IIICONFRONTING THE EUROPEAN CHALLENGE:
discourses in 19th century African political thought

And why should not the same race who governed Egypt, attacked the most famous and flourishing city - Rome, who had her churches, her universities, and her repositories of learning and science, once more stand on their legs and endeavour to raise their characters in the scale of the civilised world?\[^{58}\]

The author who poses this rhetorical question is discussing the "Progressive advancement of the negro race under civilising influence." In the preceding sections of the book he has severely criticised the racist anthropological theories of his time and has introduced the reader to his conception of Africa's future. In the following sections, he makes detailed suggestions about the political institutions which could create a series of independent states in West Africa. The book was published in the year 1868 and its author was James Africanus Beale Horton.

There is some irony in launching a study of African political thought with a quote from the African intellectual probably most criticized for being 'un-African', 'hypnotised', 'irretrievably enchanted by Western culture', an 'unrepentant anglophile', 'hybridized' and 'transmogrified'.\[^{59}\] And in view of the historical facts, there can be little doubt that Horton was in fact rather unrepresentative of African political thought of his age, namely the nineteenth century. His discourse, focusing on Africa's answer to the European challenge, can be considered representative only for a small circle of intellectuals in a few coastal enclaves on the West African coast and in one particular decade.

But times were changing at great speed. A few decades after the 1860s, European domination expanded from the enclaves to engulp almost the entire African continent. What I termed earlier "the great confrontation" between Africa and the powerful West became the dominant political experience, and Horton's endeavour of finding an answer to the confrontation became the principal problem for African political thought. Political thought in the enclaves constitutes, with hindsight, early examples of a discussion centred on a new theme. In fact, the various strategies for an African response to the European challenge which were proposed during these discussions reappeared in several forms throughout the more than hundred years that followed.

At first sight, the opening quote from Horton seems to betray a 'modernist' bias of the present study. In fact, however, the quote indicates the study's specific historical focus on African political thought in the age of confrontation between Africa and the West. This chapter reconstructs the first generation of discourses, covering generally the period until colonial rule became fully established around 1900. For this purpose, the chapter sketches

\[^{58}\]Horton 1868, p. 67  
\[^{59}\]see e.g. Ayandele 1971
the particular historical context of the West African enclaves (III.1), before providing a detailed reconstruction of the major variants of discourse (III.2, 3, and 4).

The historical context of the West African enclaves

The nineteenth century was an exceptionally turbulent age in African history. The established political and economic structures were overturned, Islam and Christianity gained influence, and Western powers and ideas which remained in the margin of the physical and intellectual landscape at the beginning of the nineteenth century occupied the centre at its close.

The nineteenth century witnessed the clustering of a wide variety of smaller political units, such as kingdoms, into a limited number of states. These included the Fulani empire of Sokoto, the Tokolor, the Mandinka, and Asante empires in West Africa, as well as a number of large kingdoms in East and Central Africa. Such states, deriving their power mainly from the control over trade-routes and from the possibility of obtaining modern armament, would be powerful trade partners who could not be challenged easily by European powers. Their intrinsic weakness, however, was the limited degree to which the tributary peripheral units identified with the power centre. This made it possible for relatively small European military forces to break them up

---

60 see e.g. Okoth 1980, Fage 1978, Oliver 1991. On African political systems, see Fortes & Evans-Pritchard 1940, and for concise descriptions on central African political systems, see Vansina 1992a and 1992b.

61 These states needed to create an overall ideology for binding the enlarged kingdom into a nation. See for the case of Asante McCaskie 1990.
and then confront and subjugate them.\textsuperscript{62}

Western powers had occupied trading posts along the African coast, such as Saint Louis, Christiansborg, Elmina and Goree, from the 15th century onwards. In connection to the slave-trade, with its height in the 18th and 19th centuries, these trading posts acquired great importance. The forts constituted the terminal stations of a trade line, involving strong inland African political units which had gained control over the hunting and trading of slaves. The areas where the slaves were finally taken from, however, suffered large-scale devastation.

