, as well as enhancing local appreciation of natural and cultural heritage to promote conservation of lake habitats.

The Got Ramogi Cultural Festival takes place in Bondo, Siaya and is supported by the university, Ministry of Tourism and social services and organised with the local community. Set up in 2015 the aim is to preserve the culture, sacred sites and ecology of the Got Ramogi and also protect traditional cultures and myths. The festival includes cultural artefacts, tours of sacred sites, elders’ narrations of myths, pottery, basketry, music and a dancing gala. Venues include sacred sites of traditional worship which enables a direct encounter between natural (beaches) and intangible (indigenous knowledge on myths and legends) cultural heritage. Both festivals are seen to have considerable infrastructural benefits, such as masts, sanitation and power lines, is required to organise and deliver events, leaving behind longer legacies behind.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?
Both festivals combine tangible and intangible cultural heritage to meet diverse sustainability challenges. With dwindling fish reserves in Lake Victoria and a strong need to preserve the biodiversity of the wetlands, natural heritage protection is central to the Dunga Fish Night. The Got Ramogi Festival, on the other hand, is inspired by the desire not to lose myths and legends to future generations through the protection of sacred sites and cultural practices. The festival outlines the nexus between religion and history in the lives of the African people. They are platforms for branding and marketing the rich cultural and natural heritage of the site as well as the practices, beliefs and values of the traditional African way of life in the advent of modernization and urbanization.

Both are part of a wider ecotourism strategy, which raises inherent tensions related to the essentialisation and marketisation of culture, but also opportunities to support sustainable livelihoods for excluded groups around the Lake and generate revenue.\(^ {21}\) Community groups are fundamental to the delivery of the festival, exhibiting their artefacts, narrating stories and becoming tourist guides themselves. The festivals also provide an opportunity to integrate priorities around broader social issues, specifically in relation to the marginalisation of young people and women, for instance providing alternative revenue opportunities for women instead of ‘sex for fish’ along the river and Lake side.

Contributed by:
Stephen G. Agong,
Fredrick Odeede and
Patrick Hayombe


Edinburgh Festival was set up in 1947 and was described at the time as a “platform for the flowering of the human spirit.” Although best known for its August events, activities take place throughout the year. Drawing on a range of local, national and commercial funding, the festival structure and delivery is common to many large urban festivals. It is managed by a multi-sector partnership of the great and the good, bringing local authorities, the Scottish government, tourist boards and chambers of commerce together, with a named director and Board.

The festival has inscribed itself in the urban, national and international imagination, with official impact statements emphasising a ‘360 degree’ approach to quality of life, economic benefit, civic pride and a commitment to participation. Cultural, environmental and social effects are attributed to the festival, which attracts an audience of 4.5m people, with over 25,000 artists.

The Old and New Towns of Edinburgh were inscribed as a World Heritage Site by UNESCO in 1995. Festival sites include the medieval old town, Georgian new town and Edinburgh Castle. Location is critical; events take place all over the city with a mix of forms and style. Classic venues are used alongside public spaces appropriated for the festival, transforming places into public artworks. Formal and informal venues are used, like galleries and pubs, often celebrating local design and architecture.

Place is central to the whole experience of the festival. The festival is a platform for representing and making Scottish heritage more broadly. Whilst clearly attracting international visitors and contributors, Scottish acts are explicitly promoted in the Edinburgh Jazz and Blues Festivals. The Tattoo is a partnership with Scottish diaspora, linking clans across the globe. From Hogmanay, the Massed Pipes and Drums to the lone piper against the background of the castle, celebrating what it means to be Scottish in the national capital is a dominant theme of the festival.

Today what happens in Edinburgh could not happen anywhere else. The city’s rich architectural heritage is complemented by a dynamic contemporary building programme which creates an incredible range of festival spaces.²⁶

Edinburgh Festivals
City, Culture and Sustainability

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?
As one of the longest running of the festivals in this collection, it is inevitable that the boundaries between festival and city have receded into memory. Edinburgh Festivals show how festivals sit at the nexus between tangible and intangible heritage, linking key urban assets from architecture to tourism, to community organising and fringe events. Working in partnership with environmental sustainability organisations, Festivals Edinburgh have a joint environmental policy, strategy and sustainable office to minimise their impacts, aiming for reductions of 40% carbon and 12% energy use by 2020 through increases in microgeneration and renewables. Within strategic documents, there is a strong cross-referencing between culture and sustainable development strategies for the city, nesting built and cultural heritage within wider economic, social and environmental agendas.

Contributed by: Beth Perry and Laura Ager

This report covers many of the annual festivals that take place in Edinburgh, which range from 3 days (Hogmanay) to a month (Edinburgh Festival Fringe).

Takes place in: Edinburgh Scotland

²⁶ Contributed by Edinburgh Festivals 2017 - www.EdinburghFestivals.org
The Electric Castle Festival is one of the largest music events of its kind in Romania and takes place annually in Bánffy Castle, Cluj Napoca, Transylvania. Organised by Electric Castle Festival, with Boiler Events, the Transylvania Trust, Romsilva and the County Council, there are a wide range of corporate sponsors. Bánffy Castle, also known as the Versailles of Transylvania, is the largest castle in Transylvania and was placed on the World Monuments Watch List of the 100 most endangered sites in 2000. Whilst there had been a joint Romanian-Hungarian accord to fund the restoration, this was expensive so the Electric Castle Festival was set up to generate funds to restore the site. The festival has brought over 200,000 people to the castle and the restoration is anticipated for completion in 2026.

The audience is both local and international, with a large proportion of staff drawn from local volunteers. The historic nature of the building is juxtaposed with a converse cultural form, electric music. Well known and popular names are showcased, including Sigur Ros, The Prodigy and Bring Me the Horizon, which is mixed with a wider range of cultural activities (sports, films, exhibitions) to trade-off and blend the old and the new.

With the tag-line ‘We are the people’, the festival is also engaging in positive social and environmental projects. In 2017 the Rain or Shine campaign was launched in support of providing solar panels to some of the +100,000 houses in Romania that do not have access to electricity. Electric Castle partners with other organisations to deliver the project, but also pledges money directly from ticket sales. This participatory environmental programme means that each festival electrifies more than 25 family homes. The festival also has a dedicated sustainability programme, run by a sustainability and creative communications company MAINOI, including a zerowaste campaign, an eco-game for behavioural change for festival goers and an eco-ambassador programme.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

The heritage of one specific building is behind this example, as the festival’s organisers have formed a collaboration with architects, heritage trusts and other organisations to restore the castle. Like other festivals of a certain scale (for instance, Edinburgh Festivals, Manchester International Festival), Electric Castle nestles within a wide cultural tourism and economic development perspective. Sites (tangible built heritage) and cultural forms and expressions (intangible heritage) are co-constitutive of each other. This is combined with a strong emphasis on environmental sustainability and the preservation of natural heritage, in view of the negative and high impacts of festivals in terms of energy consumption and waste.

