Is Citizenship Secular?
Conceptualising the relation between religion and citizenship in contemporary Dutch society

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
op gezag van de rector magnificus prof. dr. E. Sterken
en volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties.

De openbare verdediging zal plaatsvinden op
donderdag 17 september 2015 om 16.15 uur

door

Reinie Alida Wagenvoorde
geboren op 4 september 1985
te Zuidhorn
Promotor
Prof. dr. A.L. Molendijk

Copromotor
Dr. C. Jedan

Beoordelingscommissie
Prof. dr. K.I. van Oudenhoven-Van der Zee
Prof. dr. F. de Lange
Prof. dr. W.G.J. Duyvendak
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................... v
List of abbreviations concerning Dutch institutions .............................................. ix

Introduction
1. Religion and good citizenship in contemporary Dutch society ..................... 3
   1.1 Wondering about Dutch society ................................................................. 3
   1.2 Research aim, goals and audience ............................................................ 5
2. Theoretical and methodological considerations ................................................. 9
   2.1 The notion of citizenship .......................................................................... 9
   2.2 The Big Five model of citizenship ............................................................ 10
   2.3 The relation between religion and citizenship ...................................... 14
   2.4 Looking from different angles: structure of the book ......................... 17
      2.4.1 Philosophical and political interpretations of citizenship: Part One 18
      2.4.2 The views of Dutch citizens: Part Two ............................................. 20

Part One: Philosophical and political thinking on citizenship
3. Setting the stage: backgrounds for thinking on citizenship ......................... 25
   3.1 Contemporary thinking on citizenship .................................................... 25
   3.2 Four approaches to citizenship ................................................................. 27
4. Political philosophic theories on citizenship ..................................................... 29
   4.1 The liberal focus on law-abidingness and tolerance ............................. 29
      4.1.1 Liberal elements of citizenship ......................................................... 31
      4.1.2 The fact of pluralism and the issue of religious expressions ............ 32
   4.2 Communitarianism and in-group identity ............................................... 35
      4.2.1 Religious freedom and the issue of plurality .................................... 36
      4.2.2 Shared identity and social engagement ........................................... 40
   4.3 Neo-republicanism and ‘The Unknown Society’ .................................... 41
      4.3.1 Neo-republican obligations of citizenship ....................................... 43
      4.3.2 The matter of consensus and religion in the public domain .......... 45
   4.4 Liberal nationalism and the issue of national identity ......................... 47
      4.4.1 The liberal nationalist approach to citizenship ............................... 50
      4.4.2 National identity versus religious identity ....................................... 51
5. Government framing of good citizenship ......................................................... 55
   5.1 Changing paradigms in integration policies ............................................. 56
5.2 Citizenship in the ‘90s: embracing multiculturalism
5.2.1 Integration policy avant la lettre
5.2.2 Citizenship as explicit goal of integration policy
5.3 The ideal of Dutch citizenship in the twenty-first century
5.3.1 ’Coming to the Netherlands’
5.3.2 The public role of religion
6. Comparing two perspectives: converging lines, diverging trends
6.1 Similarity and discrepancies
6.2 Is it all about sex?
7. Social-scientific research on religion and citizenship
7.1 Previous research on religion and citizenship
7.1.1 Social-scientific studies on Dutch citizenship
7.1.2 Previous research on the appreciation of religion
7.2 Reading guide to Part Two
8. Methodological justification of study 1: survey
8.1 Materials
8.1.1 Religious commitment scale
8.1.2 Questions about the good citizen
8.1.3 Attitude towards religion
8.2 Validity and reliability of the survey
8.2.1 Religious commitment scale
8.2.2 Citizenship scale
8.2.3 Attitude towards religion scale
8.3 Respondents
8.4 Procedure
9. Methodological justification of study 2: interviews
9.1 Interviewees
9.1.1 Muslims of Turkish origin
9.1.2 Religiously highly committed Protestants
9.1.3 Sample
9.2 Materials
9.3 Procedure
10. Results of the statistical analyses
10.1 Essential characteristics of a good citizen
10.1.1 Religious differences in the opinions on citizenship
10.1.2 The influence of religious commitment
10.2 Dutch citizens on the appreciation of religion
10.3 Correlations between religion and citizenship attitudes
11. Dutch Citizens on the Big Five of Citizenship
11.1 Tolerance
11.2 Law-abidingness
11.3 Social engagement
11.4 Political engagement
11.5 Shared identity ................................................................. 162
12. Dutch citizens on the appreciation of religion ....................... 169
   12.1 Religion as a value basis for society ............................. 169
   12.2 Privatised religion ..................................................... 171
   12.3 Embracing religious diversity ...................................... 173
     12.3.1 Freedom of religion ............................................. 174
     12.3.2 Religious diversity .............................................. 176
   12.4 Negative attitude towards religion ................................ 177
   12.5 Perceptions of religion: threats and opportunities ............ 179
13. The interrelatedness of religion and citizenship in two case studies ... 183
   13.1 Correlations between religion and citizenship attitudes ......... 183
   13.2 Paulien: shared inner convictions as condition for citizenship .... 185
   13.3 Murat: religion as basis for boundless citizenship .............. 191

Synthesis

14. Connecting the dots .......................................................... 201
   14.1 Analysing the notion of citizenship ................................ 202
     14.1.1 Typical Dutch tolerance ......................................... 202
     14.1.2 Voting as Dutch political engagement ....................... 204
     14.1.3 Opposed trends in reasoning about citizenship ............. 205
   14.2 Clarifying the relation between religion and citizenship ....... 207
     14.2.1 Spurious relation between religion and citizenship? ....... 207
     14.2.2 The contested issue of sexuality in relation to Dutch identity .... 208
   14.3 Understanding the influence of religious beliefs ................ 209
15. Conclusion: Towards an integrative concept of citizenship ............ 213

Appendices

Appendix A: Questionnaire (in Dutch) ....................................... 219
Appendix B: Interview scheme (in Dutch) .................................... 225
Appendix C: Glossary of statistical and psychometrical terms .......... 231
Appendix D: Results of factor analyses ..................................... 239
Appendix E: Overview of respondents ....................................... 245

References .................................................................................... 247

Samenvatting (Dutch summary) ............................................. 265

Curriculum Vitae ........................................................................... 279