From a global perspective, the slave trade was part of the 'South Atlantic System', which was a triangular trade carrying slaves to the plantations in the Americas, plantation products, especially sugar, to European markets, and arms and other products back to Africa again. This highly profitable trade, described by Marx as one of the main sources of Western European 'original accumulation', was affected by the American War of Independence. Britain lost its plantations and voices were raised to initiate a plantation economy on African soil, while simultaneously frustrating the slave trade in order to interrupt the supply of labour to the Americans, who were now competitors. Consequently, the disruption of the triangular trade inspired a new imperial interest in Africa, an interest in 'legitimate trade' (non slave trade).

Within the movement for the abolition of the slave trade, these imperial interests were combined with the humanitarian inspiration deriving from the French revolution and from the evangelical revolution in the Church of England. \textit{Abolitionism} thus became a strong and successful pressure group against slavery. Prominent public figures in Britain, such as Granville Sharp and Wilberforce, were involved. The Abolitionists were successful in Britain in 1807, in France in 1848, and in the USA in 1808 and in 1865. In 1833 abolition was extended to all British territories.\textsuperscript{63} Several additional measures were taken as well, such as the stationing of a naval squadron to intercept slave ships and diplomatic action pushing countries to follow the British example in suppressing the slave trade.

Especially in the first half of the nineteenth century, this Abolitionist or Humanitarian movement was a major influence on British colonial politics and shaped the intellectual and political background of most Anglophone African theorists. The most tangible result, however, was the founding of the influential Sierra Leone colony, meant for the repatriation of destitute former black slaves from England. Despite the fact that almost no one survived of a first group of black 'resettlers' on the coast of Sierra Leone in 1787, more arrived in the

\textsuperscript{62} The typical strategy would be to find local allies by using existing political divisions. A strategy also used by e.g. Cortez in challenging the mighty Aztec empire with his small army (Todorov 1982). A more basic cause of the decline of strong African states was the fact that the rapid development of armament in the 19th century took place outside Africa and thus constantly favoured the Europeans and coastal African powers over inland states.

\textsuperscript{63} The Dutch followed only in 1863.
following years. Most notable were the 'Nova Scotians', ex-slaves, who had supported the British during the American War of Independence and had been moved first to Nova Scotia in America before being shipped to Sierra Leone. This large community, looking for liberty and constitutional government, represented an early beginning of Western-type political activity in Sierra Leone.\textsuperscript{64}

British policy towards West Africa remained indecisive for most of the century. The Humanitarian lobby pushed for imperial penetration inland, but actual schemes were rarely successful, partly owing to the enormous loss of life due to tropical illnesses. West Africa gained the reputation of being the 'White Man's grave'. Only in the third quarter of the century, after the use of quinine became common, and after the second Ashanti war (1874), colonial expansion accelerated in this part of the globe. The increased competition between European powers due to their industrial expansion, creating the need for control over raw materials and markets, is the key background feature at this point. \textit{The Scramble for Africa} and the Berlin Conference in 1884/5, left Africa almost completely under colonial domination by the turn of the century.

In the USA, the repatriation of free slaves was already promoted by 1791. The first African-American settlers arrived in West Africa in 1815\textsuperscript{65}. Their settlement called Liberia, adjacent to Sierra Leone, actually became independent in 1847. It adopted American political ideals and institutions. From the outset, marked differences arose within Liberia between the 'tribal' Africans who originated in these areas and the immigrant ex-slaves. There were conflicts over land, as well as cultural conflicts, partly resulting from the fact that the Christian, and often 'whiter', immigrants felt far superior to the indigenous population.