The festival includes some elements of shared curatorial control and invitations to submit ideas for programming, underpinned by grants for development and implementation. Examples include artists to build installations, architects to redesign campsite accommodation, storytellers, musicians and designers of merchandise. The emphasis on conservation and restoration foregrounds cultural heritage as built form. There is no explicit appeal to any local or Romanian identities or culture, with some seeing the festival as having reached international tipping points.28 The festival is seen to have its place amongst an ecology of activities, others of which focus more on the celebration of Romanian musical heritage and identity.

"We are trying to bring modernity in an old place full of history, but without being invasive. We believe that through this contrast between old and new, we manage very well to potentiate the castle, the central point around which our whole concept has been built.

Andi Vance, Electric Castle’s PR manager 27

How long? 4 days
Frequency: Annual
Year established: 2013
Takes place in: Bánffy Castle Cluj Napoca Transylvania Romania

---

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

The heritage of one specific building is behind this example, as the festival’s organisers have formed a collaboration with architects, heritage trusts and other organisations to restore the castle. Like other festivals of a certain scale (for instance, Edinburgh Festivals, Manchester International Festival), Electric Castle nestles within a wide cultural tourism and economic development perspective. Sites (tangible built heritage) and cultural forms and expressions (intangible heritage) are co-constitutive of each other. This is combined with a strong emphasis on environmental sustainability and the preservation of natural heritage, in view of the negative and high impacts of festivals in terms of energy consumption and waste.

The festival includes some elements of shared curatorial control and invitations to submit ideas for programming, underpinned by grants for development and implementation. Examples include artists to build installations, architects to redesign campsite accommodation, storytellers, musicians and designers of merchandise. The emphasis on conservation and restoration foregrounds cultural heritage as built form. There is no explicit appeal to any local or Romanian identities or culture, with some seeing the festival as having reached international tipping points.28 The festival is seen to have its place amongst an ecology of activities, others of which focus more on the celebration of Romanian musical heritage and identity.

"We are trying to bring modernity in an old place full of history, but without being invasive. We believe that through this contrast between old and new, we manage very well to potentiate the castle, the central point around which our whole concept has been built.

Andi Vance, Electric Castle’s PR manager 27

How long? 4 days
Frequency: Annual
Year established: 2013
Takes place in: Bánffy Castle Cluj Napoca Transylvania Romania

---


28 The festival is seen to have its place amongst an ecology of activities, others of which focus more on the celebration of Romanian musical heritage and identity.
Each year, when funding permits, the Fietas Festival in Johannesburg commemorates the forcible removal of ‘coloured’, mixed race and Indian residents to other areas in 1970s. The area was declared white and protests continued into the 1980s.

This is a festival of memory for Fietas, which is the colloquial name for the adjoining suburbs of Pageview and Vrededorp, creating spaces for those who experienced the removals to have voice and reinsert their stories into otherwise cleansed urban spaces. The festival usually takes place on or around Heritage Day on 24 September.

Fietas includes exhibitions, art projects and events. Storytelling is particularly important for people to record their memories, on quilts or cloths, on porches, via performances and poetry readings. Docrats Ruin is a double-storey house which could not be bulldozed following the removals, a fitting backdrop to the festival which seeks to reclaim physical and cultural spaces that have been lost.

A central part of the festival is the street as cultural heritage, as people undertake a symbolic walk across the street that separated the two racially designated suburbs. Photographs mark the state of Fietas prior to removals at a school building that remained standing.

Beyond iconic stories of forced displacement, like District Six and Sophia Town, many are lost from public view and consciousness. At street level, festival is a way of healing, grieving in a city shaped by segregation and acts of exclusion. The presence of the past makes itself known by inscribing itself in tangible and intangible ways. Although the festival is meant to be an exercise in bringing people and communities together, it has not been uncontroversial. Fietas remains a contested space, marked by multiple and conflicting memories and meanings, and the festival has also showed up some of these fault lines.

The ex-residents and those who remember aim to reclaim their heritage, to restore themselves and the vital legacy of a community, through a festival that celebrates the ways and values of a time and place that still resides in memories and hearts and which people yearn to collectively reconnect with and grow from again.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

Festival is a way of reclaiming lost physical and cultural spaces. Fietas raises interesting insights into how intangible memories of urban place can be reclaimed when the physical environment is destroyed.

The repurposing of remnants of destroyed neighbourhoods makes ordinary spaces in the city repositories for memory in a city that is constantly overwriting itself. The presence of the past makes itself known by inscribing itself in tangible and intangible ways.

Although the festival is meant to be an exercise in bringing people and communities together, it has not been uncontroversial. Fietas remains a contested space, marked by multiple and conflicting memories and meanings, and the festival has also showed up some of these fault lines.

The ex-residents and those who remember aim to reclaim their heritage, to restore themselves and the vital legacy of a community, through a festival that celebrates the ways and values of a time and place that still resides in memories and hearts and which people yearn to collectively reconnect with and grow from again.

Feizel Mamdoo, Festival Organiser

How long? 2 to 3 days
Frequency: Infrequent
Year established: 2002
Takes place in: Fietas Johannesburg South Africa

Although the removals happened in the 1970s, they had a lasting impact on the people of Fietas. The festival is a way to revive the spirit of the place as remembered by those who lived there before the removals.

Feizel Mamdoo, Festival Organiser
Gamlestaden Jazz Festival

Jazz Festivals in Urban Spaces

Gamlestaden Jazz Festival, or GMLSTN JAZZ as it is often written, takes place each spring in the city of Gothenburg and features jazz musicians playing live in multiple venues. It labels itself as a “modern” jazz festival and the programme brings together famous international touring musicians alongside the city’s resident jazz artists. It partners with local and regional cultural organisations, but these differ year on year depending on funding.

GMLSTN JAZZ is a recent addition to the Gothenburg jazz scene. It is run by a non-profit organisation run by a small committee responsible for its production which first assembled in 2013. Since then, they have worked each year with a changing line-up of partner organisations and venues to make the festival happen.

The jazz festival tends to be an urban phenomenon, and GMLSTN JAZZ is no exception, its festival events are dispersed throughout the city. The festival’s aim was to put Gothenburg on the jazz map. Artistic director Eric Arellano, himself an improviser and jazz performer, noticed a jazz scene was bubbling away in the city, but that what the city lacked was not jazz musicians or venues but rather organisation.

Initially the committee curated the whole festival programme, but they soon recognised that if the festival was to be authentic, they should work with the city’s existing jazz venues and programmes, where they overlap. However, the festival maintains a symbolic connection with Kvibergs Kaserner, a military heritage site in Gothenburg and one of its most eye-catching venues. This building is where the first edition of the festival was held in 2014.

