ELECTRON MICROSCOPY AND IMAGE ANALYSIS
OF THE COMPLEXES I AND V OF THE
MITOCHONDRIAL RESPIRATORY CHAIN

J. BRINK,* E. J. BOEKEMA† and E. F. J. VAN BRUGGEN*†

*Biochemisch Laboratorium, Rijksuniversiteit Groningen, Nijenborgh 16, NL-9747 AG Groningen, The Netherlands and
†Fritz-Haber-Institut der Max-Planck-Gesellschaft, Faradayweg 4-6, D-1000 Berlin, F.R.G.

CONTENTS

I. Scope of the review ......................................................... 175
II. Mitochondria ................................................................. 176
   A. Introduction ......................................................... 176
   B. The respiratory chain ............................................. 176
III. Mitochondrial NADH dehydrogenase ................................................. 177
   A. Introduction ......................................................... 177
   B. Subunits and prosthetic groups of NADH dehydrogenase ................. 177
   C. Chemical labelling of NADH dehydrogenase ......................... 178
   D. Electron microscopy ............................................. 179
   E. Structure of beef heart NADH dehydrogenase .................. 179
   F. Structure of fungal NADH dehydrogenase ....................... 184
   G. Evaluation of state-of-the-art ..................................... 186
IV. Mitochondrial F,F,-ATPase ................................................. 188
   A. Introduction ......................................................... 188
   R. Subunits of ATP synthases ...................................... 188
   C. Structure of F1 ..................................................... 189
   D. Structure of the stalk ............................................ 192
   E. Structure of F0 ..................................................... 193
   F. Orientation of F0 and F1 and arrangement of F0,F1 in situ .... 193
V. Summary and conclusions .............................................. 195
Acknowledgements ....................................................... 195
References ............................................................... 195

I. SCOPE OF THE REVIEW

The aim of this review is to summarize structural information on two membrane protein complexes of the eukaryotic respiratory chain. Special attention is paid to the electron microscopy and subsequent image analysis. An extensive review on this subject has recently been published (Costello and Frey, 1987) dealing with the whole respiratory chain. This contribution, however, will focus on just two enzyme complexes, i.e. the NADH:ubiquinone oxidoreductase or NADH dehydrogenase (E.C. 1.6.99.3) and the F,F,-ATPase or ATP synthase (E.C. 3.6.1.3). This allows a more detailed discussion of many aspects not mentioned before. Moreover, new results have recently been achieved on both proteins. We will discuss structural aspects obtained by electron microscopy, and where possible functional aspects will be addressed and correlated with more general structural data. We assume that the reader is familiar with general principles of electron microscopy as well as image analysis. Therefore this review will not deal with

† To whom correspondence should be addressed.
II. MITOCHONDRIA

A. Introduction

In eukaryotic cells respiration is confined to a very specific particle, i.e. the mitochondrion. Mitochondria are highly specialized cell organelles, which supply metabolic energy in the form of ATP. In oxidative phosphorylation the ATP production is an exponent of actual cell respiration, which in itself is the result of the compartmentation of a specific set of enzymes, cofactors and substrates. Compartmentation is achieved by the presence of two continuous lipid bilayers, i.e. the inner membrane and the outer membrane. The outer membrane is permeable to small metabolites and ions, owing to the presence of a pore-forming protein, the mitochondrial porin (Mannella, 1982).

The inner membrane is extensively folded into a variable number of 'cristae mitochondrales' or cristae, which increase its total surface area. Together, the two bilayers enclose and define two mitochondrial compartments, i.e. the intercristae space or matrix space and the narrower intermembrane space. The latter is known to be connected to the intracristae space (Sjöstrand, 1983).

The matrix space contains several metabolic systems, such as the enzymes involved in the citric acid cycle and the \( \beta \)-oxidation of fatty acids. It also holds the enzymatic machinery responsible for the expression of the mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA). The mtDNA encodes only for a small fraction of the mitochondrial proteins, i.e. several polypeptides of NADH:ubiquinone (Q) oxidoreductase, cytochrome oxidase (complex IV) and ATP synthase (Tzagoloff, 1982; Tzagoloff and Myers, 1986). Seven unidentified reading frames of human mtDNA have been shown to encode for several subunits of the NADH:Q oxidoreductase (Chomyn et al., 1985, 1986).

B. The Respiratory Chain

The citric acid cycle is responsible for the aerobic metabolism of acetyl-CoA and yields CO\(_2\), metabolic intermediates and also NADH and FADH\(_2\). The latter two are the substrates for the actual respiratory chain protein complexes. These proteins are located in the mitochondrial inner membrane. They catalyze a series of reactions, resulting in the transport of electrons from NADH and FADH\(_2\) through the respiratory chain, after which the electrons are finally combined with molecular oxygen. The flow of these electrons liberates energy, which is conserved at three specific coupling sites numbered from 1 to 3. Numbers 1 to 3 refer to NADH:Q oxidoreductase, cytochrome reductase (complex III) and cytochrome oxidase, respectively. In the case of oxidative phosphorylation the ATP synthase (complex V), responsible for the ATP production, can be regarded as the fourth constituent of the respiratory chain.

The starting point in the respiratory chain is NADH:Q oxidoreductase, hereafter referred to as NADH dehydrogenase. This enzyme catalyzes the dehydrogenation of NADH by the removal of two electrons and two protons. These electrons and protons are transferred from riboflavin 5'-phosphate or flavine mononucleotide (FMN) via internal iron–sulphur (FeS) clusters to ubiquinone-10 (Q\(_{10}\) or coenzyme Q). The exact pathway of the protons is as yet not clear. The reduced ubiquinone, or ubiquinol, is oxidized in turn by cytochrome reductase, thereby regenerating the ubiquinone and restoring the pool-behaviour of ubiquinone with respect to NADH dehydrogenase and cytochrome reductase (Q-pool) (Slater, 1983; Ragan and Cottingham, 1985).

