Primary production and eddy correlation measurements of CO₂ exchange over an intertidal estuary

H. J. Zemmelink,¹ H. A. Slagter,¹,2 C. van Slooten,¹,2 J. Snoek,¹ B. Heusinkveld,³ J. Elbers,⁴ N. J. Bink,⁵ W. Klaassen,⁵ C. J. M. Philippart,⁶ and H. J. W. de Baar¹,2

Received 21 May 2009; revised 17 August 2009; accepted 3 September 2009; published 10 October 2009.

[1] Field measurements by eddy correlation indicate an average CO₂ uptake of 1.9 g C m⁻² d⁻¹ by the intertidal Wadden Sea estuary in spring 2008. The flux did not show a dependency on the tide and fluxes during high and low tide were comparable. We hypothesize that biological production in the water column and in microbial mats that cover sediments lead to an undersaturation of CO₂ that is strong enough to support the observed fluxes. The total carbon uptake by this intertidal estuary from day of the year 101–168 is estimated to be −1.7 Tg C. Extrapolation of this flux over three months in spring suggests that the uptake of CO₂ by this estuary over this period is comparable to 24% of the yearly carbon flux over the North Sea and the European estuaries. Citation: Zemmelink, H. J., H. A. Slagter, C. van Slooten, J. Snoek, B. Heusinkveld, J. Elbers, N. J. Bink, W. Klaassen, C. J. M. Philippart, and H. J. W. de Baar (2009), Primary production and eddy correlation measurements of CO₂ exchange over an intertidal estuary, Geophys. Res. Lett., 36, L19606, doi:10.1029/2009GL039285.

[2] Coastal seas play a key role in the global carbon cycle by linking the terrestrial, oceanic and atmospheric carbon reservoirs. Recent studies highlighted the significance of continental shelves in the global carbon cycle and in particular for the budgets of CO₂ [Tsunogai et al., 1999; Frankignoulle and Borges, 2001; Cai et al., 2003; Thomas et al., 2004, 2005]. The concentrations, temporal changes and spatial variations of total dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), alkalinity (TA) and the partial pressure of CO₂ in surface water (pCO₂w) provide crucial data for how these systems function at the biogeochemical level. Current estimates suggest that within coastal systems the estuaries emit about 0.3–0.4 Pg C yr⁻¹; largely balancing the estimated CO₂ sink associated with marginal seas of about 0.45 Pg C yr⁻¹ [Borges, 2005]. The annual emission of European estuaries is estimated to range from 10 to 20 Tg C yr⁻¹ [Ciais et al., 2008] close to the annual uptake by the North Sea of −10.3 Tg C yr⁻¹ [Thomas et al., 2004]. However, current European studies of marine carbon budgets largely neglect fluxes over the intertidal Wadden Sea estuary, one of the largest intertidal estuaries in the world, lying off the coast of North Western Europe. Here, we present data on EC-based CO₂ fluxes measured in spring 2008 over the Wadden Sea estuary.

[3] Exchange of CO₂ with the atmosphere is usually based on (i) floating flux chambers [Frankignoulle et al., 1998] or on (ii) pCO₂ values in surface water versus air values that are estimated from equilibrators that measure pCO₂w or (iii) assessed indirectly from measurements of DIC and TA in subsurface water. Fluxes (F) are subsequently calculated from the product of the air-water concentration disequilibrium (ΔpCO₂) and a kinetic parameter, the transfer velocity (k), which quantifies the rate at which the gas crosses the air-water interface, F = KαΔpCO₂, where α is the solubility coefficient of CO₂ [e.g., Borges, 2005]. Measuring ΔpCO₂ is comparatively straightforward. However, the current measurement techniques only supply discrete samples. Although these discrete measurements give good insight in processes that determine fluxes, they cannot detect temporal and spatial variability of gas concentrations that are required for accurate estimates of fluxes. This is especially relevant in highly dynamic systems such as estuaries.