Gamlestaden, where the festival originated is a suburban area in East Gothenburg, where residents come from various countries around the world. There is a mix of cultures here and another of the ambitions of GMLSTN JAZZ has been to widen the definitions of what jazz is. Much of the repertoire is experimental and modern; the programme has included afro hip hop acts, that would not be considered jazz in some more conservative circles.

GMLSTN JAZZ gives greater visibility and coherence to the jazz scene, bringing jazz as a marginalised form of intangible heritage to a wider audience. Over time the international orientation has been supplemented by an embeddedness in locality, with family friendly activities such as learning jazz history.

The festival reinforces and supports traditional jazz heritage through collaborations with Classic Jazz Festival, but it also creates its own understandings of jazz heritage through the selection of partner venues and acts. In this way a coherent identity to a marginalised cultural form is provided through the use of urban space.

How long? 9 days
Frequency: Annual
Year established: 2014
Takes place in: Gothenburg Sweden

Contributed by: Olle Stenbäck
Infecting the City is an annual festival, led by the Africa Centre with the Institute for Creative Arts and established in 2008. Pushing the boundaries of public space, Infecting the City seeks to facilitate understandings of performance and provides a platform for urban artists to ‘step up to the plate and take the reins as vanguards for creative expression and freedom’. Described as a pioneering public arts festival, Infecting the City has now led a decade of performances and installations. Taking place over 4-days, the festival includes performing, public installation and art and has experienced rapid growth from 10 performances in 2008 to over 60 in most recent editions, with an over 300% increase in submissions to participate between 2012 and 2013.

Editions of the festival have focussed on particular themes. In 2009, for instance, the theme was Home Affairs, underscored by the xenophobic tensions which simmer in southern Africa. Societal issues such as immigration, diversity and integration were surfaced and politicised through cultural expressions. In 2010 focus turned to the role of rites and rituals as tools for transformation and healing. What are the wounds in society and our society that need attention? asked the festival, and can artworks perform as rituals to heal these wounds?

The mission of the festival is specifically to reclaim public space for the public and allow for unusual ways of interacting with the urban environment. It is designed as a fixed route but also to be happened upon, allowing unsuspecting passers-by to become audience members. Evocative performances lead the crowd along the city streets, chanting words and bringing people in from the streets in a citizen-artist interface.

Contributed by: Naomi Roux

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?
The context of Cape Town is a critical backdrop for this festival, marked by exclusions and segregations and where the gentrification and privatisation of public spaces are real issues.

Cape Town artists play a key role in activating spaces as sites for public art. Specifically the focus is on sites in the city centre – a historic colonial core – which are appropriated and reclaimed. These spaces are increasingly diverse, however also remain spaces of exclusion and wealth, often watched over by private security and city council surveillance.

Both the 2011 and 2012 editions of the festival focussed on intangible and tangible heritage, with the former exploring ‘overlooked, discarded and neglected cultural riches’ and the latter focussing on engagement in collectively-owned public spaces.

To this extent Infecting the City is a spatial justice intervention, a call to appreciate art and publicness but also to challenge who the city belongs to and who belongs in its public spaces.

Khanyisile Mbongwa, Co-curator of 2017 festival

Infecting the City is an annual festival, led by the Africa Centre with the Institute for Creative Arts and established in 2008. Pushing the boundaries of public space, Infecting the City seeks to facilitate understandings of performance and provides a platform for urban artists to ‘step up to the plate and take the reins as vanguards for creative expression and freedom’. Described as a pioneering public arts festival, Infecting the City has now led a decade of performances and installations. Taking place over 4-days, the festival includes performing, public installation and art and has experienced rapid growth from 10 performances in 2008 to over 60 in most recent editions, with an over 300% increase in submissions to participate between 2012 and 2013.

Editions of the festival have focussed on particular themes. In 2009, for instance, the theme was Home Affairs, underscored by the xenophobic tensions which simmer in southern Africa. Societal issues such as immigration, diversity and integration were surfaced and politicised through cultural expressions. In 2010 focus turned to the role of rites and rituals as tools for transformation and healing. What are the wounds in society and our society that need attention? asked the festival, and can artworks perform as rituals to heal these wounds?

The mission of the festival is specifically to reclaim public space for the public and allow for unusual ways of interacting with the urban environment. It is designed as a fixed route but also to be happened upon, allowing unsuspecting passers-by to become audience members. Evocative performances lead the crowd along the city streets, chanting words and bringing people in from the streets in a citizen-artist interface.

Contributed by: Naomi Roux

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?
The context of Cape Town is a critical backdrop for this festival, marked by exclusions and segregations and where the gentrification and privatisation of public spaces are real issues.

Cape Town artists play a key role in activating spaces as sites for public art. Specifically the focus is on sites in the city centre – a historic colonial core – which are appropriated and reclaimed. These spaces are increasingly diverse, however also remain spaces of exclusion and wealth, often watched over by private security and city council surveillance.

Both the 2011 and 2012 editions of the festival focussed on intangible and tangible heritage, with the former exploring ‘overlooked, discarded and neglected cultural riches’ and the latter focussing on engagement in collectively-owned public spaces.

To this extent Infecting the City is a spatial justice intervention, a call to appreciate art and publicness but also to challenge who the city belongs to and who belongs in its public spaces.

Khanyisile Mbongwa, Co-curator of 2017 festival
Into the Great Wide Open
Festival as Living Lab

Vlieland is one of the five Wadden islands in the Netherlands, hosting bird breeding grounds, beaches, gales and sand dunes alternated with deciduous and evergreen forests. It is the location for an annual festival, Into the Great Wide Open, which is a not-for-profit foundation and is supported by the municipality of Vlieland and Lab Vlieland, a technology and innovation lab.

The festival was set up to challenge the marketisation of the sector and support a small-scale, quality and simple engagement between cultural and natural heritage. The aim was to share experiences and connections with nature and, more specifically, to be a leader in the field of responsible, sustainable production.

Sites across the whole of the island are used, with a diverse, cross-disciplinary and cross-generational appeal. Eclecticism defines the cultural offer which spreads across beaches and dunes. Attendees are encouraged to hire bikes to get around and many activities are powered by solar and wind, through a strong partnership with Lab Vlieland.

Lab Vlieland grew out of the festival and sees itself as a testing ground for a new world through the development of new technologies in a live setting. Examples include trialling new energy technologies at independent sites, such as the Strandtuin in 2015. Here, new approaches to waste meant a tea garden modelled on circulating material flows, no plastic bottles and waste, tap water and permanent water points.

From this has sprung further innovations, such as collaboration between 8 festivals in the Northern Netherlands to facilitate and scale up the ability of start-ups to trial technologies and new research projects, for instance, into sustainable transport like electric power vehicles.