During the nineteenth century, American-African relations remained limited to Liberia. The question of remigration to Africa was a subject of constant debate in African-American organisations, especially because the \textit{American Colonisation Society} included white racialists who were interested in what they called 'solving the Negro problem'. The main inspiration of the various Back-to-Africa movements, however, was the Pan-Negroist ideal, brought to Africa by such prominent African-American immigrants as Alexander Crummell, Edward Wilmot Blyden and Orishatuké Faduma (W.J.Davies). Actual numbers of black returnees to Liberia remained limited and corresponded quite clearly with the periods of intensified hardship for African-Americans under American racism.\textsuperscript{66}

In Sierra Leone specific circumstances occurred. The British employed war-vessels to intercept slave ships. When caught, such ships were taken to

\textsuperscript{64}For the exceptional history of Sierra Leone, see Fyfe 1962. Also Hair 1967, July 1968 chapter 3, and Wyse 1989.
\textsuperscript{65}For more details see Lynch, 1967 ch.I
\textsuperscript{66}see Lynch 1967, chapter II and III.
Freetown in Sierra Leone and the slaves, the 'recaptives' as they were called, were set free to be received by the Church Missionary Society. In this way, after 1800, the black settlers from Britain and America were quickly outnumbered by Africans without the New World experience of slavery and racism, but with the traumatic experience of being caught (mostly by Africans) and liberated (by the British). The hard acculturation-process under the Church Missionary Society invested the recaptives with a Western cultural background and related personal and political ideals. In this way, Sierra Leone became a breeding place of a black, English speaking, 'Creole' intelligentsia, which, as skilled personnel in the colonial or missionary administrations, spread along the coast of West and Middle Africa for a large part of the nineteenth century. Sierra Leone, it was sometimes said, was "the leaven of the West African dough."\textsuperscript{67}

The quick adaptation of the Creole community to 'modern' culture and society, turning them into 'black Europeans', made a development towards self-government, similar to that of Canada or Australia, a natural expectation. During the 1860s, the call for self-determination within the Creole community became louder. An interesting example is the controversy about the handing over of church-work to Africans.\textsuperscript{68} Since the establishment of Sierra Leone, the British Church Missionary Society (CMS) controlled the centre of affairs. Under its Honourary Secretary Henry Venn, however, there was a strong voice in the CMS for working towards an independent African church: a church for Africa, run by Africans. The Native Church Pastorate operated since 1861, which meant that parishes were managed by Africans, under European church authorities. The Africans, especially those in the Sierra Leone Native Association, were demanding more African representation in the church in order to indigenize Christianity and change the church 'from within' into an African church.\textsuperscript{69}

The movement towards greater African control in Sierra Leone affairs also resulted in a lively interest in African cultures and languages. The Creoles, or Krio, as English speakers disclosed the sophistication of African languages and cultures and boosted the idea of Africa's own history and high culture. The issue of self-government arose on a number of directly political issues as well, such as in the case of the Fanti Federation (see below).

A reverse development was taking place on the European side. In the second half of the nineteenth century, Africans were depicted as being essentially incapable of managing their own affairs, African cultures were

\textsuperscript{67}Quote from Ayandele 1971, p. 692. Various definitions of 'Creole' are used. Akintola Wyse, in The Krio of Sierra Leone, uses "born away from home". In Sierra Leone the term indicates the 'recaptives' and their descendants. Elsewhere in West Africa they are known as Saros or Akus. (See e.g. Dixon-Fyle 1989)

\textsuperscript{68}Another example is the appointment of the first African bishop Ajayi Crowther.

\textsuperscript{69}With the arrival of Edward Blyden in Sierra Leone the controversy between the Africans and the conservative church authorities was particularly heated. The controversy is beautifully described in Lynch 1964.
presented as 'primitive' and 'savage', and a racial paradigm for the human sciences became established.\textsuperscript{70} The Krio community in Sierra Leone was attacked for being an example not of the African capacity to become modern man, but of 'savages posturing as Europeans'. The racist movement, in combination with the more aggressive stage of colonialism in the last quarter of the nineteenth century, put the Africanist movement on the defensive. Educated Africans were pushed out of all influential positions in colonial and missionary administrations, bringing the period of 'Mid-Victorian optimism' to an end.

Not surprisingly, the first intellectuals to discuss the issue of confrontation with the West are found in the coastal settlements where the powerful European presence became established earliest. The settlements constituted a lively setting. Although European imperial rule was fully accepted, Africans challenged colonial and Church paternalism, expressing great hopes of "Africa soon stretching her hands out to God" and aspiring for a greater degree of self-government. Interestingly, these hopes were combined with the anguish of seriously doubting their own newly shaped identities, aggravated by the premature deaths of eminent persons in their community.\textsuperscript{72}

A number of the greatest African intellectuals of the nineteenth century, such as Africanus Horton, Edward Wilmot Blyden, and James Johnson, operated in this world. They were certainly not the only intellectuals on the vast African continent. With hindsight, however, they are the direct ancestors of the African political discourses in the century that followed.