Apparently NADH dehydrogenase combines with cytochrome reductase in a stoichiometric way to yield NADH-ferricytochrome c reductase activity, which accounts for the net flow of electrons towards cytochrome oxidase (Ragan and Heron, 1978). The dependence of this activity on the amount of exogenous lipid most likely implies a rate-limiting diffusion step as compared to the recombination and electron transfer rate of both enzymes (Schneider et al., 1980). In line with the latter is the collision hypothesis (Herweijer et al., 1985). The electrons are transferred via internal cytochromes b and c\(_1\) and the Rieske FeS cluster (Rieske, 1976) to the one-electron acceptor ferri-
cytochrome c. Models describing the flow of electrons within the complexes III and IV have been presented in Wikström and Saraste (1984). The ferrocytochrome c is the substrate for the cytochrome oxidase, which transfers the electrons via cytochrome aa₃ to molecular oxygen.

During the transport of electrons through the respiratory chain, protons are translocated across the mitochondrial inner membrane at the coupling sites, resulting in an electrochemical potential ($\Delta \mu_H^+$). Possibly 12 protons are translocated for every oxygen atom reduced (Costello and Frey, 1987; Lane et al., 1986). In the chemiosmotic hypothesis the $\Delta \mu_H^+$ is utilized by the ATP synthase to drive the phosphorylation of ADP to ATP using inorganic phosphate (Mitchell, 1961). A penetrating review on the chemiosmotic hypothesis appeared recently (Slater, 1987).


III. MITOCHONDRIAL NADH DEHYDROGENASE

A. Introduction

The mitochondrial NADH dehydrogenase catalyzes the first step in the respiratory chain. The enzyme is referred to as complex I or the particulate NADH dehydrogenase when isolated according to Hatefi et al. (1962). The enzyme oxidizes NADH coupled to the vectorial transport (translocation) of protons over the mitochondrial inner membrane. Despite intensive research for over more than two decades, the NADH dehydrogenase is still the least understood member of the respiratory chain proteins in terms of protein structure and mechanisms of electron transfer as well as proton translocation. Consequently, only deduced structural models exist. Reviews discussing the more general aspects of the respiratory chain protein complexes including NADH dehydrogenase can be found in Wikström and Saraste (1984) and Hatefi (1985a, b), whereas reference to NADH dehydrogenase in particular is made in Ragan (1976a, 1980, 1987).

B. Subunits and Prosthetic Groups of NADH Dehydrogenase

Most of the research has been devoted to the beef heart enzyme; other mammalian sources, however, have also been used, e.g. rabbit, rat and man (Cleeter and Ragan, 1985; Ragan, 1987). Furthermore, the enzyme from the fungus Neurospora crassa has also been studied (Ise et al., 1985). The enzymes obtained from the various mammalian sources show immunological cross-reactivities (Cleeter and Ragan, 1985).

The NADH dehydrogenase contains FMN and FeS clusters. About 1.3 nmol FMN is present per mg protein (Ragan, 1976a) implying a minimal functional unit with a molecular mass of approximately 600–700 kDa (Ragan, 1980). Per FMN, roughly 17 to 23 gram atoms Fe are clustered with labile sulfide to several bi- and tetranuclear FeS clusters (Paech et al., 1981; Ragan et al., 1982a; Kowal et al., 1986). The enzyme has been shown to contain four NADH-reducible FeS clusters (Beinert and Albracht, 1982; Kowal et al., 1986), although a total number of up to eight to nine clusters has also been reported (Ohnishi et al., 1985; Ragan, 1987). A tentative scheme for the spatial organization of these clusters has been presented (Ohnishi et al., 1985). Detailed discussions concerning the FeS clusters can be found in Ohnishi (1979), Beinert and Albracht (1982) and Ohnishi and Salerno (1982).

The beef heart enzyme can be isolated in three distinct forms, all characterized by NADH-oxidation activity (Ragan, 1976b, 1980). The first two preparations refer to high molecular weight (type I) NADH dehydrogenases, i.e. the particulate NADH dehydrogenase and a water-soluble NADH dehydrogenase. Only the former has properties most closely resembling the coupling site 1 in mitochondria (Ragan, 1976a). In both preparations the enzyme contains up to 26 different polypeptides, as was shown using two-dimensional gel electrophoresis (Heron et al., 1979).

The third enzyme preparation, called low molecular weight (type II) NADH dehydrogenase and
also a water-soluble form, was shown to be a fragment of the type I NADH dehydrogenase (Biggs et al., 1963; Watari et al., 1963). This preparation contains only three polypeptides with molecular masses of 9, 24 and 51 kDa (Ragan et al., 1982a). Treatment of complex I with a NAD⁺ derivative, i.e. arylazido-β-alanyl-NAD⁺, indicated that the 51 kDa subunit comprises the NADH binding site (Chen and Guillory, 1981).

Upon chaotropic resolution the type I NADH dehydrogenase resolves into a water-soluble fraction and a water-insoluble fraction (Hatefi and Stempel, 1969; Ragan et al., 1982a, b). The former can be further separated into an iron-enriched, but FMN-depleted fraction (the iron–sulphur protein fragment or FeS protein fragment) and an FMN-containing fraction (the flavoprotein fragment or the FP fragment). The FP fragment is identical to the type II NADH dehydrogenase. This fragment shows NADH-ubiquinone reductase activity and contains FMN as well as two FeS clusters (Ragan et al., 1982b). The FeS cluster most probably involved in the interaction with FMN is cluster 3.

The second fraction, i.e. the FeS protein fragment, is composed of six subunits with molecular masses ranging from 13 to 75 kDa with a total molecular mass of 165 kDa. It contains nearly one half of the total Fe and exhibits no detectable oxidoreductase activity (Ragan et al., 1982b).