It sounds like a cliché, but the setting and the atmosphere are of crucial importance to the memories of the concerts you’ve already been to.40

Case Mayfield was doing a ‘3Voor12 session’ which was an acoustic session somewhere on the Island. He played somewhere next to the cranberry fields and it was so small and intimate. He sounded amazing”.

Festival reviewer41

How long? 4 days
Frequency: Annual
Year established: 2009
Takes place in: Vlieland, Netherlands

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?
The theme of openness runs throughout this festival, openness to cultural experiences and to natural heritage. The island becomes the very stage on which the festival takes place, transforming from small and remarkable to exceptional and exciting. Whilst the festival is not explicitly a celebration of island or Dutch cultural forms of expression, the distinctiveness of this example lies in its setting and focus on preservation of natural and environmental heritage.

We have a great love for Vlieland. The first thing we did was collect memories of our holidays on the island and ask ourselves why this island means so much to us. The calmness, the nature, the simplicity. As soon you enter the boat, you step into a different world.

Ashley Govers, Festival Artists, From Form

Contributed by:
Chiara Badiali

@greatwideopen
greatwideopen

Case Mayfield was doing a ‘3Voor12 session’ which was an acoustic session somewhere on the Island. He played somewhere next to the cranberry fields and it was so small and intimate. He sounded amazing”. Festival reviewer41

It sounds like a cliché, but the setting and the atmosphere are of crucial importance to the memories of the concerts you’ve already been to.40

Case Mayfield was doing a ‘3Voor12 session’ which was an acoustic session somewhere on the Island. He played somewhere next to the cranberry fields and it was so small and intimate. He sounded amazing”. Festival reviewer41

It sounds like a cliché, but the setting and the atmosphere are of crucial importance to the memories of the concerts you’ve already been to.40
The Kaapse Klopse Karnivaal dates back to the 17th century and has its origins in slave celebrations of the new year prior to emancipation in 1837 and 1838. It marks the day known as “tweede Nuwe Jaar” [second New Year]. This was the day that Dutch settlers in the Cape allowed slaves to mark the new year. The New Year carnival as we know it today has a long history which dates back to the early years of colonization. After 1838, former slaves began to form dance and music troupes and develop different musical styles; during which period the carnival began to approach its current form. Ghoema and folk music flourished under the influence of minstrel culture, but under apartheid the route of the carnival was banned under the Illegals GATHERINGS Act, so minstrel troupes took to different venues in the city instead. In 1989 the Karnivaal returned to its original route. Although this festival has become part of Cape Town popular culture, conflicts and disturbances were cited as concerns. A strong association with place is indicated in the spaces and places used, as with other South African examples in the anthology. The traditional carnival route from Green Point to District Six transversed city spaces associated with slavery and maritime history. These were sites where African and coloured people were forcibly removed to Cape Flats outside the city whilst inner city suburbs were declared whites-only in the 1950s and 60s. Today the Carnival continues to centralize the narrative of slavery with one key difference: its primary motif... is the American blackface minstrel.46 The carnival was rerouted in 2016 in response to complaints from expensive city centre hotels about noise disturbance. It remains a festival for urban residents, particularly families and coloured residents, rather than oriented at tourists. The social, cultural and economic damage of apartheid geographies remain strongly etched into city spaces and reinforced by gentrification and soaring property prices. As the city centre continues to be a site of exclusion, the carnival route serves to reinscribe histories of displacement, reclaiming these streets for a day as historic spaces that belong to everyone. Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage? The carnival is an old tradition and not a curated festival as such; there is no programme, beyond mainly singing of traditional songs and music. Yet the performance and taking over of the streets of Central Cape Town serves as a means of reinforcing and valorising cultural history through recognising slavery and its history. Many songs have their origins in slavery and traditional Ghoema music. The festival reuses this heritage and makes it visible in contemporary city, which runs counter to official heritage events which avoid these challenging issues for local actors and for many families with ancestral links with slavery. It enables a largely working-class audience and performers based in Cape Flats to return to an area they were historically banned and excluded from. The Kaapse Klopse Karnivaal activates streets as sites of simultaneously uncomfortable and celebratory heritage, reinscribing a culture in urban space linked to slavery, music, song and minstrel histories.

Contributed by: Naomi Roux

Kaapse Klopse
Carnival and Conflict
in Cape Town

During the festival thousands of brightly-clothed people march through the streets of Cape Town, organized into Klopse [troupes], entertaining the crowd through singing, dancing and playing a number of musical instruments.43

The Kaapse Klopse Karnivaal is the main event of the Tweede Nuwe Jaar (second New Year) celebration in Cape Town. It is a tradition that dates back to the 17th century and has its origins in slave celebrations of the new year prior to emancipation in 1837 and 1838. The carnival takes place in Cape Town, South Africa, and is known for its lively atmosphere and the participation of minstrel troupes, who perform traditional songs and music. The carnival route, which has been rerouted in recent years, is an important site of cultural heritage for the African and coloured communities of Cape Town.

The carnival is an old tradition and not a curated festival as such; there is no programme, beyond mainly singing of traditional songs and music. Yet the performance and taking over of the streets of Central Cape Town serves as a means of reinforcing and valorising cultural history through recognising slavery and its history. Many songs have their origins in slavery and traditional Ghoema music. The festival reuses this heritage and makes it visible in contemporary city, which runs counter to official heritage events which avoid these challenging issues for local actors and for many families with ancestral links with slavery.

It enables a largely working-class audience and performers based in Cape Flats to return to an area they were historically banned and excluded from. The Kaapse Klopse Karnivaal activates streets as sites of simultaneously uncomfortable and celebratory heritage, reinscribing a culture in urban space linked to slavery, music, song and minstrel histories.
Manchester Histories Festival

Multiplicity and Plurality in Narratives of the City

It is important to bring people together at Manchester Histories Festival to remember the past, but to also keep it relevant to the histories of today. Sharing our histories can unlock our collective strengths for mutual benefit. Revealing hidden histories can make people think differently, as they may have learned new insights about the past, they can then reflect on the heritage of this to think about the ‘here and now’ and the future to come.

Karen Shannon, Director Manchester Histories Festival

Manchester Histories aims to work with people across Greater Manchester to transform lives by recreating, sharing and celebrating histories and heritage. It is a small charity, funded by the University of Manchester, Manchester Metropolitan University, Manchester City Council and the Heritage Lottery Fund.

The festival is the visible peak of a wider range of perennial events. It is a 10-day programme of talks, workshops, exhibitions, film screenings, games and more. Content is drawn from a crowdsourcing model in which cultural organisers use the festival to promote histories based around common themes.

These partnerships involve a wide range of community groups, museums, galleries, academics, archives, local and family history societies, cultural organisations and commercial bodies and volunteers.

The focus is on tangible and intangible histories of the city, some known and visible and some not. An emphasis on plural histories and multiplicity has led to efforts to reveal hidden histories, which are not ‘as well recorded as the high-profile histories of the region’.