My search for the dilemmas, proposed solutions and models of political thought in the era of confrontation, does not start, therefore, in the great royal courts of African empires, nor 'under the tree' where the council of elders meets, but in the curious coastal spots of what could be called 'proto-globalization'. My source materials should not be the great repositories of indigenous knowledge, such as Ifa, but the profane political deliberations of individual Africans, expressed, for instance, in the speeches at Liberia's

\textsuperscript{70}Richard Burton's \textit{Wandering in West Africa} of 1863 was very influential in propagating racism. One of the most impressive books on the development of the racist paradigm is Curtin 1964.

\textsuperscript{71}Hair, 1967, p. 521 describes 'Africanism' as "movements that seek the attainment of a government dominated by Africans and expressing in its institutions the characteristic spirit of Africa as interpreted by the modern African."

\textsuperscript{72}July 1968, p. 229-302
independence celebration, in the Church politics of Sierra Leone, in public letters of prominent Africans to the British government, and in the programme of modernization and self-government contained in the Mankessim declaration of the Fanti Federation. Political thought on Africa's future developed at the locations where the confrontation was actually experienced.

**The Discourse of Mid-Victorian Optimism: Africanus Horton**

In retrospect, at least three key events in the 1860s and 1870s stand out in West African history, namely the proposals for African self-government in the 1865 report of a Select Committee of the British House of Commons, the so-called Fanti Federation of 1870 and the second Ashanti War in 1873/4, nearly won by the Ashanti but instead marking the beginning of massive colonial expansion into Africa. Africanus Horton involved himself with each of these three key events. As one of the most prominent West Africans, son of a recaptive in Sierra Leone and holding a doctorate in Medicine from Edinburgh, he reacted to the Select Committee in his book *West African Countries and Peoples* (1868) and he defended the Fanti-Federation in his *Letters on the Political Condition of the Gold Coast* (1970). An analysis of Horton's interventions can be a guide to understanding the discourse of mid-Victorian Krio optimism.

After the first Ashanti war of 1863, in which the British and Fanti armies were defeated by the Ashanti, the British contemplated a complete retreat from West Africa. In 1865, a Select Committee of the British House of Commons drew up a report on the future of the West Africa settlements, which was accepted by the House. This report proposed the gradual retirement of the British from West Africa. The policy should be to encourage in the native the exercise of those qualities which may render it possible for us more and more to transfer to the natives the administrations of all the Governments, with a view to our ultimate withdrawal from all, except probably Sierra Leone.

The expensive responsibilities in a part of the world so often described as the 'White-man's Grave', would have to terminate. In Africa, of course, the perception of the Select Committee report was quite different from that in Britain. Horton was greatly inspired by the perspective, heralded the adoption by the British of "that great principle of establishing independent African nationalities as independent as the present

---

73 This curious event of a British parliamentary commission proposing self-government (and the government accepting the advise) resulted from conservatives (wanting to pull out of Africa) and humanitarians (sympathetic towards African self-rule) arriving to the same conclusion in this case. From a broader perspective, the event shows how completely different the political and intellectual situation was one decade later. Colonial occupation, in the way it actually happened, was hardly conceivable in the 1860s.
Liberian Government." Horton wrote *West African Countries and Peoples* (1868), outlining possible political arrangements for new states in West Africa as a blueprint for actual implementation of the report's proposals.

The major political event in the aftermath of the Select Committee report was the establishment of the *Fanti-Federation* in 1870, a political federation unifying the many units within the coastal region of what is now Ghana. Political turmoil around the exchange of trading forts between the British and the Dutch and the peril of the powerful Ashanti in the north triggered this political unity. The local British administration, however, saw the Federation as an illegal threat to its authority and frustrated it wherever it could, even by arresting and humiliating its leaders.

