THE LEGAL STATUS AND SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES IN THE NETHERLANDS

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van het doctoraat in de Rechtsgeleerdheid aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen op gezag van de Rector Magnificus, dr. F. Zwarts, in het openbaar te verdedigen op maandag 28 november 2005 om 13.15 uur

door

Cristiano Vezzoni
geboren op 12 februari 1972
te Casalmaggiore (Italië)
Promotor: Prof. J. Griffiths

Beoordelingscommissie: Prof. M.P. Battin
               Prof. D. Mieth
               Prof. M.J. Trappenburg
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research was made possible by a grant of Alzheimer Nederland, which funded the first year of my Ph.D, and by the generous support of the Faculty of Law of the University of Groningen, which provided financial support for the remaining period.

The research could have not been carried out without the collaboration of notaries, nursing home doctors and family doctors, who patiently accepted to be interviewed despite their pressing professional duties. The same is true for the several persons who directly contributed to important research tasks: the three student assistants, Christa Wiggers, Maartje Bijl and Francisca De Jong, who carried out the telephone interviews; Hans Konst, director of the nursing home De Batting, who offered me his knowledge and experience to improve my survey on nursing home doctors, Wijbrandt van Schuur, who helped me to set up the telephone interviews in an efficient computer format.

During my Ph.D., the Department of Legal Theory, with its secretaries, Yt, Elvira and Marije, and nice colleagues like Tobias, Jeanne and Jellienke, became a sort of second home and offered me a favourable professional and human environment to do at best my work. Moreover, the research group that went under the difficult acronym of MBPSL, represented a major point of reference. There I found intellectual inspiration, open-handed help and a lot of fruitful discussion. From Heleen, with her vast and precise knowledge about literature, from Albert, with his tireless passion in discussion; from Nicolle, Donald, Rob, Triny, Dick, Sofia, Graciela and Hannah; from Winnie, always ready to help, with a cheerful touch, when I was lost in a mess of references; and from Kim, with whom I overcame hours of discouragement but also shared hours of fun and inspiration.
My experience was enriched by the possibility to meet many colleagues from different countries and background at international conferences. These visits were mostly founded by the CRBS, whose members Joop Houtman and Barbara Hallebeek were always supportive.

A special thanks goes to Kris Kruze of the Administrative Office of the Faculty of Law. His friendly approach and his attitude to make as simple as possible boring and complicated bureaucratic procedures always surprised me.

In these years in Groningen, many people gave me the feeling of being at home. First, the people at the RKZ: Sanne, Alexandra, André, Anna, Otto, Eric, Roos and Esther, who made me part of their very special community. Then the ‘famiglia di frutti’, which is too broad to be fully listed; only few representatives then, but the other ones are not forgotten: Joyce, Sonja, Lenny, Branislava and Paolo. Next to them, all the people with whom I went through long, exhausting bike trips in the province of Groningen. Among them, Cornelie has a special place: with her I shared so many kilometres, pittige discussions and one of the most adventurous vacation I ever had. And finally Chau, whose grace and kindness was always a positive note; Faezeh, who, at the beginning, when I did not know anyone in Groningen, was the first person to come and wait for me at the station; and Eleonora, who was next to me all the times I was completely lost in a jungle of tasks, and patiently took me by the hand and helped me.

John Griffiths, my supervisor, deserves a special mention. His dedication and sharp thought still amaze me. I was very lucky to have found such a person, always ready to listen to my ideas, to support me in the difficult moments, and so extremely patient and careful to revise my work (and my shaky English). Without him, I am sure my research would have been of much less quality. I hope to be able to repay him, at least partly, in pumpkin seeds, which he likes growing so much.

Finally a special thanks to my family. Senza la loro comprensione e disponibilità disinteressata, non sarei mai riuscito a concludere con successo questa impresa non facile. A loro, mamma, papa, Monia e Marcella, zia Luigina, la mia gratitudine.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER I
**AUTONOMY FOR INCOMPETENT PATIENTS AND ADVANCE DIRECTIVES**

1. INTRODUCTION 11
2. DEFINITIONS 12
3. THE ETHICAL PERSPECTIVE: AUTONOMY FOR INCOMPETENT PATIENTS 16

## CHAPTER II
**THE LEGAL STATUS OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES: AN INTERNATIONAL SURVEY**

1. RESPECT FOR AUTONOMY AND INFORMED CONSENT IN THE MEDICAL SPHERE 21
2. INFORMED CONSENT IN SEVERAL COUNTRIES 24
3. AUTONOMY FOR INCOMPETENT PATIENTS: THE LEGAL STATUS OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES 26
4. SUMMARY 34

## CHAPTER III
**THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES: ANALYSIS OF THE EMPIRICAL LITERATURE AND DEVELOPMENT OF A SYSTEMATIC ANALYTIC FRAMEWORK**

1. THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE DEBATE ON TREATMENT DIRECTIVES 35
2. DEMAND FOR TREATMENT DIRECTIVES 39
3. FACTORS INFLUENCING THE COMPLETION OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES 53
4. DRAFTING A TREATMENT DIRECTIVE 56
5. AVAILABILITY OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES: THE LATENCY PHASE 58
6. EFFECTS OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES ON CARE AT THE END-OF-LIFE 59
7. GENERAL SOCIAL EFFECTS OF THE USE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES 62
8. SUMMARY 63
CHAPTER IV
TREATMENT DIRECTIVES IN THE NETHERLANDS

1. TREATMENT DIRECTIVES IN DUTCH LAW 69
2. OTHER KINDS OF ADVANCE DIRECTIVES UNDER DUTCH LAW 73
3. THE EXISTING EMPIRICAL DATA FOR THE NETHERLANDS 75

CHAPTER V
EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS OF THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES

1. INTRODUCTION 79
2. THE MAIN ACTORS 81
3. A SHORT DESCRIPTION OF THE SOCIAL STRUCTURES AND RELATIONSHIPS INVOLVED IN THE PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES 84
4. THE RESEARCH CHOICES 85
5. THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS 88
6. DISCUSSION OF THE QUESTIONS 90
7. ORGANIZATION OF THE EMPIRICAL PART 95

CHAPTER VI
THE ROLE OF NOTARIES IN THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES

1. INTRODUCTION 97
2. THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS 99
3. METHODS 100
4. RESULTS 101
5. DISCUSSION 111

CHAPTER VII
THE ROLE OF NURSING HOME DOCTORS IN THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES

1. METHODS AND INSTRUMENTS 116
2. THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES IN DUTCH NURSING HOMES 123
3. DISCUSSION 136
CHAPTER VIII
THE ROLE OF FAMILY DOCTORS IN THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES

1. METHODS AND INSTRUMENTS 141
2. THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES AMONG DUTCH FAMILY DOCTORS 147
3. DISCUSSION 165

CONCLUSION

1. THE SETTING OF THE RESEARCH 169
2. RESULTS 173
3. REFLECTIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS 181

REFERENCES 185

SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY) 193