The insoluble residue contains approximately 15 polypeptides all of extremely hydrophobic nature. Furthermore, two additional FeS clusters are present, which are not detected by means of electron paramagnetic resonance experiments on complex I, viz. EPR-silent in complex I (Hatefi et al., 1985a).

C. Chemical Labelling of NADH Dehydrogenase

The hydrophilic nature of the FeS protein and FP fragments appears to contradict the lipophilic nature of the NADH dehydrogenase. Based upon chemical labelling studies with hydrophilic reagents, such as diazobenzenesulphonate and lactoperoxidase-catalyzed radiiodination, and hydrophobic probes such as 5-iodonaphth-1-yl azide and arylazidophosphatidylcholine, Ragan and coworkers have proposed a model which accounts for this apparent contradiction (Fig. 1). In this model both the FeS protein fragment and the FP fragment are surrounded by the hydrophobic subunits. The FP fragment is completely buried within the enzyme structure and thus shielded from the aqueous environment (Ragan, 1980; Ohnishi et al.,
Structure of Mitochondrial Complexes I and V

1985; Ragan and Hatefi, 1986). Access of the NADH to the FP fragment in this model can be provided by means of a channel. This channel may be realized by the 49 and 75 kDa subunits of the FeS protein fragment (Chen and Guillory, 1981). Partial confirmation has been obtained from studies involving cleavable cross-linkers (Cleeter et al., 1985; Gondal and Anderson, 1985).

D. Electron Microscopy

In contrast to many other types of research a relatively small number of electron microscopical studies concerning the structure of NADH dehydrogenase have been conducted. A few of the earliest electron micrographs of complex I-containing fractions were presented in Crane et al. (1969). They reported sheet-like structures approximately 7 nm thick, presumably of a membranous nature, in thin sections of mitochondrial subfractions. In negatively stained specimens membrane-associated globules with diameters of 4 to 5 nm were observed. Ragan and Racker (1973) also demonstrated the presence of membrane-associated globules in negatively stained specimens of complex I/phospholipid mixtures. Occasionally particles protruding some 8.5 nm from the membrane could be seen. Dialysis in the absence of phospholipids resulted in aggregates resembling those observed earlier by Crane. More detailed studies, however, emerged only recently by Boekema et al. (1982, 1984) and Brink et al. (1987) on the beef heart enzyme, and by Leonard et al. (1987) on the enzyme from N. crassa.

E. Structure of Beef Heart NADH Dehydrogenase

Boekema et al. (1982, 1986a) have demonstrated the possibility of obtaining large, well-ordered, rectangular two-dimensional crystals from complex I preparations after dialysis against 1.5 M of ammonium sulphate at slightly acidic pH (Fig. 2A). Several of the individual building blocks of these crystals are shown in Fig. 2C. These molecules are roughly 15 x 15 nm and have a tetragonal appearance. This has subsequently been confirmed by image analysis involving single-particle averaging, but details beyond 3 to 4 nm resolution were not retrieved (Boekema et al., 1984). The two-
Fig. 3. Reconstructed projected structure of a crystal of beef heart NADH dehydrogenase. Contour plot with imposed p42,2 symmetry showing only positive contour levels. Unit cell and symmetry elements have been drawn; filled squares represent the four-fold rotation axes normal to the plane of the crystal. Unit cell dimensions are 15.3 x 15.3 nm. For details see Brink et al. (1987). Reproduced with permission of Springer-Verlag.

dimensional crystals, however, are most suitable for obtaining high-resolution data, since they are monolayered over considerable large areas. Their dimensions vary from 0.5 to 2.0 \(\mu\)m depending on the presence of NADH and dithiothreitol (Brink et al., 1987). A typical optical diffraction pattern of these crystals after negative staining is shown in Fig. 2B. It displays 4mm-symmetry, as can be judged from the apparent four-fold rotational symmetry relating all reflections with each other, and the mirror symmetry along lines running at 45° angles with the lattice vectors \(a\) and \(b\). The lattice parameters were determined as \(a = b = 15.3\) nm with \(\gamma = 90°\).

Application of correlation averaging (Frank, 1982; Saxton and Baumeister, 1982) and subsequent real-space reconstruction of tilted views of these crystals yielded a three-dimensional structure with approximately 1.8 nm resolution (Boekema et al., 1986a). Contrary to the first interpretation of this structure, viz. a dimer of NADH dehydrogenase molecules, Brink et al. (1987) showed that the crystals actually contained fragments of the enzyme. They identified the crystal symmetry as p42,2 by using a numerical analysis of the amplitudes and phases of all reflections. A contour plot showing the unit cell with imposed p42,2 symmetry as well as all symmetry elements is presented in Fig. 3. In parallel, half tone images of the unit cell with similar orientations are shown in Fig. 4A and B. The unit cell is composed of four identical motifs, grouped around each four-fold rotational axis in the crystal. These motifs resemble a more or less distorted triangle with one central dark region. From crystallographic rules it was concluded that the unit cell contained 8 identical asymmetrical units, inferring that each motif should be equivalent to a dimer. The dark region in each motif corresponds to a pore extending through the entire structure, i.e. along the vertical c-axis, as was shown by Boekema et al. (1984, 1986a). Although Boekema’s model exhibiting p2 symmetry was improved by Brink et al. (1987) by imposing the higher p42,2 symmetry, no additional information concerning the structure became available. Apparently each motif is a dimeric, ellipsoidal particle containing one pore.

In section IIIC the issue was raised concerning the constituents of the aqueous channel, by which access of NADH to the FP fragment is provided. It was established that both the 49 and 75 kDa subunits of the FeS protein fragment were involved (Cleeter et al., 1985; Gondal and Anderson, 1985). Image analysis carried out by Brink et al. (1987) on the two-dimensional crystals after labelling with anti-(75 kDa subunit) \(F_\alpha\) indicated that the \(F_\alpha\) bound near the pores of the crystal (Fig. 5). Therefore the antigen, i.e. the 75 kDa subunit, is situated close to these pores. Similar immuno-labelling experiments with anti-(49 kDa subunit) \(F_\beta\) have shown that the crystals tend to dissociate during labelling (Brink and van Bruggen, unpublished results). No precise localization of the latter subunit was therefore possible, let alone a possible involvement in the realization of the pore.