The festival makes use of formal, informal and everyday sites, in museums, galleries, streets, communities, universities, theatres and neighbourhood settings. In 2016 over 70% of the events were free, with family, participatory and walking/tour events the most frequently programmed. An independent evaluation concluded that the festival led to increased wellbeing, stronger culture and identity, improved place and community and learning.

Recently, Manchester Histories and People’s History Museum have been successful in securing funding for the Peterloo 2019 project. On 16th August 1819 in St Peter’s Fields, Manchester government troops – including local yeomanry, charged a crowd of around 60,000 people who’d gathered to demand the reform of parliamentary representation resulting in the deaths of an estimated 18 people and the injury of over 650 others. 2019 marks the 200th anniversary of what became known as the Peterloo Massacre, an event widely acknowledged as a significant moment in the history of public protest and which has become synonymous with the struggle for democracy and the fight against political repression. Manchester Histories will be working to commemorate this most important episode in the history of Greater Manchester.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

In a place like Greater Manchester, self-proclaimed birthplace of the industrial revolution, it is unsurprising that industrial heritage is a dominant underpinning theme for the festival. In this respect it is important that venues provide a way of connecting physical space to the stories being told, reinforcing sense of place and identity.

Hidden and intangible histories, focussed on memories and narratives of change, are equally strong; such as migration, radicalism, women, science and family history. Importantly the festival values itself promotes its social over economic values, with an independent evaluation citing the importance of cohesion, pride, curiosity, connectedness and overcoming isolation.

It is important to bring people together at Manchester Histories Festival to remember the past, but to also keep it relevant to the histories of today. Sharing our histories can unlock our collective strengths for mutual benefit. Revealing hidden histories can make people think differently, as they may have learned new insights about the past, they can then reflect on the heritage of this to think about the ‘here and now’ and the future to come.

Karen Shannon, Director Manchester Histories Festival

Contributed by:
Karen Shannon
Manchester International Festival
Global Aspirations, Local Embeddedness

Manchester International Festival (MIF) is the world’s first festival of original, new work and special events and takes place biennially in Manchester, UK. The Festival launched in 2007 as an artist-led, commissioning festival presenting new works from across the spectrum of performing arts, visual arts and popular culture.

The title signifies the duality of an international perspective with an embeddedness in place. This built on a wave of entrepreneurial urban initiatives and bids to host events such as the Olympic Games. Its governance is similar to other large urban festivals, with a Director and Board and a wide range of stakeholders and funders. There is a clear central vision and mission, but this sits alongside artist-led commissions and community work.

MIF takes place over 18 days and uses different spaces and venues around the city, from the traditional to the non-traditional: car parks, railways arches, industrial mills, people’s houses, streets, public sequences and museums, galleries, theatre etc. Since the early days there has been a creative learning and engagement programme, which has led to a range of different commissions involving local people and communities. Ticket prices are reduced for local people living in the Greater Manchester area.

The 2015 edition of the Festival included a collaboration with a vertical farm in an old industrial mill, the Biospheric Project. This represented a common blurring of lines between culture and sustainability and different forms of heritage. It also mirrored the Festival’s own commitment to reducing their own environmental footprint through working with the Manchester Arts and Sustainability Team and Julie’s Bicycle to meet and exceed best practice guidelines throughout the sector.

In the 2017 edition a commission from parade guru Jeremy Deller asked “What is the people but the city?” in a widely acclaimed opening event in the city centre. A new and temporary urban structure was created – a walkway above Piccadilly Gardens through which an eclectic mix of residents paraded through the city. Music was provided by established names and a mix of local musicians. Local cultural diversity was also celebrated and co-curated through Festival in My House, an invitation to residents and community organisations to develop their own micro-international festivals in settings around the city.

The Festival is not shy to criticism or controversy, for instance, the Biospheric Project raised questions about the implications and legacies of short-term commitments to projects during an 18-day festival. Recently a nod to the city’s heritage turned sour in the opening of the Ceremony commission, when private security at the unveiling of a decommissioned statue of Engels clashed with trade unions in what was otherwise deemed to be a respectful homage to Greater Manchester’s political and industrial heritage.

Contributed by:
Beth Perry

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

From its roots within an entrepreneurial discourse, MIF continues to evoke both high praise and criticism. In meeting its aim of showcasing international ‘firsts’, it is widely acknowledged as a success whilst the process of embedding locally has been longer in the making. Successive editions of the festival have strengthened this, with notable efforts in the sector in relation to the environmental impact and tapping into a visceral sense of civic pride in 2017, in the wake of the Manchester Arena bombing. With a wide audience spanning cultures and generations, MIF is inscribed in the physical and cultural fabric of Greater Manchester, speaking to industrial, place-based, classic and intangible heritages with innovative verve and style.
Musica Sulla Boche is an international jazz festival which takes place annually on the Bocche di Bonifacio, the strait between Sardinia and Corsica. Bonifacio Strait is a designated nature research and international marine park recognised by both Italy and France. It is part of the Pelagos Sanctuary for Mediterranean Marine Mammals and has applied to be listed as a World Heritage site.

The festival’s guiding principles concern the relationship between music, landscape and innovative artistic choice. With a range of key partner organisations, including tourist, regional and local authorities and private non-profit organisations, the festival organises performances against the backdrop of natural landscapes, timing these to coincide with specific natural moments such as sunrise and sunset.

Experimental and improvised music is performed in squares, beaches, churches, lighthouses, drawn internationally but also from within Sardinia. Sardinian influences also shape culinary offers across the marine park.

Special events and collaborations feature in different editions of the festival, for instance, a summer school organised with the University of Sassari on sounds, landscapes and architectures.

Musica Sulla Boche suggests the inseparability of natural and cultural heritage. Like other festivals, it is driven by an awareness of the distinctiveness of its location and need to minimise its impact and promote wider environmental conservation values. This finds its expression in collaborations through networks, such as the European Jazz Network’s ‘Take the Green Train’, which support the mainstreaming of environmental practices throughout the festival. Examples include recycling, waste, transport, power, also specific initiatives, such as carbon offset. Local reforestation projects, for instance with the Forestry Corps of Sardinia, are supported as well as tree planting internationally in Costa Rica.

Like other festivals seeking to marry protection of natural with promotion of cultural heritage, tensions remain; for instance, questions remain over the impact of international travel to remote locations in relation to any local environmental benefits, or the damage of increasing visitor numbers to the very sites the festival is designed to protect.