[4] Even when CO₂ concentrations in the water column are fairly well known, it remains difficult to calculate fluxes because the transfer velocity across the water surface is highly uncertain [e.g., Upstill-Goddard, 2006]. Hence, the accuracy of calculated fluxes is generally limited by the ability to adequately resolve the transfer velocity. Typically k is constrained by turbulence and commonly parameterized as a function of wind speed and temperature alone; despite the acknowledged role of several other environmental parameters such as waves, biological productivity and surface films that are not related to wind speed [Watson and Orr, 2003; Calleja et al., 2005].

[5] This is especially relevant to shallow coastal areas where gas exchange is also controlled by tides: tidal-driven rather than wind-driven turbulence could determine fluxes from the water [Raymond and Cole, 2001; Zappa et al., 2007]. In addition, tidal pressure waves and surface heating during low tides potentially influence gas exchange from tidal flats. Moreover, tidal flats are often not taken into account in current flux estimates from estuaries with intertidal habitats. This in spite of the fact that they are thought to function as suboxic, fluidized bed reactors which promote efficient degradation and respiration of organic materials [Aller, 1998], resulting in substantial respiration rates [Middelburg et al., 2005].
[6] An alternative approach to quantifying gas exchange is to measure it directly, precluding the need for information on k and ΔC separately. Recent studies have demonstrated that direct measurements of CO₂ flux by the micrometeorological technique eddy correlation (EC) can be used to study processes that determine fluxes [Zappa et al., 2007] and can constrain the magnitude of fluxes of CO₂ (and other trace gases) to the atmosphere in the marine environment [e.g., Zemmelink et al., 2006, 2008]. EC (in combination with pCO₂(w)) is regarded to be capable of elucidating the relationship between gas exchange and underlying environmental and ecosystem parameters, on time scales short enough to resolve short term temporal (diurnal, seasonal) variability; relevant to highly dynamic intertidal systems such as the Wadden Sea.

[7] The surface area of the Wadden Sea extends to 13,500 km², of which 2/3 emerges during low tide. This study is conducted at the island of Griend (53°15′05″N, 5°15′15″E), a small (0.2 Km²) island centrally located in the western part of the Wadden Sea. The island is surrounded by tidal flats and tidal channels that are in the fetch of the ten meter high EC tower from which fluxes are measured in this study. Sediments near the island mainly consist of sand (grain size > 62 μm) with an increasing silt fraction (grain size < 62 μm) with distance from the island. Dry falling finer sediments near the island are covered with well developed microbial mats that support dense communities of bacteria and photosynthetically active algae.

[8] The flux of CO₂ was measured by EC which is considered to be the most direct technique for measuring gas fluxes [Fairall et al., 2000], since it utilizes the covariance of scalar concentrations (or mixing ratios) and vertical wind velocity. EC requires measurements at a sufficient rate (10–20 Hz) to adequately capture all turbulence frequencies contributing to the flux. The EC system (Wittich and Visser, (10–20 Hz) to adequately capture all turbulence frequencies contributing to the flux. The EC system (Wittich and Visser, 2006, 2008) EC (in combination with pCO₂(w)) is regarded to be capable of elucidating the relationship between gas exchange and underlying environmental and ecosystem parameters, on time scales short enough to resolve short term temporal (diurnal, seasonal) variability; relevant to highly dynamic intertidal systems such as the Wadden Sea.

[9] Fluxes from dry-falling sediments and surface waters were also measured by discrete sampling methods: flux chambers and ΔpCO₂ measurements. Flux chambers with a volume of 0.25 m³ were made of UV-transparent Polymethylmethacrylate and in a closed circuit connected to a Licor 7000. Head space air in the flux chamber was pumped through the system at a rate of 2.5 liter per minute providing fluxes over short (ten minutes) time scales. The partial pressure of CO₂ in the water (pCO₂(w)) was derived from DIC and TA measurements. Analysis of DIC was performed by means of the coulometric method, TA was determined with an automated potentiometric titration using a combined DIC/Alkalinity analyzer system (Vindta 3C, Marianda, Germany). Accuracy of DIC and TA measurements was set by using certified reference material obtained from Prof. A. Dickson (Scripps Institution of Oceanography). Three replicates were determined for each sample and CRM with a precision better than 2 μmol kg⁻¹. Fluxes were calculated following F = k ΔpCO₂. The transfer velocity k was determined by using the wind dependency parameterization for spot measurements as proposed by Wanninkhof [1992].

