

University of Groningen

Learning an L2 and L3 at the same time: Help or hinder?

Huang, Ting

DOI:
[10.33612/diss.135925259](https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.135925259)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2020

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):
Huang, T. (2020). *Learning an L2 and L3 at the same time: Help or hinder?*.
<https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.135925259>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

**Learning an L2 and L3 at the same time:
Help or hinder?**

Ting Huang



**university of
 groningen**

faculty of arts

CLCG

The research reported in this thesis has been carried out under the auspices of the Center for Language and Cognition Groningen (CLCG) of the Faculty of Arts of the University of Groningen.



Groningen Dissertations in Linguistics 187

Cover design: Gildeprint, The Netherlands

Printed by: Gildeprint | www.Gildeprint.nl



university of
 groningen

Learning an L2 and L3 at the same time: Help or hinder?

PhD thesis

to obtain the degree of PhD at the
 University of Groningen
 on the authority of the
 Rector Magnificus Prof. C. Wijmenga
 and in accordance with
 the decision by the College of Deans.

This thesis will be defended in public on

Monday 19 October 2020 at 9.00 hours

by

Ting Huang

born on 18 July 1990
 in Sichuan, China

Supervisor

Prof. M.H. Verspoor

Co-supervisor

Dr. R.G.A. Steinkrauss

Assessment Committee

Prof. Y. Zheng

Prof. Z. Dörnyei

Prof. W.M. Lowie

Acknowledgment

Ten years ago, I was enrolled in the bi-foreign-language program at the Taiyuan University of Technology for my undergraduate study. I and my peer students were the second class enrolled in this program ever since its establishment in 2009. During those undergraduate years, I had a difficult time keeping the balance between English and Japanese. Compared to English majors, we English and Japanese majors had much less time for English outside of the classroom because we had Japanese to cater to. Therefore, I was constantly doubting whether it was the right decision to choose this program. I feel proud that I can investigate this phenomenon later on in a Ph.D. project. Now I have an answer to my doubts about choosing to learn two foreign languages at the same time: It was the right decision.

Such a conclusion is drawn after years of questioning, exploring, and hard working. I am lucky that I was encouraged and supported by many along this journey. My greatest and deepest gratitude goes to my supervisors, prof. Marjolijn Verspoor and dr. Rasmus Steinkrauss, without their help, it is not possible to finish this project. If a Ph.D. is a long voyage full of both fulfilling and frustrating moments, then Marjolijn has been the Captain of our crew, keeping us sail in the right direction. Rasmus has been the Mate of our team, guiding me, the sailor, from day to day. They not only guide me in designing and carrying out the research, writing and publishing the work, but also encourage and inspire me in many aspects. In daily life, Rasmus is also a dear friend whom I trust and can always turn to. The EuroSLA trip to Münster with Marjolijn, Kees, and Sirkku is one of my best memories ever. Along this Ph.D. journey, I have always felt fully supported, which is, I believe, very important for a young researcher to grow.

I am also deeply grateful to prof. Hao Mei, who first introduced me to the field of second language acquisition and recommended the CDST article wrote by de Bot, Lowie, and Verspoor in 2007. This article enlightened me and led me from China to Groningen, the Netherlands. Moreover, I owe my deep gratefulness to my English teachers and Japanese teachers in my undergraduate and master studies. Marianne Geula, my English speaking, and academic writing teacher, knows the strongest parts in me and always believes in me. It is her encouragement and love that made me believe in my capability to pursue a doctoral degree abroad from the very first

Acknowledgment

place. Li Xiuhong, my Japanese teacher, who is also a dear friend, helped me out with my pilot study in 2017. Liu Jingfeng, Wu Ting, Yang Jie, and Zhang Jianying, supported me unconditionally during the one year of data collection. Without them, I could not imagine how it is possible to collect an enormous amount of data.

I am grateful to the members of the Ph.D. support group: Ana Pot, Audrey Rouse-Malpat, Bregtje Seton, Floor van den Berg, Giulia Sulis, Hongying Peng, Jelle Brouwer, Loes Groen, Mara van der Ploeg, Marita Everhardt, Pouran Seifi, Sirkku Lesonen, Steven Gilbers, Susanne Dekker, Tim, Vass Verkhodanova, and Wim Gombert. I would like to thank them for their insightful feedback and suggestions on the designing of my study, my papers, and my presentation skills, etc. I would also like to thank the (former) staff members of the Department of Applied Linguistics, prof. Kees de Bot, prof. Marije Michel, prof. Merel Keijzer, and prof. Wander Lowie, for creating a supportive and open atmosphere for the Ph.D. students. My special thanks go to dr. Hanneke Loerts, who is one of the co-authors of my first paper, for her perceptive insights on literature review writing and data analyses.

I would like to express my sincere appreciation for my reading committee, prof. Wander Lowie, prof. Zheng Yongyan, and prof. Zoltán Dörnyei, for spending time reading my dissertation and giving valuable feedback and comments. With these excellent insights, I can inspect my study from perspectives that I may have not noticed, and therefore improve the whole dissertation to a higher level in the future.