All festivals have at least one thing in common in that they are ephemeral. Though some better established festivals may leave a permanent mark on the landscape in the form of a festival theatre or concert hall or opera house, most leave only their name and the memories held by the participants and audiences, in other words, the place identity and the valuation of place endowed by the festival.53

Neither music nor memory exist in an ontological vacuum. They are enacted and practised in material environments.54

---

Contributed by: Chiara Badiali

©MsBJazzFestival
musicasullebocche

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

How long? 4 to 6 days  
Frequency: Annual  
Year established: 2001  
Takes place in: Santa Teresa Gallura Sardinia Italy

How long? 4 to 6 days  
Frequency: Annual  
Year established: 2001  
Takes place in: Santa Teresa Gallura Sardinia Italy

How long? 4 to 6 days  
Frequency: Annual  
Year established: 2001  
Takes place in: Santa Teresa Gallura Sardinia Italy

How long? 4 to 6 days  
Frequency: Annual  
Year established: 2001  
Takes place in: Santa Teresa Gallura Sardinia Italy

How long? 4 to 6 days  
Frequency: Annual  
Year established: 2001  
Takes place in: Santa Teresa Gallura Sardinia Italy

---
Ordsall is an area of Salford in Greater Manchester which represents all the contradictions of the cultural economy. With the iconic Media City at one end and new private sector developments at the other, the cultural assets of working class communities are often overlooked and undervalued.

Nestled in the everyday spaces of Ordsall is Ordsall Park, adjacent to a major arterial route that separates low-income residential areas of Ordsall from the sanitised spaces of Media City.

Here, each year where funding permits, Ordsall Festival takes place. It replaced an annual celebration called Salford Fair. Activities typically include bouncy castles, craft activities, local entertainment such as live music, children’s dancing, knitting, crafting and card making. The first edition of the Ordsall Festival was called ‘Deca-Dance’ and it celebrated dances of every decade in the 20th century.

The struggle for funding is a perennial one for the Friends of the Park association which seeks to put the festival on. In 2014 and 2015, small amounts of funding from a local University research project supplemented activity on offer. A group of community researchers, working with Ordsall Community Arts (OCA), reflected the area’s pride in the newly opened Ordsall Allotments, with the production and showcasing of a large wire marrow, the Fat Marrow Band and vegetable-inspired crafting and competitions at the festival. At the same festival, the Police provided a climbing wall and had a strong presence; local tenant management organisation Salix Homes gave out free plants whilst promoting participation in a ballot for the Council to transfer housing stock to them; the local health practice gave out toothbrushes and health checks.

The following year an initiative called Ideas4Ordsall supported a local photographer, Beckie Hough, to set up a booth to celebrate local people and support her growing business; food was provided by the Ordsall Community Café with supplies from the allotments. In the most recent edition of the festival in 2017 activities reflected a wide range of cultural influences, such as giant snakes and ladders and belly dancing, as well as local heritage, for instance, through a celebration of the Tudor history of Ordsall Hall.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

Local cultural organisations, such as Ordsall Community Arts, have a strong desire to celebrate, promote and inspire local cultural activities. Without their interventions the festival would be reliant on the standard family attractions of bouncy castles and hotdog stands, with state and local institutions both supporting but also policing community behaviours.

As funding has diminished, local people have been more and more involved in fundraising and producing the festival. The role of cultural organisations such as OCA is changing - it’s more like production mentor where local people have greater say over decisions about the festival.

Gail Skelly, Ordsall Community Arts Director

How long? One day
Frequency: Annual
Year established: 2007
Takes place in: Ordsall Greater Manchester

As funding has diminished, local people have been more and more involved in fundraising and producing the festival. The role of cultural organisations such as OCA is changing - it’s more like production mentor where local people have greater say over decisions about the festival. Gail Skelly, Ordsall Community Arts Director

Ordsall Festival
Between State and Community Lies Festival
Pohoda Festival
Ideas, Politics and Cultural Expression

Each year since 1997 Trencín, Slovakia is the site of the Pohoda Festival. Started by two artists, Michal Kaščák and Mario Michna, the festival was a response to the lack of music festivals in the country, especially those featuring Czech and Slovak Bands. It is supported by a partnership of a wide range of commercial, media, transport and local authority partners.

From its initial home in a stadium, to an expo centre, the festival moved to a new location in 2004 on a former military airport, using the runways as key stages and locations in performances. Some curatorial control is shared, where audience feedback and ideas submitted shapes the content of the programme.

The festival is distinctive for its past more than its present iterations. It was founded in the context of an alternative music scene in the 1980s which was set up in conflict with the previous regime. The history of environmental activism, political radicalism and overthrow of communist regime were closely bound.

The programme continues to reflect environmental themes and seeks to manage itself in a sustainable way. The festival organisers are proud of the way the audience and attendees care about the site and embody those values; the festival is renowned for its cleanliness. Each year only around 20 tents are left behind from an audience of 30,000.

As the site is a former airfield, all infrastructure and services have to be transported in, but wells have been dug to avoid plastic bottles. Bicycles are used whenever possible, even artists who perform there are encouraged to use bicycles to travel between stages, and special festival trains and extra commuter buses are provided to connect the festival site with local towns and villages.

---

Contributed by:
Chiara Badiali

We always used to be jealous that in the Czech Republic they had a lot of festivals, while in Slovakia there were very few.**
Michal Kaščák, Festival founder

This political heritage of Slovakia shapes and forms the festival. After the split between the Czech Republic and Slovakia, the festival positions Slovakia’s growing and flourishing music with a focus on free exchange of cultural expressions and ideas.

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?
Pohoda is a fascinating example of how intangible cultural heritage can build value systems to tie together arts, culture creativity free express, ecological sustainability and care for the environment, building on political history to create a contemporary framework of ideas and experiences.

In 1978 Vaclav Havel wrote that ‘everyone understands that an attack on the Czech musical underground was an attack on the most elementary and important thing, something that bound everyone together…the freedom to play rock music was understood as a human freedom and thus as essentially the same as the freedom to engage in philosophical and political reflection’.**

He became the first president of Czechoslovakia, after the revolution.

---

How long? 3 days
Frequency: Annual
Year established: 1997
Takes place in: Trenčín, Slovakia

The change in 1989 was something of a miracle for us. A free music scene started to develop and many festivals were founded, mainly in the Czech part of the country.***
Michal Kaščák, Festival founder

---

**Amnesty, 90, 11098. 'Voice against slavery'. Pohoda guests.' The Slovak Spectator


Still Walking
In Search of Hidden Urban Heritage

Large industrial cities are often represented as architecturally unrewarding, a perception reinforced by officially sanctioned walks of the city. Motivated to challenge these stereotypes, Ben Waddington initiated a walking festival in Birmingham in 2012, working in a loose collaborative relationship with Flatpack Festival and with funding from the Arts Council.

Still Walking is a festival of guided tours that focus on the hidden, overlooked or secret parts of the city and challenge how the city is experienced. The festival has a strong element of co-production, as organisers work with local residents who have an interest in a space or place to develop a walk around it. This turns spectator into participant and participant into tour guide.