Horton intervened again, this time by publishing his correspondence with the Colonial Office in which he demanded recognition of the Fanti-Federation (his book *Letters on the Political Condition of the Gold Coast* of 1870). Horton's immediate superiors in West Africa were furious and wanted him to be transferred, but he was protected by the London Colonial Office. However, Horton's (and others') pleas for recognition of the Federation were not successful. The constant insults against 'mulattoes' and 'educated natives' as part of the racist propaganda of those decades supplied easy justifications for distrusting the Federation. Lord Kimberley, British Secretary of State, suggested to privilege the 'hereditary chiefs only and endeavour as far as possible to govern through them.' Such a policy meant pushing out the 'mulattoes', West Indians, and educated Africans who were often prominently present in the administration. It also helped to create what later became a classical division in West African politics between educated elites and traditional rulers.

British presence in the Gold Coast could still have come to an end in the 1873-74 second Ashanti war. The Ashanti initially swept away the British-loyal forces almost completely but failed to capture their main target, the Elmina Fort on the coast. The British could take revenge. They sent a purely white army-force under general Worseley which in record time penetrated north, destroyed the Ashanti-capital Kumasi and returned to the coast without even being attacked by the Ashanti army. This military operation was directly reported by the British and American media and boosted racist superiority sentiments. Any hopes for experiments such as the Fanti-Federation had to be buried.

---

74 Horton 1868, p. 74
75 Kimble 1963, p.159-160. Ironically, it was the humanitarian-oriented friend of the oppressed John Pope Hennesy who, as temporary British governor in West Africa, failed to support effectively the Fanti-Federation and directed policies to suit the opposite agenda of making the coastal area into a colony. By 1872 the Federation was already declining.
76 Race has not always been a major factor in British colonial relations. Sierra Leone has had an African West Indian governor, William Ferguson, and a Chief Justice, John Carr. The British historian Chr. Fyfe stated that the Sierra Leoneans: "did not feel themselves in a "colonial situation" throughout most of the nineteenth century (Fyfe 1972, p. 10). See Mair 1970, especially p. 183, on the changing relations between the 'educated elite' and the chiefs.
Horton participated in the Ashanti wars as an army doctor. In both cases, he was left with the black, partly West Indian, soldiers at the Ashanti border during the rainy season. Neglected by the army command, he witnessed a record number of his soldiers die under these extremely unhealthy conditions before they were finally called back to the coast. While many of Horton's white military colleagues where specially decorated, his work was never rewarded.\(^{77}\)

The historical events recorded here provide a key to understanding the discourse of mid-Victorian optimism. Before turning to the discourse itself, let me consider one other aspect, namely the biographical. The West African Settlements created conditions for a number of Africans to advance rapidly. The rocketing careers of individual Krios, such as Samuel Lewis, Bishop Ajayi Crowther, Bishop James Johnson, William "Independent" Grant, G.G.M. Nicol, and Africanus Horton, shaped their views on the possibilities of African progress. Let me look at the case of J.A.B. Horton as one of the most outspoken Krio biographies.\(^{78}\)

James Beale Horton was born in 1835 from 'recaptive' parents in the village Gloucester in Sierra Leone. His father and mother had been set free from a slave ship. The recaptives were, as Horton perceived it, "On their arrival in Sierra Leone, landed naked and in a state of abject rudeness and poverty, without the least knowledge of civilization...."\(^{79}\) Energetic missionary effort had Christianized and educated them. They had become part of "a nation of free black Christians"\(^{80}\) and a very successful nation at that. In his sketch of the small settler village Gloucester, the Nigerian historian Ayandele, mentions that by 1821 missionary efforts had been so effective that "500 out of a total population of 720 were able to read their Testaments,"\(^{81}\) a literacy rate not easily matched by any other place in the world in the 1820s.