Brink et al. (1987) postulated a hypothesis concerning the composition of the crystals. The authors suggested that the crystals were built of FeS protein fragments, which aggregate first up to a level of octamers, and second so as to yield the
two-dimensional crystals. They furthermore suggested that the crystallizing entity was identical to a dimeric particle. This dimer could be identical to some sort of core particle of a native dimeric NADH dehydrogenase complex (Dooijewaard and Slater, 1976a,b; Dooijewaard et al., 1978; Albracht and Bakker, 1986; Bakker and Albracht, 1986). Both the FP fragments and the hydrophobic subunits could have been removed by mere fragmentation of the enzyme (Cremona et al., 1963; Watari et al., 1963; Rossi et al., 1965) or by a preferential self-association of the removed subunits caused by ammonium sulphate, leaving as remainder the dimeric core particle, which subsequently aggregates. In such a particle the pore could then easily be part of the channel necessary for the NADH. The pore width of 2 nm might allow the NADH to reach the NADH binding site on the 51 kDa subunit of the FP fragment. Thus the close proximity of the 75 kDa subunit to the channel in the enzyme, and the localization of this subunit near the pores in the crystals, suggest a partial similarity between the channel and the pore. Nevertheless, since the precise relationship between the fragments in the crystal and the enzyme in the mitochondrial inner membrane is unknown, a firm statement concerning the physiological role of the pores cannot be made.

Besides the well-ordered, rectangular two-dimensional crystals, a second crystal form was observed under slightly altered conditions (Boekema and van Bruggen, 1983). Figure 6 shows a gallery of several patches of this crystal form. All exhibit a typical banded appearance caused by alternating light and dark rows of stain-excluding moieties. Lattice vector $a$ was chosen parallel to the light rows with $b$ approximately normal to $a$. Occasionally a striation can be observed running at 45° angles relative to $a$ and $b$. This striation divides the large stain-excluding moieties in the unit cell into two equally large parts, thus creating the impression of two domains or two monomers within the unit cell. The crystalline nature of these patches is enhanced by the repeat distance ($b$) discernible in each row. The lattice parameters were determined as $a = 19 \pm 1.3$ nm, $b = 34 \pm 6$ nm with $\gamma$ varying between 80° and 90°. Given the height of the enzyme of 8.5 nm (Ragan and Racker, 1973)
total unit cell volume of 8721 nm$^3$ is available. The unit cell is filled with stain-excluding moieties to an approximate level of only 50%. This can be judged from the large change in contrast in the unit cell, which corresponds to large differences in mass thickness. At an average molecular volume of $2.0 \times 10^3$ Da/nm$^3$ (Matthews, 1968), the total molecular mass in the unit cell would then be $2.2 \times 10^6$ Da. With a monomeric molecular mass of 600–700 kDa and allowing additional phospholipid and residual detergent to be present, this figure would then hint at two enzyme molecules occupying the unit cell. The aggregation state of the enzyme in the mitochondrial inner membrane, however, does not necessarily have to be similar to such a dimeric moiety. Indeed, this issue is a matter of dispute, as can be judged from the literature.

Since large monolayered crystals of the second form are unavailable a detailed description of the molecular packing is impossible. Nevertheless, some deductions can be made. Incorporation of the NADH dehydrogenase into lipid vesicles and subsequent detergent removal by dialysis failed to produce crystals (Brink and van Bruggen, unpublished results). Yet, from electron micrographs (Fig. 7) an average height for the enzyme of 10 nm can be measured. Furthermore, from these side-on views a minimum repeat distance of 30 to 40 nm (roughly equal to $h$) can be measured. A smaller repeat distance has only occasionally been noticed. The similarity of the measured repeat distance with the lattice vector $h$ suggests a molecular packing almost as in a two-dimensional crystal. This furthermore indicates that the vesicles have collapsed...
so as to reveal mostly the largest repeat distance. Thus the side-on view of the molecules represents a view along the analogue of $a$. Above we showed the possible existence of a dimeric enzyme complex within the unit cell. Assuming individual enzyme molecules protruding from the membrane and a view along $a$, then only one of the two monomers is visible. Thus, the other monomer would face the vesicle's interior, viz. the monomers in the dimeric enzyme structure would be related by a two-fold rotation axis in the plane of the membrane. In a minimal enzyme configuration two clusters 2 are present for only one cluster 1, whereas cluster 2 occurs in a ratio of roughly 0.8:1 as compared to FMN (Beinert and Albracht, 1982). This could indicate that not only a structural difference between both protomers exists but also a functional one. Kinetic studies, however, may suggest no functional differences, since two competing NADH binding sites have been found either per FMN or per dimeric enzyme complex (Dooijewaard and Slater, 1976). The dimeric arrangement as outlined above, however, could imply that only one monomer participates in the vectorial transport of protons. Given the implication of this speculation more structural data on the enzyme in either two-dimensional crystals or the mitochondrial inner membrane are needed to substantiate a statement about the functional organization of NADH dehydrogenase.
F. Structure of Fungal NADH Dehydrogenase

Leonard et al. (1987) recently reported on the successful crystallization of mitochondrial NADH dehydrogenase from the fungus *N. crassa*. As was shown by Ise et al. (1985) this enzyme comprises more than 15 different polypeptides, with molecular masses ranging from 11 to 70 kDa and a total molecular mass of approximately 550 kDa. Similar to the beef heart enzyme, at least six subunits are coded by the mtDNA. No immunological relationship has been demonstrated for the fungal and beef heart enzyme. Isolation was accomplished by chromatographic procedures rather than differential ammonium sulphate precipitation as for bovine complex I (Hatefi et al., 1962).