Examples have included a cinematic run through city woodland at twilight; a group walk around Birmingham international airport; a flash mob loitering without intent; and a tree identification walk. Very little takes place indoors, rather in streets, between buildings, railway stations and airports, following lost riverways, wooded walks and canals.

Consequently, there is a very low environmental impact, with some events using hardly any resources at all, or even focussed on natural elements in the city, such as lichens, mosses or trees. As it has evolved through its many editions, the festival programme has become a deep and philosophical engagement with place.

It seems the guided tour needn’t be a threading together of civic bombast, historic dates and economic data. So much of our city seems to sit there waiting to be involved and I think it’s all worth looking at and talking about.

Ben Waddington, Festival Director

Contributed by: Laura Ager

How long? 3 to 15 days
Frequency: More than once a year
Year established: 2012
Takes place in: Birmingham UK

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

In Still Walking the tangible and intangible combine in an opening up of values for and of urban heritage. In working with residents as tour guides, ownership and expertise is challenged and roles between curator, artist and participant are blurred. Local knowledge matters, as do overlooked and ignored urban spaces, while guides and walkers alike feel a greater sense of belonging and pride for their city.

Participants might sign up to walks but also might happen across them. In contrast to traditional heritage walks, this festival questions whose heritage matters in the context of increasing urbanisation. Still Walking draws attention to the ordinary and unnoticed, encouraging spatial curiosity and observation instead of delivering learned facts.

It seems the guided tour needn’t be a threading together of civic bombast, historic dates and economic data. So much of our city seems to sit there waiting to be involved and I think it’s all worth looking at and talking about.

Ben Waddington, Festival Director

One of the founding tenets of Still Walking is that everyone has a walk or a tour within them.

Ben Waddington, Festival Director

Valuing Tangible and Intangible Cultural Heritage?

In Still Walking the tangible and intangible combine in an opening up of values for and of urban heritage. In working with residents as tour guides, ownership and expertise is challenged and roles between curator, artist and participant are blurred. Local knowledge matters, as do overlooked and ignored urban spaces, while guides and walkers alike feel a greater sense of belonging and pride for their city.

Participants might sign up to walks but also might happen across them. In contrast to traditional heritage walks, this festival questions whose heritage matters in the context of increasing urbanisation. Still Walking draws attention to the ordinary and unnoticed, encouraging spatial curiosity and observation instead of delivering learned facts.

Ben Waddington, Festival Director

One of the founding tenets of Still Walking is that everyone has a walk or a tour within them.

Ben Waddington, Festival Director
Summer Jazz Bicycle Tour

Landscape as Heritage, Heritage as Jazz

The Zomer Jazz Fiets Tour (ZJFT) was set up in 2000 and takes place in the Reitdiep area, a rural area north west of the city of Groningen, Netherlands. It is organised by the Zomer Jazz Fiets Foundation whose overall aim is the promotion of recreational and cultural activities.

The landscape, described as ‘real Dutch cultural heritage,’ is home to many medieval churches and old barns which had been falling into disrepair. The idea behind the festival was to take advantage of these natural heritage assets, to create alternative settings to experience jazz.

The festival showcases the landscape, churches and barns, as well as promotes more marginalised forms of music. Festival guests cycle from one church or barn to the next, across 29 locations, hosting over 30 concerts. The audience is largely Dutch, but increasingly reaching out to more international audiences. ‘Jazz on a bike’ is the unique offer of this festival.

The Festival’s music is programmed by Marcel Roelofs. A mix of international and local musicians play improvised, jazz and world music. People cycle off on different routes and then reconvene in a single festival tent in Garnwerd. There is a strong codetermination between the content and the site. Barns and medieval churches have different acoustics, enabling audience members to engage with and appreciate music in distinctive ways dependent on the setting. In this way, programming is inseparable from the concept of the festival itself.

Everyone was going along the same route and could enjoy all the concerts during the same day, everyone had the same kind of musical experience, which was wonderful. It turned out to be such a good way to listen to music! If you are physically active between these concerts, that clears your mind! And these churches are so wonderful fully intimate! Even if you hate the music, and you are maybe tired because of all the wind and the rain during your bike trip, you become open for anything!

Marcel Roefols, Interview with Festival Programmer

Contributed by: Marlieke Wilders and Loes Rusch
An Agenda for Research and Practice

These assembled examples suggest that festivals have become ubiquitous with the expression of diversity and the revived recognition of intangible cultural practices across the world. This anthology has provided a series of examples that illustrate the myriad forms in which festivals manifest – exploring, celebrating, commemorating a wide range of tangible and intangible entanglements, from eco-tourism in Kenya to electronic music in Estonia. The festivals here also reveal complex socio-spatial and cultural politics. Reflecting across the festivals in the anthology, we explore the implications of international frameworks, and what this means for striving for more inclusive and sustainable cities and communities.

International frameworks

Global agendas around sustainable development have increasingly recognised the importance of place – evident in international frameworks such as the Sustainable Development Goals, New Urban Agenda, Agenda 21 and Agenda 2063. In particular, the urban scale has become vital for economic growth, social development, and ecological sustainability, but cultural heritage has been systematically marginalised from many urban discussions. Despite global assertions that cultural heritage matters, how cultural heritage is activated in different contexts varies. A wide range of assumptions temper how policies are interpreted and actioned on the ground.

In contexts with limited funding dedicated to cultural activities, those with resources can leverage agendas that may not be in the greater interest of building more inclusive and just cities. For example, in many African contexts, despite the best intentions of UNESCO Conventions, frameworks are used to protect and preserve tangible heritage in the form of specific groups iconography in old (monuments) and new (public sculpture) forums, and through using culture as a way to soften the blow of development. Frequently the impacts of festivals are expressed as economic and instrumental, using language such as ‘experience economy’.

The opportunities and possibilities of cultural heritage have as yet been under explored. The international frameworks introduced in this anthology may have landed in problematic ways, but a global commitment to the importance of integrating culture into the development agenda also offers a unique moment to re-think through some of the core assumptions about the role of culture in urban life. This anthology has started to address this through using festivals as a lens to unpack the productive relationship between tangible-intangible entanglements that the integrative site of festivals can enable.

Cultural heritage, tangible and intangible, testifies to human creativity and forms the bedrock underlying the identity of peoples. Cultural life contains both the wealth of being able to appreciate and preserve traditions of all peoples and an opportunity to enable the creation and innovation of endogenous cultural forms (Agenda 21, 2008: 8).

Whose heritage matters?

It is unsurprising that cultural economics follows a similar pattern to the formal economy, but this begs the question: whose culture, whose heritage matters? Inequality is rife in all cities, everywhere. The role of culture in urban development has been critiqued for displacing poorer urban residents through processes of gentrification, through foregrounding specific groups iconography in old (monuments) and new (public sculpture) forums, and through using culture as a way to soften the blow of development. Frequently the impacts of festivals are expressed as economic and instrumental, using language such as ‘experience economy’.