In Horton's youth, African religious and social life forms became dominant again in Gloucester. The minority Christians called themselves the 'righteous' and avoided all intercourse, even greetings, with the 'non-righteous'. Horton's outlook was shaped by strict puritanism. He was active in social affairs all his life, praised for his 'urbane and suave disposition', but also practising total abstinence from alcohol.\(^{82}\)

After attending Fourah Bay College in Freetown, Sierra Leone, he was offered the exceptional chance of studying medicine in London in order to prepare for service in the British West African forces. When moving from King's College in London to the University of Edinburgh to take a medical

\(^{77}\) see Fyfe 1972, pp. 52-55 and 115-118 on Horton's role in the Ashanti wars.

\(^{78}\) Samuel Lewis, African member of the Legislative Council, would be another good case. There is excellent historical work on Horton: Nicol 1969; Fyfe 1972; July 1966 and 1968, chapter 6; Gwam 1964.

\(^{79}\) Horton 1868, p.60

\(^{80}\) Quoted in Fyfe, 1972, p. 9 from a Public Record Office from 1934.

\(^{81}\) Ayandele 1968, p. 6

\(^{82}\) See Ayandele 1968
doctorate, he added "Africanus" to his name. He was admitted into the British army as staff surgeon in West Africa, making him the highest ranking African in British army service. Horton served at many places along the West African 'Coast', acquiring extensive knowledge of the geological, economic, social and political conditions in the coastal zone, and participating according to what his position allowed, in political matters. After retirement, he resettled in Freetown, becoming active in the economic field by starting several companies and establishing the first West African bank called the Commercial Bank of West Africa. Horton died suddenly in 1883.

The details of Horton's biography and those of other prominent Krios and educated elites in his time are fascinating. At this point, however, I want to draw attention to only one distinguishing aspect of their lives, namely that they represent rocketing careers. From humble backgrounds, with missionary help, and through educational advancement, they reached the top-level of contemporary social and academic standing. Their careers refuted in the most concrete form contemporary racial prejudice and they were exemplary for what Africans and Africa could achieve within only one lifetime.

Africanus Horton's body of thought should be analyzed against this background of hope for advancement, prosperity and independence. It exemplifies in all its aspects the fiery and self-conscious discourse of a people who perceive themselves at the threshold of a new and better world.

Horton strongly believed in a universal conception of civilisation and historical advancement,

that mankind, by the knowledge of metallurgy and other useful arts emerge from a primitive state of barbarism, and have gradually brought to themselves the benefits of a civilised life.\(^8\)

The torch of world-historical civilizational progress, however, is not always in the same hands.

Nations rise and fall; the once flourishing and civilised degenerates into a semi-barbarous state; and those who have lived in utter barbarism, after a lapse of time become the standing nation.\(^8\)

The key example for Horton was Britain: at the time of the Romans Britain had existed in a state of hopeless barbarism, yet now it was the cream of civilisation. Horton quoted Cicero: that the ancient Britons went about scantly clothed; they painted their bodies in fantastic fashions, 'offered up human victims to uncouth idols, and lived in hollow trees and rude habitations.'\(^8\)

Atticus advised to a friend "not to buy slaves from Britain on account of their stupidity and their inaptitude to learn music and other accomplishments."\(^8\)

Relating this information to Africa, Horton immediately turned these

\(^{83}\)Horton 1868, p. 1
\(^{84}\)Horton 1868, p. 67
\(^{85}\)Horton 1868, p. 30
\(^{86}\)Horton 1868, p. 30
quotations to advance an argument against British racists:

And, in fact, if the comparison be made between the degree of improvement exhibited by the two countries, history informs us that the present degree of improvement exhibited by the liberated Africans under missionary influence far exceeds that of Britain under Roman influence during a similar period of time.  

Horton's universalist view of cultural development was based upon a quite practical concept of civilisation. To be civilised simply means to be economically advanced, politically and militarily strong and culturally sophisticated. He could, therefore, speak in one sentence of "the christian and industrial regeneration of Africa." Armed with such a concept of civilisation, the task for Africa could be formulated in an equally straightforward manner: to raise the nations of Africa from the debased and degraded state to which they have fallen, both morally and physically, to free them from the bloody and demoralizing influence of beastly superstition; from polygamy; from domestic slavery; from the paralysing effects, as regards productive industry, of customs and institutions which...prevent the creation of that capital by which alone the works necessarily attendant on civilisation can be executed.