Crystallization was achieved by incorporation of the enzyme in phospholipid vesicles with subsequent detergent removal in a similar way as for cytochrome reductase (Hovmöller et al., 1983). Crystals were obtained as double-layered vesicles or tubes (Fig. 8A) and as monolayered sheets (Fig. 8B). The former show a Moiré pattern arising from two overlapping crystalline layers. At the edges of these vesicle crystals single molecules can be seen protruding 10 nm from the membrane at regular intervals of about 31 nm.

The monolayered sheets are characterized by a banded appearance, similar to the small beef heart crystals seen in Fig. 6. The sheets appear to result from a side-long alignment of rows of one-dimensionally crystallized NADH dehydrogenase molecules. However, several regions with randomly oriented monomeric and occasionally dimeric enzyme complexes can be discerned. The crystalline regions have lattice parameters $a = 19$ nm, $b = 38$ nm and $\gamma = 90^\circ$.

From the single-layered sheets a three-dimensional (3D) model was calculated using a Fourier synthesis to combine the Fourier data of several projections obtained at different tilt angles (Amos et al., 1982). The contour plots (Fig. 9) show firm contacts between the molecules within each row, but barely discernible connections between the individual rows. Leonard et al. (1987) have calculated a stain-excluding volume associated with the protein of $2.5 \times 10^7$ nm$^3$, correspond-
Fig. 8. Membrane crystals of fungal NADH dehydrogenase. (A) Double-layer membrane crystal. At the top edge where the crystal folds over, molecules can be seen on cross-section projecting about 10 nm from the surface. (B) Single-layer membrane crystal showing a large, well-ordered domain, with rows of molecules separated by about 20 nm. At the left and the right in B regions without crystallinity can be seen. Scale marker represents 100 nm. Reproduced with permission of Academic Press Inc. Courtesy of Dr K. Leonard.
Fig. 9. Contour plots of fungal NADH dehydrogenase. 
(a) A hidden line plot of the three-dimensional reconstruction viewed normal to the plane of the membrane. (b) As (a), but now viewed in the plane of the membrane along $h$. Central parallel lines indicate the approximate position of the lipid bilayer. Large density domains can be seen projecting alternately above and below the membrane. For details see Leonard et al. (1987). Reproduced with permission of Academic Press Inc. Courtesy of Dr K. Leonard.

The molecular mass of 2.0 x 10^6 Da at a protein density of 1.25 g/cm³. Since the model clearly reveals four enzyme complexes, the non-proteinous volume will be occupied by a single lipid bilayer. The bilayer occupies about 400 nm², whereas the four enzyme complexes account for only 320 nm². This large amount of lipid is exclusively located between the stain-excluding rows of the enzyme complexes. This molecular packing is in striking contrast to the packing in two-dimensional crystals of cytochrome reductase (Leonard et al., 1981), cytochrome oxidase (Deatherage et al., 1982; Kim et al., 1985) and, for instance, bacteriorhodopsin (Henderson et al., 1986). In these crystals no direct contacts between the protein molecules exist, implying that all interactions are mediated through the lipid bilayer and therefore of hydrophobic nature. The interactions in the NADH dehydrogenase crystals will most probably occur via the protein parts (hydrophilic) as well as the bilayer parts (hydrophobic). This might explain the poor quality of the lattice, as reflected by the smeared-out reflections in the optical transform and the rather low resolution (Michel, 1983).

In the 3D model (Fig. 10) the molecules are placed asymmetrically with respect to the membrane, spanning a distance of about 15 nm. The enzyme protrudes some 9 to 10 nm from one side of the membrane, as was also observed in the side-on views of the vesicle crystals of the fungal enzyme, as well as previously with the beef heart enzyme. The small protrusion of 1 nm on the opposite side of the membrane seems questionable in view of the 3.9 nm resolution along $v$. Unfortunately, no information with respect to the orientation of the enzyme within the mitochondrial inner membrane was obtained. Leonard et al. (1987) questioned the labelling results obtained with hydrophilic probes. Failure to label the FP fragment with labels other than a NAD⁺ analogue could arise from the compactness of the structure or from a shielding by peripherally located subunits. This argues against the existence of a well-defined channel for NADH. Labelling of the 49 and 75 kDa subunits would then have to be explained in terms of a specific binding or a recognition site for NADH on these subunits.

G. Evaluation of State-of-the-art

With the recent crystallization of the mitochondrial NADH dehydrogenase, the conclusion is that the overall structure for all enzyme complexes of the respiratory chain is known. The fact that from the beef heart enzyme, crystals were also obtained, although not yet optimal for image analysis, raises the question to what level both structures are similar. From the appearance of the crystals it becomes clear, that at least those from...
the beef heart enzyme allow some variation. It is unknown whether this represents a genuine structural difference. Furthermore, immunological similarities between both enzymes have as yet not been demonstrated.