My friends in Groningen made my life colorful and enjoyable. I would like to thank Sirkku Lesonen, my Finnish girl. Like we always say: Our life would be much darker without each other. I want to thank Giulia Sulis and Susanne Dekker, the sweetest Italian girl and Dutch girl I have ever known, for all the fun things we did together and for the support and encouragement. I would like to thank Hou Junping and Pouran Seifi, for helping me a lot when I first arrived here and had a difficult time going through culture shock. I would like to thank all the Ph.D. students working or worked in Rode Weeshuisstraat 12 for maintaining a nice atmosphere in the building. I am grateful for the wonderful people I shared office with over the four years, Dymphi van der Hoeven, Hou Junping, Harm Timmerman, Rob Ahlers, Sirkku Lesonen, Suzanne Dekker.

I would also like to thank my friends from the Chinese community in Groningen: Feng Xiangyuan, He Kun, Hong Yiyi, Jiang Bin, Jiao Junjie, Sun Yu, Wang Miao, Wang Xing, Wang Yingruo, Wei Jiacong, Xu Qi, and Yu Hanjing. I would express my deep thanks to Li Minghui,

with whom I shared all my tears and laughs, with whom I had all kinds of interesting conversations, and from whom I learned a lot. I would like to thank Ke Huimin and Luo Yu, whom I met at the Applied Linguistics master course 2016, and remained as good friends since then. Ke Huimin is the bravest girl I have ever met, from whom I am always inspired. I am grateful to the wonderful girls, Peng Hongying, Wang Yingjie, and Zhou Ying, for making Marktstraat 2 a cozy place to live. I am also grateful for the friendship with Liu Hongyun and Zhang Hongyu. I treasure the great memories we three share. I also enjoyed the time with the friends I made in the ice-skating course, swimming lessons, and Groningen Chinese Choir, and special thanks go to Li Qinghong and Gao Li

The beginning of 2020 was difficult for everyone due to COVID-19. During the 'intellectual lockdown' in The Netherlands, I went through a very stressful period revising two articles, writing one new article, and finishing the whole dissertation. I want to thank the family and friends in China who stayed in touch with me, especially, Luo Qin, Song Yongjiao, Wang Qi, and other friends in our Wechat group(青葱岁月). Many thanks go to Reinoud Sluijk and Zhou Ying, who kept me companied in this difficult period. And I would like to express my special gratitude to Reinoud Sluijk for his support and helping with the Dutch abstract and summary of this dissertation.

最后，我要感谢我的父母，我最亲爱的人。我的性格里有着父亲的乐观与豁达，以及母亲的坚韧与勤恳。正是这些品质以及父母对我无私的爱与支持让我在人生的道路上阔步向前，无惧无畏，无怨无悔。

Perpignan, France

July 2020

黄婷(Huang Ting)

Contents

Acknowledgment.....	v
Contents	ix
List of figures.....	xiii
List of tables	xiv
CHAPTER.1.....	1
1.1 Bi-foreign-language programs in China.....	2
1.2 Language learning as a complex and dynamic process.....	3
1.3 Competition for resources and variability in language development	4
1.4 Outline of the chapters	5
1.4.1 Data collection.....	6
1.4.2 Chapter 2	7
1.4.3 Chapter 3	8
1.4.4 Chapter 4	9
1.4.5 Chapter 5	10
1.4.6 Chapter 6	11
CHAPTER.2.....	13
2.1 Introduction.....	14
2.2 Background literature	15
2.3 Methodology.....	18
2.3.1 Participants	18
2.3.2 Data collection procedure.....	19
2.3.3 Holistic rating rubric	20
2.3.4 Rating procedure and intra-rater reliability	22
2.4 Analysis.....	22
2.5 Results.....	23
2.5.1 Gain scores in each group.....	23

Contents

2.5.2 Variability in the developmental process in two groups	24
2.6 Discussion	25
2.6.1 Improvement in CAFIC holistic scores in the two groups	25
2.6.2 Different degrees of variability between L2+L3 and L2 learners regarding fluency	27
2.7 Conclusion and limitations	29
CHAPTER.3.....	31
3.1 Introduction.....	32
3.2 Literature background	33
3.2.1 Cognitive and affective ID factors in L2 studies	33
3.2.2 Motivation and L2 Motivational Self System	36
3.2.3 Variability.....	37
3.3 Methodology.....	38
3.3.1 Participants	39
3.3.2 Language aptitude measures	39
3.3.3 Working memory measures	40
3.3.4 L2 learning motivation.....	41
3.3.5 Variability operationalization	42
3.3.6 L2 writing proficiency measures.....	42
3.4 Analysis.....	44
3.5 Results.....	44
3.5.1 Analysis 1	45
3.5.2 Analysis 2.....	46
3.5.3 Analysis 3.....	46
3.6 Discussion	47
3.7 Conclusion and limitations	53
CHAPTER.4.....	55
L2 and L3 Learning, Language Aptitude, and Working Memory	55
4.1 Introduction.....	56
4.2 Background	57
4.2.1 The definition and components of LA and WM.....	57
4.2.2 The effect of LA and WM on language learning	58
4.2.3 Effects of multiple languages learning on LA and WM	59

