
By Brenda Bartelink, University of Groningen, Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies, The Netherlands

While still a novel field of research, studies on African American women’s lives have mainly been conducted through the lens of women’s resistance and religiously inspired public activism. Casselberry is however interested in the labor invested by these women in forming their personal rather than their public lives in the context of female-majority male led churches. The book focusses on the religious worlds of 21st century African American in the urban setting of the New York-based Pentecostal denomination Church of Our Lord Jesus Christ of the Apostolic faith, Inc. or COOLJC. Centralizing on how ‘holy Black female personhood’ is produced in religious communities, the author explores the multiple layers of how women shape ‘holy lives’ while navigating patriarchal power structures in male-headed religious communities. Instead of discussing these women’s lives in terms of agency and submission, Casselberry offers a detailed analytical perspective of how women navigate and (re-) produce particular gender paradoxes.

The book sheds light on the paradoxical construction of gender that is characteristic for the broader Pentecostal movement. In Pentecostal churches, women can acquire positions of leadership and authority that they were historically denied in most of the Christian churches. Yet, these more equal arrangements within Pentecostal settings also come with a strong emphasis on women’s authority over family and domestic matters. In COOLJC this means that women are the main spiritual and organizational forces in the church-taking leading roles in evangelizing, missioning, mentoring women and youth, caring and healing practices, altar work, preparing their sons for leaderships roles-while being excluded from the decision-making bodies in the church. Women are referred to as mothers, which symbolizes their gendered authority. Casselberry’s sophisticated analysis demonstrates the importance of ethnographic studies for understanding how these paradoxes are shaped and lived within a particular context. Casselberry does not want to assume how religion and gender are entangled, but empirically demonstrates how ‘gender politics of COOLJC
Casselberry suggests that the concept of emotional labor helps to explain how women in COOLJC move between supporting and resisting patriarchal systems in the work they do in the church, at home and in their careers. Emotional labor – the emotion work that is required to manage social roles and relations - is required for women who are actively promoting male leadership while ‘leading from the background’ (pp. 110). Their background leadership is an active labor to assure a ‘politics of incomplete male domination’ (pp. 171). Women therefore see themselves as having a bigger role in these forms of emotional management; they manage these emotions while neutralizing them. At the same time, they may choose for being ‘acceptably disobedient’ when their co-workers or their spouses act against Christian values. Casselberry’s argument is relevant and interesting for two reasons. First of all, she applies the concept of emotional labor to women’s work in the religious and secular contexts in which they operate, hence suggesting that the religious and secular divide is not all that relevant to understand women’s work. Secondly, Casselberry’s analysis of the religious context of COOLJC challenges the reader to reconsider agency and submission as the primary lens for analyzing patriarchal religious structures. Her analysis of the figure of Mother Reeves illustrates both. Mother Reeves has a career as an assistant vice president of sales in a big industrial corporation, which contradicts her submission to rigid gender norms within the church. However, rather than focusing on the contradiction, Casselberry argues that the church inspired Mother Reeves to gradually adopt a religious regimen that empowers her to fight the systemic racism and sexism she faces in her career. Mother Reeves’ emotional labor is therefore not only focused on coping with patriarchal power structures in the religious context of the church, but also in her secular professional environment. Moving up on the career ladder she emphasizes the importance of staying ‘humble’ as a Christian to not offend or juxtapose her co-workers or superiors.

Casselberry centralizes the narratives and perspectives of women in COOLJC, while weaving her argument about women’s labor in church contexts gently through the chapters. Inspired by the work of Saba Mahmood she focusses on how action produces particular ethics and emotions, rather than vice versa. Emotional labor is only one of the aspects of the labor of faith that characterizes women’s religious worlds in African American Apostolic Pentecostalism. Casselberry discusses other forms of women’s work. In an extensive account on the illness and passing of a church member named Louise in the beginning of her book, Casselberry unfolds how women participate in ‘particular registers of labor’. Women in COOLJC play important roles in the intimate labor of praying for the sick during healing services, while they also organizing the care for Louise when she is sick and dying and for her family and the home after Louise’s passing. Moving between these registers-the faith is part of praying for healing and the need to bring the experience of losing a church member to a deadly disease in line with the faith in healing- requires emotional work. Furthermore, it requires a lot of organizational work, which is again primarily the work of women in the church. Casselberry furthermore devotes attention to the aesthetic labor that is required from women to secure their respectability and that
of the church, through modest dress women demonstrate the holy lifestyle that is preached within the church. Performing the ‘beauty of holiness’ women also proofs themselves as the spiritual gatekeepers of the church.

The relevance of Casselberry’s book lies first of all in her analysis of how patriarchy within the context of the church is part of religious praxis through these forms of labor that are disproportionally done by women in the church. However, women’s agency in this is derived from the power that they experience in their encounter with the divine; women’s labor first and foremost focusses on their personal growth. In that sense the book is an example of a Black Apostolic Pentecostal ‘politics of piety’, much in line with Mahmood’s work.

What is original and relevant in Casselberry contribution to conceptual debates on submission and agency, is precisely her detailed analysis of the forms of labor, as well as her account of how women through their labor acquire a ‘complicated authority’ vis-à-vis the male leadership in the church. A promising aspect of her analysis is how she occasionally opens up to consider women’s labor in patriarchal contexts as a broader characteristic of today’s global economy. The relevance of her argument therefore extends beyond the specific religious context of COOLJC when she raises the question how the social value of labor is influenced by the particular positions of those who give care and those who receive it.

I am confident that reading Casselberry’s book will inspire researchers engaged in empirical research on gender across religious and secular contexts, in particular those researchers that wish to move beyond the religious secular binary will find inspiration in her conceptualization of women’s labor.