The NADH dehydrogenase remains as yet the most complicated one. Important issues must be clarified; firstly, the necessity for a large number of polypeptides in the eukaryotic dehydrogenases as compared to the prokaryotic ones, as well as the precise number of constituent polypeptides. Secondly, the precise number of FeS clusters and the exact spatial organization of all prosthetic groups must be elucidated. A related issue is the function of possible EPR-silent FeS clusters; an issue that has been questioned by Kowal et al. (1986). They used magnetic circular dichroism (MCD) to assess the total number of FeS clusters in the soluble NADH dehydrogenase. The MCD data confirmed the EPR data in that four clusters were found. Therefore these authors rejected the existence of the EPR-silent clusters. Given the large variability of the Fe/FMN ratio, i.e. 16 to 23, both cluster arrangements of Kowal et al. (1986) and Ohnishi et al. (1985) account for the total amount of Fe present in each preparation. Given the relatively low purity levels of complex I, however, the proposed arrangement of four NADH-reducible FeS clusters arranged as one binuclear and three tetranuclear clusters seems to favour the in vivo situation. The matter, however, is still under dispute. Next, the overall structure needs to be elucidated at much higher resolution, either by means of electron microscopy in combination with sugar-embedding (Henderson et al., 1986) or vitrification techniques (Rachel et al., 1986) or by means of X-ray analysis of three-dimensional crystals (Deisenhofer et al., 1985). The most important issues, however, are the underlying mechanisms of electron transport and of proton translocation. A
tentative scheme for redox-linked proton translocation has been presented by Ragan (1987). In this scheme proton translocation occurs in the FP fragment as a result of the redox reactions at the FMN, as well as in the hydrophobic residue as a result of redox reactions involving Q10. In the cases of cytochrome reductase and cytochrome oxidase as yet only postulated schemes exist, despite the large amount of structural data on these two enzymes (Wikström and Saraste, 1984). Even for the F0F1 ATPase exotic models concerning ADP-phosphorylation exist (Mitchell, 1985). It thus appears that on the molecular level the link between protein structure and bioenergetics is far from clear.

IV. MITOCHONDRIAL F0F1-ATPASE

A. Introduction

The mitochondrial adenosinetriphosphatase (F0F1 ATPase, ATP synthase or complex V) catalyzes the last step in the synthesis of ATP in oxidative phosphorylation. It has three parts, usually depicted as F0, F1 and the stalk. F0 is membrane-embedded and catalyzes the proton conduction across the membrane. F1 is a water-soluble protein, connected by F0 by a small stalk. F1 contains the nucleotide and phosphate binding sites and catalyzes ATP synthesis, but synthesis is only carried out if F1 is connected to F0 by the stalk (the oligomycin sensitive F0F1 complex). The number of catalytic sites is still a matter of dispute, but most of the evidence is pointing to two catalytic and two non-catalytic sites out of the six nucleotide binding sites. Some of the many general reviews on mitochondrial and related ATP synthase complexes are found in Amzel and Pedersen (1983), Senior and Wise (1983) and Hoppe and Sebald (1984).

B. Subunits of ATP Synthases

Enzymes from different sources are very similar, but slight differences exist. Amongst the ATP synthases, the E. coli enzyme is the simplest defined so far, being a complex of eight different subunits (Foster and Fillingame, 1979). Five of them, α, β, γ, δ and ε, are located in the F1 part. The α and β occur each in three copies. The remaining three subunits, a, b and c, constitute the F0 part and the stalk. They are present in an unusual stoichiometry of 1:2:circia 10. The chloroplast enzyme has a similar composition, but has a fourth subunit in the F0 part (Fromme et al., 1987b).

Mitochondrial ATP synthase is somewhat more complex than the enzymes of E. coli and chloroplasts (Table 1). The F1 part has the same five subunits (α-ε). The δ subunit of the mitochondrial enzyme, however, resembles the ε of the other systems, whereas the mitochondrial ε has no counterpart in the other ATP synthases. The ATP synthase inhibitor protein, which binds to subunit β, is a regulator protein whose primary function seems to be to prevent the hydrolysis of newly synthesized ATP (Ernster et al., 1979).

The F0 part consists of about five subunits (Walker et al., 1987). Subunits a, b and c are related to the three E. coli subunits. Subunit d and the small hydrophobic subunit A6L (Fearnley and Walker, 1986) have no apparent bacterial homologues.

The composition of the stalk is not established but is presumed to comprise two water-soluble proteins designated coupling factor 6 (F6) and OSCP (oligomycin-sensitivity-conferring protein) (Hatefi, 1985a). The complete amino acid sequence of OSCP has been established (Ovchinnikov et al.,...
1984); the protein contains 190 amino acids and has a molecular mass of 20,967. The presence of the OSCP subunit is necessary to render the ATP synthase activity sensitive to oligomycin in the reconstituted $F_0F_1$ complex (Kagawa and Racker, 1966). The hydrophobic subunit $b$ from $F_0$ is perhaps also involved in the stalk between $F_0$ and $F_1$ (Walker et al., 1987).

ATP synthases from other preparations indicate that even more subunits could be present. For instance, factor B has been proposed to form part of $F_0$ (Sanadi et al., 1984). Walker et al. (1987), however, were unable to detect factor B in their ATP synthase preparation.

C. Structure of $F_1$

Several electron microscopical studies concern the structure of $F_1$. Most information has come from analysis of the different projections of single, isolated particles, seen in negatively stained samples (Fig. 11). The dominant view is a hexagonal projection with six peripheral masses and a seventh mass located in the centre (Munoz et al., 1968; Tiedge et al., 1983; Akey et al., 1983; Boekema et al., 1986b). Under most staining conditions applied this is the projection mostly observed. However, other and more rare views are shown in Tsuprun et al. (1984), see Fig. 12. These views are very characteristic and important for an impression of the three-dimensional structure of $F_1$. First, they found a view in which only four masses are seen, the two central ones both being an overlap of two masses (Fig. 12b). From the presence of this projection we can draw the conclusion that the structure is a hexagonal antiprism of six (close-to) globular-shaped masses, which must be the large $\alpha$ and $\beta$ subunits. Another view shows rectangular projections of molecules (Fig. 12c). A trigonal antiprism, seen from the side, can be turned in such a way that it has a rectangular appearance. The ratio between the axes is then 1.07. However, Tsuprun et al. (1984) found a ratio of 1.3 for these rectangular side views. We found a similar ratio for
such projections in electron micrographs of chloroplast ATP synthase (unpublished results); moreover, in bacterial F\textsubscript{i} ATP synthase the same rectangular side views exist (Biketov \textit{et al.}, 1982). From this we must conclude that the hexagonal antiprism is slightly flattened.
A model showing a flattened hexagonal shape was also derived from tilt experiments of single F₃ particles (Tiedge et al., 1983). These results, however, are less convincing, since preparation damage during the recording of the tilt series may also have contributed to the flattening. Recently, it was shown that the mass loss due to electron beam irradiation in a typical tilt series is of the order of 30% (Berriman and Leonard, 1986; Jésior and Wade, 1987).