[10] The seasonal cycle of Chlorophyll-a in the Wadden Sea always shows the highest values in April to June, in association with a spring peak in diatoms followed by a Phaeocystis bloom [Cadée and Hegeman, 2002]. During this season a net fixation of carbon through photosynthesis can be expected. Indeed, a relative uptake of carbon was measured during our study. The daily flux as measured by EC showed a pronounced diurnal signal with mid day fluxes around −2.7 g C m⁻²d⁻¹ sometimes exceeding −5 g C m⁻²d⁻¹ just after mid day. In the night, when CO₂ is produced through respiration, the flux decreased to an average of −0.57 g C m⁻²d⁻¹ (Figure 1a; in order to present more detail only the fluxes are shown for day of the year 114–121 and 162–168. Overall fluxes from day of the year 101 till 168 show a similar diurnal variation and amplitude). The EC-fluxes are in close agreement with primary production rates of 1.6 g C m⁻²d⁻¹ (Table 1) that are obtained from laboratory incubations as part of an ongoing time series study of phytoplankton dynamics in the Marsdiep tidal inlet (53°00′11″N; 4°47′40″E) of the Wadden Sea [Cadée and Hegeman, 1974, 2002; Philippart et al., 2007].

[11] We estimate the uncertainty of covariance measurements in this study in the order of 10%. However, it is difficult to give an estimate of the uncertainty of the flux without independent measurements in the field. The total of random errors, however, is less than 50%. This can be seen from consecutive measurements that should cluster together since they are conducted during similar meteorological conditions. There are, however, some outliers that can not be readily accounted for and that might be caused by uncertainties in the exhaust of ships that pass the island. The contribution of these outliers to the averaged flux is small by averaging over many individual values of FCO₂ together.
During low tide the emerging sediments around the meteorological tower are within the source area of the measured flux. Surprisingly, CO$_2$ fluxes did not show a dependence on the tidal height or on scale of the source area within the uncertainty of the measurements (Figures 1b and 1c and Table 2). A linear regression analysis of the absolute CO$_2$ flux versus tidal height T (m) and source area S (m$^2$) resulted in: $F_{CO2} = -0.9T - 2.0$ ($R^2 = 0.02$) and $F_{CO2} = -6.10 - 4S - 2.5$ ($R^2 = 0.06$), respectively. The uptake of carbon during incoming tide at day time was on average $-2.7$ $(\pm 2.0)$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, not different from fluxes of $-2.3$ $(\pm 1.9)$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ that were measured during outgoing tide. Also fluxes measured at high tide and low tide during the day did not differ $(-2.9$ $(\pm 2.3)$ and $-3.2$ $(\pm 1.9)$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, respectively). Fluxes measured during the night were smaller and in some cases positive: averages ranged from $-0.1$ $(\pm 2)$ to $-1.0$ $(\pm 0.7)$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ during the tidal cycle (Table 2).

Measurements with flux chambers over tidal flats in the source area of the EC system are in agreement with EC measurements showing a day time carbon uptake of $-8.1$ $(\pm 5.1)$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, decreasing to $0.5$ $(\pm 1.2)$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ during the night. Flux chamber studies show that fluxes can be highly variable and dependent on sediment type and cover; with day time fluxes over fine sediments higher than over coarse sediments $(-12.6$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ and $3.6$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, respectively). In addition, Spilmont et al. [2007] show in a recent publication that the variability of intertidal benthic community production is correlated to light and the tidal cycle; where maximum production (up to $8$ g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, in August) occurred just before and after immersion with water. Unfortunately, our limited number of flux chamber measurements does not allow such a detailed study, but this will be conducted in the near future.