Horton assumed that this task could never be accomplished without outside interference and help. To "make an onward step in the career of civilisation" requires contact with already civilised nations. Therefore, he could state: I, amongst a great many others, appreciate any European element that enters Western Africa, whether in the capacity of merchants or pioneers of civilization, or in that of missionaries. As if to prove immediately that this is not a statement of servility, he added: I will never permit any unjust abuse, any unfounded diatribe against the African race, to be ruthlessly lavished on them without repelling or exposing calumny.

Horton's universalist conception of civilisation made him the complete antidote to racial theorizing of his time, which characteristically linked civilisation with race. From what was considered a lack of civilisation in Africa, the racists inferred the incapacity of the African race to civilize. Horton, on the contrary, pointed to environmental causes. He accepted, like the mainstream abolitionist thought in his time, the opinion that Africa was in a state of barbarism, far behind Europe. But he forcefully argued that "it is an incontrovertible logical inference that the difference arises entirely from the influences of external

---

87 Horton 1868, p. 28
88 Horton 1868, p. 274. Horton considered British Christian middle class culture to be the most advanced for his time. But in different times others, e.g. Africans, could supersede the British and set a new standard.
89 Horton 1868, p. VII
90 Horton 1868, p. 6
91 Horton 1868, p. IV
circumstances, Truly- Natura una et communis omnium est." Such circumstances were, for instance, black Africa's isolation through the Sahara desert from the mainstream of world-cultural development, which was supposed to have moved from Persia, to Mesopotamia, Egypt, Greece, Rome and to the Western world.  

Blacks are, biologically and otherwise, as capable of civilisation as whites. In view of the hardships they have survived, one should even say that they are physically fitter. This unswerving attack on the biological assumptions of racist theory made Horton's an unusual anti-racist argument for his time. Most contemporary defences of the black man were religiously based arguments. Horton, however, made full use of his biological knowledge and medical experience. His "The Negro's Place in Nature" (subtitle of part I of his West African Countries and Peoples) contains forceful and well informed arguments in sections such as "Exposition of Erroneous Views Respecting the African", "False Theories of Modern Anthropologists" and "Some Anatomical Accounts of Negro Physique."  

Horton saw obstacles to African advancement neither at the individual or psychological level. Many authors after him claimed to locate peculiar characteristics of the 'African personality', which would be unsuited for capitalism, exact science, and individual ambition. Horton, however, quoted with approval:

If Adam Smith's theory is pronounced orthodox, that it is to the principle of parsimony we owe our capital, and again to capital we owe our comforts and enjoyment, we certainly have this desideratum in the African, who is for the most part a parsimonious citizen, ambitious to rise in the world, and consequently to save and amass.

And again:

They calculate figures in their memory to an extent which would

---

92 Horton even discussed such factors as the African way to carry children on the back "the soft, yielding, underdeveloped tissues of the infant undergo various degrees of distortion, which ultimately form, after some generations, a permanent type" (Horton 1868, p. VI). Horton held Lamarckian views on the formation of the genetic material by environmental factors (and thus even expected physical changes from the civilisational process). (See July 1966, p. 5)

93 Horton 1868, p. 44-58

94 Until the 1850s and Darwin's Origin of Species, the major dispute on race was between monogenesis and polygenesis. The former stressed that all humans are created in God's image, decendents of Adam and Eve and 'of one blood'; the latter assumed 'natural distinctions' between the races. The monogenesist argument was supported by enlightenment rationalism; also the Pope had spoken out clearly in the Sublimus Dei of 1637, after the expansion of the Spanish empire, that non-whites are rational beings and potential Christians. Characteristically, monogenesism was accepting the inferiority of African cultures and of most Africans, but denied this to be their natural or necessary state. Polygenecism received great impetus with 19th century 'scientific' racism. See Curtin 1964 and R. Hallett 1986, p. 472-482

95 Horton 1868, p. 20-57
surprise the most practised mathematician... Some keep for years the debit and credit side of their account in their memory with great accuracy.  