Electron microscopy has also been carried out on small, three-dimensional F₃ crystals (Akey et al., 1983). Electron micrographs of such crystals are in general difficult to interpret. Although the results are not very detailed, they do not contradict the model mentioned above. X-ray diffraction on crystals generally gives much higher resolution, and in combination with amino acid sequence data provides the insight into the protein structure. But until now, only a low resolution (1 nm) structure exists (Amzel et al., 1982). Other groups, such as those of Walker in Cambridge, have also obtained three-dimensional crystals, and therefore, eventually within 5 to 10 years a detailed structure of F₃ could be available.

1. Antibody labelling

Since the masses of the α and β subunits differ only slightly (Table 1), it is not possible to discriminate between them in the images of the hexagonal projection. The arrangement of these subunits in the F₃ part has been deduced from immunoelectron microscopy (Lünsdorf et al., 1984; Tiedge et al., 1985). F₃ could be labelled with a maximum of three anti-α antibodies. The angle between two labelled α’s was 120°, viz. the α and β subunits are alternating in projection. From this it is concluded that within the trigonal antiprism there must be a layer with three α’s and a layer with three β’s.

2. Localization of the smaller subunits

The presence of a seventh central mass in the hexagonal projection of F₃ molecules had already been observed many years ago (Munoz et al., 1968). From the antibody work described above it became evident that this mass must comprise the three small subunits γ, δ and ε. Since only one copy of each subunit is present (Walker et al., 1985) and since no repeating sequences within the amino acid backbone have been found for these subunits, the F₃ structure must be asymmetric. From the original noisy electron micrographs it is difficult to deduce the precise form and location of the seventh mass. Therefore image analysis was carried out on a large dataset of single F₃ molecules (Boekema et al., 1986b). Molecular projections could be brought into equivalent orientations and averaged thereafter (Fig. 13). It was concluded that the seventh mass is located close to the centre, but slightly off its exact midpoint. It is V-shaped and its two legs point to two of the outer protein masses, most presumably being an α–β subunit pair. A similar result was obtained by Tsuhrun et al. (1987). A ferritin label, which binds only to accessible SH groups on α, γ and ε, was used to localize these subunits. Up to four of the six external protein masses could be labelled and, therefore, one of the β subunits must form a complex with at least one of the small subunits, located partially on the molecule’s external side.

Fig. 13. Projected structure of F₃ ATP synthase after image analysis. The image results from a summation of 379 projections. Scale marker represents 2 nm. For details see Boekema et al. (1986b). Reproduced with permission from Elsevier Science Publishers B.V.
D. Structure of the Stalk

The dimensions of the stalk are most easily measured from isolated F$_0$F$_1$ ATPase molecules. We found that the dimensions of the stalk as seen in the projected complex are $4.3 \times 4.3$ nm. This is in agreement with results obtained by Tsuprun et al. (1987). The dimensions of the stalk, as seen in unstained, frozen-hydrated samples of *E. coli* ATP synthases, differ slightly, with only the diameter being significantly smaller ($4.5 \times 2.5$ nm). This enzyme, however, is less complicated with only eight subunits instead of about 13 for the mitochondrial ATP synthase. Therefore a lesser number of subunits might be involved in the stalk.

OSCP is the main component of the stalk; but even in the absence of OSCP, isolated F$_1$ parts can combine with purified F$_0$ parts (MacLennan and Tzagoloff, 1968). If isolated F$_0$ and F$_1$ are mixed, the reconstituted complex shows a very small connection (about 1 nm) between both parts (Fig. 14). This suggests that besides the OSCP subunit other subunits also contribute to the stalk. Recently Walker et al. (1987) proposed that subunit b from the F$_0$ parts forms an important structural link between the F$_0$ and F$_1$ parts. This subunit could indeed be responsible for the connection as seen in Fig. 14, since most of its protein surface appears to be hydrophilic. Furthermore, F6 participates in the connection (Fessenden-Radan, 1972).

MacLennan and Asai showed already in 1968 that molecules from the isolated OSCP subunit have a strong tendency to arrange themselves into a multimeric aggregate. These aggregates have a diameter of about 10 nm and were interpreted as being tetramers. We observed very similar aggregates (Fig. 15). It seems, however, that in comparison to F$_1$ with a diameter of 11.5 nm and a mass of 371 kDa, these aggregates are remarkably large. Moreover, OSCP in the ATP synthase complex seems to be present in two copies (Penin et al., 1985). Two OSCP molecules are likely to be arranged in the ATP synthase in the same way as
in the aggregates of Fig. 14. However, if the aggregates are merely tetramers, as suggested by MacLennan and Asai (1968), two OSCP copies are difficult to fit within the dimensions of the stalk as measured before. Moreover, OSCP is an elongated protein with an axial ratio of >3 and with a hydrophobic central region (Dupuis et al., 1983). From this it seems more likely that the OSCP multimers are octamers rather than tetramers.

E. Structure of $F_0$

Very little is known about the overall shape of the $F_0$ part. Single $F_0F_1$ particles, isolated from rat liver mitochondria with deoxycholate, have been presented by Soper et al. (1979). From these images it was concluded that the $F_0$ basepiece is about 12 nm long and 6 nm high. Since it is impossible that such $F_0F_1$ particles remain monodispersed without attached detergents, the real $F_0$ diameter is likely to be much smaller.

Isolated $F_0F_1$ molecules easily aggregate into smaller or longer strings (Fig. 16); the length of the strings depends on the detergent concentration. Similar aggregated molecules were also shown by Kagawa (1972) and Mullet et al. (1981). The diameter of $F_0$ in the membrane can be estimated from these string-like aggregated $F_0F_1$ ATPase molecules. Boekema et al. (1988) found a diameter of 6.4 nm. Using the same method, the diameter of chloroplast $F_0$ was found to be 6.2 nm. The height of $F_0$ is 8.9 nm.