In the water pCO$_2$ tended to decrease in the course of spring with average pCO$_2$ values of $244 \pm 67$ µatm (n = 8, $T_w = 11°C$; late April), $202 \pm 84$ µatm (n = 12, $T_w = 13°C$; mid May) and $193 \pm 95$ µatm (n = 7, $T_w = 15°C$) in early June, pCO$_2$ showed a clear diurnal cycle, with values near $140$ µatm during the day and near $200$ µatm during the night (averaged over the three months, Table 1). The flux computed from pCO$_2$ measurements and the wind speed parameterization of gas transfer was at least an order of magnitude lower than the flux measured by EC (Table 2). While the above mentioned parameterization of Wanninkhof [1992] is most commonly used for the open ocean, where wind stress is the dominant factor affecting turbulence at the water surface, the EC measurements over the Wadden Sea estuary did not reveal a correlation between gas flux and wind speed $U$ (m s$^{-1}$) within the uncertainty of the measurements: $F_{CO2} = 0.29U + 1.5$ ($R^2 = 0.09$, Figure 1d). Other parameterizations exist for estuaries that might better represent cases where wind forcing and tidal current together generate transfer velocities [Raymond and Cole, 2001; Borges et al., 2004]. It is, however, difficult to find a common parameterization that fits all estuaries. Individual systems will have unique (tidal) currents that affect turbulence in the water column. In an intertidal system such as the Wadden Sea macro-scale bottom roughness will even further enhance turbulence and transfer velocities [Moog and Jirka, 1999a, 1999b; Tokoro et al., 2008]. It is theoretically possible to derive transfer velocities from $k = F(\alpha \Delta pCO_2)$, where

![Figure 1](image)

**Figure 1.** (a) Turbulent CO$_2$ flux (g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$) over the Intertidal Wadden Sea estuary as measured by eddy correlation from day of the year (2008) 114–122 and from 162–168 (here, only a selection of the data is presented so that more details can be seen in the plots. Fluxes and their diurnal variation are similar during the whole study period). Shaded areas represent night time. The solid black line is the tidal height (m). (b) CO$_2$ flux (g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$) as a function of tidal height (m). (c) CO$_2$ flux (g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$) as function of the extend of the area around the meteorological tower that supports 80% of the flux (source area, m$^2$ during the tidal height (m). (d) CO$_2$ flux (g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$) over the Wadden Sea estuary did not reveal a correlation between gas flux and wind speed $U$ (m s$^{-1}$) within the uncertainty of the measurements: $F_{CO2} = 0.29U + 1.5$ ($R^2 = 0.09$, Figure 1d). Other parameterizations exist for estuaries that might better represent cases where wind forcing and tidal current together generate transfer velocities [Raymond and Cole, 2001; Borges et al., 2004]. It is, however, difficult to find a common parameterization that fits all estuaries. Individual systems will have unique (tidal) currents that affect turbulence in the water column. In an intertidal system such as the Wadden Sea macro-scale bottom roughness will even further enhance turbulence and transfer velocities [Moog and Jirka, 1999a, 1999b; Tokoro et al., 2008]. It is theoretically possible to derive transfer velocities from $k = F(\alpha \Delta pCO_2)$, where

### Table 1. Primary Production Rates Derived From Laboratory Incubations$^a$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>Avg</th>
<th>Std</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>1.53</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>2.59</td>
<td>1.86</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>1.56</td>
<td>0.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>3.88</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>2.72</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>1.47</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td>1.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$Primary production rates, g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$. Samples were obtained from the Marsdiep tidal inlet of the Wadden Sea.
the flux is measured by EC. These transfer velocities would include all factors that control gas exchange in the source area of the EC system. Following this approach an average $\Delta$pCO$_2$ of 208 μatm (n = 27, April through June) and the EC reported flux measurements suggest a gas transfer velocity of ≈100 cm/hr which is two to 5 times higher then observed for the Scheldt, Thames, or Rhine [ Abril and Borges, 2004] and more than ten times greater then expected from common wind speed parameterizations [e.g., Wanninkhof, 1992].