The opportunities and possibilities of cultural heritage have as yet been under explored. The international frameworks introduced in this anthology may have landed in problematic ways, but a global commitment to the importance of integrating culture into the development agenda also offers a unique moment to re-think through some of the core assumptions about the role of culture in urban life. This anthology has started to address this through using festivals as a lens to unpack the productive relationship between tangible-intangible entanglements that the integrative site of festivals can enable.

Tangible – intangible entanglements

There are familiar aspirations across different contexts: Kaapse Klopse (Cape Town), Manchester Histories Festival (Manchester), Africa Week (Johannesburg), Dunga Fish Festival (Kisumu) and Still Walking (Birmingham) seek visibility for under-recognised cultural practices. Bristol Radical Film Festival (Bristol), Pehoda Festival (Trelissick), and Africa Week (Johannesburg) have an explicit activist and advocacy focus – overtly challenging the status quo. Some festivals share the desire to build social cohesion through a common celebration of particular music genres, such as Glastonbury Jazz Festival (Gothenburg), Curacao North Sea Jazz Festival (Curacao), Summer Jazz Bicycle Tour (Groningen) and Musica Sulle Boche (Santa Teresa Gallura). Others are more explicitly focused on providing economic opportunities and building culture-based livelihoods, such as Dunga Fish Festival (Kisumu), Edinburgh Festivals (Edinburgh) and Africa Week (Johannesburg).

Whereas some heritage approaches seek to fix particular cultures and histories, festivals offer an opportunity to explore the relationship between histories, heritage and memory, such as Kaapse Klopse and Infecting the City (Cape Town), Manchester Histories Festival (Manchester), Fiestas Festival 9(Johannesburg) and Orsells Festival (Greater Manchester). And many festivals are increasingly exploring socio-ecological relationships, such as Dunga Fish Night and Got Ramogi Festival (Kisumu), Electric Castle (Transylvania) and Into the Great Wide Open (Vlieland).

Common across the festivals examined in this anthology is a deep consideration of place, where context and content are in constant conversation. Places are not just backdrops – but constitutive in themselves. The spaces of the city are vital to the performances in Infecting the City (Cape Town) – they are not mere vessels for human interaction, but demonstrate agency within the tangible-intangible relations. The site of the festival provides important integrative spaces that are not only geared towards more cohesive human interaction, but foster more engaged relationships between the human and material, where the significance and power of place can be explored through temporary, transient and transitional meeting points. Linking a cultural event with natural and/or built heritage can build people’s sense of belonging and pride, especially if focused at a local or regional audience. This in turn can have positive impacts on citizens’ approaches to stewardship of their environment over the longer term. Although tensions and trade-offs may abound, intimate encounters between people and places have implications for individual, collective and place identities. A festival animates the cultural scene of the local area, which naturally leads to claims being made about the distinctiveness of the place in which it occurs. Festivals have become a core part of tourism and development strategies; arts festivals were a mainstay of cultural strategies for post-industrial urban renewal and frequently appear in cultural policy. Festivalisation processes have become inseparable concepts, particularly within event tourism in which festivals are treated as staged consumer spectacles, their primary goal to foster a desired image of the destination to outsiders.

Festivalisation processes are inherently problematic; cultural festivals are not resistant to the forces of commercialisation and commodification, so they can become divorced from their origins and meanings. For instance, when carnivals are carbon copied and exported into unfamiliar contexts, often working to erase more subversive, critical or counterculture practices. But the festivals chosen for this anthology have largely grown from a desire to be contextually relevant and collectively driven, even if confrontational at times. If cultural diversity is quintessential of the urban condition, then festivals can also offer spaces for cultural encounter as sites of transformation where people and places can become changed through the festival experience.
Conclusion

...everywhere, artists working right now may be onto more far reaching ways of communicating what contemporary city life and cities are about. The city is always suspended and cities are about. The what contemporary city life ways of communicating onto more far reaching working right now may be...everywhere, artists...elsewheres', connected as a case of 'heres' and city is always suspended and cities are about. The

Secondly, the approach to heritage is important. The more plural, participatory and collective a process, the greater the potential for unpacking the power of people in place in the festival context. Essential to realising more just cities is recognising whose voices and practices are being foregrounded and whose are being silenced or erased. In order to rebalance problematic power relations in the quest for just cities, festivals as critical creative practice should be aiming to trouble, tease or tamper with, rather than perpetuate the status quo.

Thirdly, it is important to think carefully about context and spatial impact. The increased presence of people brought by events needs to be carefully managed to minimise any direct detrimental impact on the local natural (and built) heritage from waste, increased footfall, and noise disturbances to local wildlife. Organisers should constantly evaluate and re-evaluate different sustainable development outcomes, especially as they pertain to the natural environment and climate change. There is an ever-present risk that the environmental dimension of sustainable development is given less priority than social and financial dimensions.

Finally, access to resources is always a challenge for cultural activities, and support for festivals that are not mainstream may struggle disproportionately. It is therefore vital to think about alternative coalitions and partnerships. Cultural events can unlock resources from large numbers of people towards environmentally sustainable development - whether that is projects on reforestation and landscape restoration, awareness raising campaigns on specific environmental issues, channeling financial gains from events into environmental causes, or using events as spaces for innovation and experimentation with new technologies for a low carbon future.

Leveraging culture from marginality to the mainstream involves deeper engagement with, and interrogation of, the intersection of cultural heritage and urban development. Global assumptions that underpin academia, activism and policy alike, can only be challenged through an empirical project of exploring how global aspirations land in everyday life. There is a dearth of research, particularly in the global South, on the impact of festivals and other cultural activities, despite broad claims about their relevance. This anthology has provided an overview and starting point, identifying some critique and opportunity through the lenses of festivals, but a more comprehensive South-North-South engagement is essential to build new urban narratives to underpin sustainable and just cities.

Reinforcing the notion of culture as the fourth pillar of sustainability requires a careful interrogation of what this means transversally across all pillars. In a global climate where cultural funding and resources are limited, coalitions are vital, and would need to be responsive to different contexts. The festivals here have shown us how some of these coalises collide, come into consensus and conflict, yet provide important integrative spaces to address challenges that hinder the aspirations of other pillars.

In order to do this, institutional and policy coalitions are crucial. This is widely recognised, but has yet to be implemented with broad success. As cities in the global South urbanise at rapid rates and cities in the North face their own challenges, it is timely to think and experiment with new ways of thinking and acting in the cultural heritage and urban development sphere.
Festivals provide a window onto practices which integrate tangible and intangible heritage in the context of wider sustainable development challenges.

This report presents an anthology of festivals, collated by researchers and practitioners, which reveals the possibilities, promise and pitfalls of planning for culture and sustainable development.