On the basis of biochemical studies, two models have been proposed for the arrangement of the approximately 13 copies of the three *E. coli* $F_0$ ATP synthase subunits. In the model of Cox et al. (1986) one subunit a and two subunits b are placed within a ring of subunit c copies. In the model of Sebald et al. (1987) subunit a is situated on the periphery of the subunit c multimer. Recently, a multimeric complex of this subunit c was isolated from chloroplast ATP synthase (where it is called 'III') (Fromme et al., 1987a). It has a diameter of 6.2 nm and a height of 6.4 nm and most likely contains 12 subunits. Interestingly, the diameter is similar to that of $F_0$, which could support the model of Cox for the chloroplast enzyme. It is, however, not known how much structural similarity mitochondrial $F_0$ has with the bacterial and chloroplast systems. Since the mitochondrial subunits a, b and c have sequence homologies with their counterparts of the other systems, at least some similarity can be expected. Mitochondrial subunit c also has the tendency to form aggregates (Kopecky et al., 1986), but an aggregate similar to the one of chloroplasts has not yet been found.

F. Orientation of $F_0$ and $F_1$ and arrangement of $F_0F_1$ in situ

If we take the concept of the flattened trigonal antiprism as the overall structure of the $F_1$ part, then there are two principally different ways of the $F_1$ parts becoming attached to the $F_0$ parts. The first possibility is that the hexamer is arranged vertically to $F_0$. Tsurusen et al. (1987) found, by averaging over 20 projections, that $F_1$ is oriented with its hexagonal profile perpendicular to the membrane. The other possibility is that the hexagonal profile is parallel to the membrane (or $F_0$), as in a mushroom. Figure 15 taken from Boekema et al. (unpublished results) points to the latter possibility. A large number of $F_1$ parts in isolated $F_0F_1$ complexes are oriented with their smallest sides
perpendicular to $F_o$. Since molecules in this side-view position are much more unstable on the carbon support film than molecules in the hexagonal projection, the finding that over 50% of the attached $F_i$ parts are in this position strongly points to the latter possibility.

Nevertheless, it is always possible that rearrangements take place. Moreover, conformational changes during the catalytic process occur. Although the tripartite ATP synthase is now widely accepted in the field of bioenergetics, the appearance of the $F_oF_i$ ATPase in situ has been in dispute for a long time. Some investigators propose that $F_i$ does not stick out from the membrane into the inner mitochondrial matrix, in a way that would be expected from negatively stained specimens (Sjöstrand, 1985). Wainio (1985) summarizes 40 papers, in which membranous ATP synthase was examined. In many cases no clear $F_i$ parts or stalks were seen, particularly if freeze-fracture methods were applied to study the inner mitochondrial membrane. However, recent results of Steinbrecht (1986) obtained with cryofixated and freeze-substituted mitochondria clearly show the $F_i$ knobs. Moreover, the appearance of a stalk is not an artifact of the negative staining technique, since Gogol et al. (1987) were able to demonstrate the stalk in unstained, frozen-hydrated specimens. In our opinion, the main reason for not always seeing the $F_i$ and the stalk in freeze-fracture studies could be the fact that other hydrophilic proteins are loosely associated with the mitochondrial inner membrane, shielding off the $F_i$ parts.
V. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The results of Section IV can be summarized in a simple ATP synthase model (Fig. 17). This model implies that either the \( \alpha \) or the \( \beta \) subunits must be closer to the membrane. The work of Gao and Bauerlein (1987) indicates that the \( \alpha \) subunits are closer to the membrane. Although the overall structure is more or less clear, important questions need to be clarified. First, the number and the arrangement of the subunits in the \( F_0 \) part must be known. Second, the exact shape of \( F_0 \), and particularly the shape of the large subunits needs to be elucidated. On the basis of fluorescence resonance energy transfer measurements by McCarty and Hammes (1987), a model was presented showing large oblong subunits. Such 'banana-shaped' subunits, which are also presented in the many fantasy models (e.g. Walker et al., 1982), are very unlikely in view of the electron microscopical results, although the large subunits do not need to be exactly spherical. The third and most interesting central question is on the changes in the structure that take place during the different steps in the synthesis of ATP. It can now be taken as proven that the energy transmitted to the ATP synthase is used to induce a conformational change in the latter enzyme, in such a way as to bring about the energy-requiring dissociation of already synthesized ATP (Penefsky, 1985 and reviewed in Slater, 1987). But the way in which the three parts of the ATP synthase are involved is completely unknown. It is rather puzzling that such a long distance exists between the catalytic sites, which are on the interface of the \( \alpha \) and \( \beta \) subunits and the \( F_0 \) part where the proton movements occur, which, according to Mitchell's theory (1961), is the driving force for the synthesis of ATP. Perhaps alternative mechanisms such as the collision hypothesis formulated by Herweijer et al. (1985) are more realistic in describing the mechanism of ATP synthesis. It would bring the complexes I and V close together, not only in the artificial way treated in this paper, but in a useful way for energy conversion.

Acknowledgements—E.J.B. wishes to thank Prof. Dr E. Zeitler for his continuous support of this work. We acknowledge the contribution of Drs S. P. J. Albracht and J. A. Berden to this work, both at the B.C.P. Jansen Institute, Department of Biochemistry, in Amsterdam. We are grateful to Drs Hatefi, Leonard and Tsuprun, who kindly gave permission to use their figures. We thank Mr K. Gilissen for printing the micrographs. These investigations have been supported by the Netherlands Organization for Chemical Research (SON) with financial aid from the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO) and by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (Sonderforschungsbereich 312).

REFERENCES


Fromme, P., Boekema, E. J. and Gräber, P., 1987a. Isolation and characterization of a supramolecular complex of sub-