However, the limited number of samples for pCO$_2w$ measurements that were taken during this study can not reflect the heterogeneity of surface water pCO$_2$. Consequently pCO$_2w$ values obtained through this study can not be used to derive a reliable “Wadden Sea transfer velocity”. Such a parameterization would require high resolution measurements of pCO$_2w$ in the source area of the EC tower. Where pCO$_2w$ is ideally measured near the water surface where gas exchange and planktonic metabolism control air sea CO$_2$ disequilibria.

Fluxes over the Wadden Sea are in the same order of magnitude as EC-derived fluxes over forests and grasslands [e.g., Mauder et al., 2008]. In contrast, the average flux measured from April through June (day of the year 101 until 168) of ≈1.93 g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ is an order of magnitude lower than fluxes that have been calculated from continuous underway pCO$_2$ measurements in nearby European coastal zones. Estimated uptakes of carbon by the Scheldt estuary in May 2001–2004 do not exceed ≈0.4 g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ [ Borges et al., 2008]. In addition, continuous underway measurements of pCO$_2w$ in the North Sea showed that this basin formed a sink for CO$_2$ in May 2002 with fluxes that ranged from near 0 to ≈0.12 g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ in the southern North Sea up to a flux of ≈0.50 g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ in the northern North Sea. Part of this discrepancy might be due to the fact that these flux estimates are based on wind speed parameterizations.

In the source area of the meteorological tower at Griend the total carbon uptake from day of the year 101 until 168 was 129 g C m$^{-2}$. Assuming that the surface area around Griend is representative for the heterogeneity found in the whole Wadden Sea and that EC integrates fluxes over heterogenic surfaces and over relevant meteorological conditions; the total carbon uptake by the Wadden Sea from day of the year 101 until 168 would be ≈1.7 Tg C. If this flux is carried by primary production and if primary production remains relatively constant from April through June (as can be hypothesized from our measurements and the time series study presented in Table 2) the total uptake in spring amounts to ≈2.4 Tg C. However, one can not assume that this carbon is going to remain in the Wadden Sea: part of this carbon will be transported to the North Sea and/or might return to the inorganic carbon pool and atmosphere later in the year.

From a study conducted in 2001/2002 the CO$_2$ uptake by the North Sea is estimated at ≈10.3 Tg C yr$^{-1}$ [Thomas et al., 2004], in addition recent studies indicate that European Estuaries emit 10 to 20 Tg C yr$^{-1}$ to the atmosphere [ Ciais et al., 2008]. This indicates that the estimated spring flux over and into the Wadden Sea is significant beyond the local scale as it compares to 24% of the annual flux over various marine systems of Europe. However, all of these estimates are crude since they are based on local, non-continuous measurements of carbon budgets that are upscaled to larger regions and even to different ecosystems. Such estimates inevitably neglect in situ variability and complexity of processes underlying CO$_2$ production and consumption. The accuracy of current carbon budgets is limited by the ability to resolve the temporal and spatial heterogeneity of surface conditions and concentrations of CO$_2$. Field-based continuous long term in situ measurements of exchange of CO$_2$ with the atmosphere is possible with EC. When supplemented with measurements of dissolved inorganic carbon and alkalinity one is able to quantify sinks and sources of CO$_2$ in estuaries as needed to truly understand the role of these systems in the global carbon cycle.

Acknowledgments. The success of this work heavily relied upon the excellent and supportive co-operation with the Dutch Nature Conservancy: Natuurmonumenten and with Provincie Friesland, through which the unique permission was obtained to set up a monitoring site in the Wadden Sea national park. Special thanks go to Date & Giny Lutterop who took care of instrument maintenance in the field, and Jan Hegeman and the excellent and supportive co-operation with the Dutch Nature Conservancy: Natuurmonumenten. The work was also supported by the BSIK (‘Besluit Subsidies Investeringen in de Kennisinfrastructuur’).