4.2.4 LA and WM as changeable cognitive abilities	60
4.3 Methodology.....	63
4.3.1 Participants	63
4.3.2 Instruments	64
4.3.3 Procedures	66
4.4 Analyses	67
4.5 Results.....	68
4.5.1 The preliminary analysis of English proficiency	68
4.5.2 Changeability of LA and WM.....	69
4.5.3 Language learning intensity effects on LA and WM	70
4.6 Discussion	71
4.6.1 The improvement in LA and WM.....	71
4.6.2 The effect of learning two foreign languages simultaneously on WM	73
4.7 Conclusion and limitations	75
CHAPTER.5.....	77
5.1 Introduction.....	78
5.2 Literature background.....	78
5.3 Methodology.....	84
5.3.1 Participants	84
5.3.2 Instruments	85
5.4 Analyses	87
5.5 Results.....	89
5.6 Discussion	95
5.6.1 Motivation in E-LOTE majors versus English majors.....	95
5.6.2 LOTE versus English motivation in E-LOTE majors.....	97
5.7 Conclusion and limitations	100
CHAPTER.6.....	103
6.1 Brief summary of the main findings of the four studies	104
6.1.1 Study 1. Simultaneous L2 and L3 learning: Help or hinder learning?	104
6.1.2 Study 2. Do learners with higher degrees of variability progress more?	105
6.1.3 Study 3. Language aptitude and working memory: stable or dynamic?.....	107
6.1.4 Study 4. Does motivation differ learner groups and languages? And does motivation change over time?	109

Contents

6.2 Implications	111
6.2.1 Theoretical implication	111
6.2.2 Pedagogical implications.....	113
6.3 Limitations and future directions.....	115
6.4 Conclusions.....	118
Bibliography	121
Appendix A.....	141
Appendix B.....	143
Appendix C.....	145
Appendix D	159
Nederlandse samenvatting	163
Curriculum vitae.....	167
Groningen dissertations in linguistics (GRODIL)	169

List of figures

Figure 2.1: Low vs. high variability in fluency.....	28
Figure 3.1: General improvement in L2 writing proficiency.....	45
Figure 3.2: The moving min-max graph of lowest degree of variability: Student A.....	50
Figure 3.3: The moving min-max graph of highest degree of variability: Student B.....	50
Figure 4.1: Automatic version of operation span task.....	66
Figure 5.1: Data overview for E-LOTE learners vs English learners	89
Figure 5.2: E-LOTE learners vs. English learners in English motivation at pre-test.....	90
Figure 5.3: Different development in English motivation between E-LOTE and English learners.....	91
Figure 5.4: Data overview for E-LOTE learners' LOTE and English motivation	92
Figure 5.5: Correlation plots with Loess smoothing curve for LOTE and English motivation at pre-test.....	93
Figure 5.6: Differences between LOTE and English motivation at pre-test	94
Figure 5.7: Different development in LOTE and English motivation.....	95
Figure 6.1: Low variability vs. high variability in fluency.....	106

List of tables

Table 1.1: Sample size of each independent study	6
Table 1.2: Collection time for each type of data	7
Table 2.1: Groups and amount of language instruction time	19
Table 2.2: The dataset	20
Table 2.3: Correlation between the first and second rating of the 50 texts	22
Table 2.4: The differences on total proficiency gain scores among two groups	24
Table 2.5: The differences in gain scores in complexity between two groups among second year students.....	24
Table 3.1: Composites of motivational variables with Cronbach alpha coefficients.....	41
Table 3.2: Principal component analysis on the nine motivation factors	42
Table 3.3: Writing tasks	43
Table 3.4: Multiple linear regression analysis on the final L2 writing proficiency	46
Table 3.5: Multiple linear regression analysis on the L2 writing proficiency gains	47
Table 3.6: Significant Correlations between CoV and Two Motivational Factors	52
Table 4.1: Participant groups and the type and amount of instruction	64
Table 4.2: Initial status and development of writing proficiency	69
Table 4.3: Initial status and development of speaking proficiency	69
Table 4.4: Results for main effect of testing time for the first-year students	70
Table 4.5: Results for main effect of testing time for the second-year students.....	70
Table 4.6: ANCOVA results and descriptive statistics for language learning intensity effect on WM among the first-year students.....	71
Table 5.1: Participants.....	85
Table 5.2: Details of the ten components of the motivation questionnaire	86
Table 5.3: Composites of motivation factors with Cronbach Alpha coefficients.....	87
Table 5.4: Research questions.....	88