According to Horton's analysis, neither the capitalist spirit nor the scientific spirit is absent from the African.

As Africans are perfectly fit for modernization, the issue for Africa is a practical one, namely how to organize and stimulate the modernization process. With his practical turn of mind, Horton suggested a host of initiatives in the educational, economic and political fields. He was well ahead of his time by constantly stressing the need for a very active government policy in education, propagating compulsory education, and the elevation of Fourah Bay College in Sierra Leone to a West African university. He greatly valued African entrepreneurship and started several companies himself, such as the Wassaw Light Railway Company Ltd and the Commercial Bank of West Africa, which he managed himself during the last months of his life.

In politics, according to Horton, development depended on infusing "the true principles of civilised Government", including the election of rulers. Without enlightened and modern government none of the modernizing policies which he considered essential would be possible. The 'feudal lords' of the interior tribes would not promote development, neither would a hesitant and inconsistent British colonial policy. The core of Horton's vision was, therefore, the development of modern states in Africa, which he called "that great principle of self-government."

His major work, West African Countries and Peoples, provides extensive descriptions of societies in the various parts of British West Africa, combined with detailed suggestions for the institutional set-up appropriate to each of the future states. This offered a complete plan, which the British would permit, supervise and protect. It would create a number of 'Dominions' within the British Commonwealth in West Africa, entitled to an equal position as the white dominions such as Canada and Australia. Typically, Horton suggested the creation of Western type political institutions. For Sierra Leone, for instance, a constitutional form of government must form the basis of his administration, consisting of a House of Assembly which should be composed of men elected by the people, as it will be difficult for his Government to stand without popular confidence, and the only means by which that can be secured is by giving the people the power to elect one branch of the Legislature;... Each member should have landed property, be over the age of twenty-two, and be properly educated.

He also outlined the need for a senate. In other countries Horton recommended

---

96 Horton 1868, p. 22-23
97 Horton 1870, p. 152
98 Horton 1868, p. 73
99 Horton 1868, p. 99
a house of chiefs. The head of state, monarch or president, would always be elected by general suffrage.  

The 'groundplan' for modern African government in the form of independent African states had to be implemented by active and benevolent British intervention. Horton, therefore, joined forces with the British humanitarians and philanthropists on the issue of the need of a consistent and active British policy for West Africa. He frequently published in the *African Times*, the monthly publication of the *African Aid Society*, which was the main defendant in the 1860s and 1870s of the Humanitarian case in Britain.  

The various elements of Horton's thought constitute a comprehensive and remarkably consistent philosophical conception about Africa's condition and future. However strongly one may disagree with his views, it is fair to accept that Horton was much more than the alienated 'Black Englishman', or elite ideologist which some commentators present. In fact, I want to argue that these charges result from a faulty historiographic methodology, and, in some cases, themselves betray a Eurocentric bias.

Let me first look at Horton as a so-called 'Black Englishman'. Ayandele states that he was one of a new species of African - hybridized, transmogrified, and passionate borrowers of Western values, ideas, norms, mores, thought-patterns, religion, and cosmology; deserters of their fatherland's cultural heritage; revellers in the white man's mental world; worshippers of the white man's education; apostles of political, social, and cultural aspirations completely at variance with the aspirations of the rest of the continent.

Is it correct to state that Horton represented an alien European discourse? Horton was an Anglophile, identified with the abolitionist position and admired its British protagonists, particularly his mentor, the secretary of the Church Missionary Society, Henry Venn. Horton was also involved in the *African Times* and other British magazines. For Horton, however, these commitments did not exclude being fully involved in a West African rather than a European project. The perception that Horton was alienated from Africa can appear

---

100 Unlike the common suggestion that Horton proposed a simple transplant of European institutions, he tailored his advice to the situation. "Constitutions are...productions that can neither be created nor transplanted; they are the growth of time". (Horton 1868, p.25)

101 In some cases, Horton even justified British violations of African sovereign rights: "It may produce displeasure amongst those who from 1842 had independent action, which has become a time-honoured custom to them... [but] it is only by these means that they can progress in their political history, and advance in civilization." (Horton 1968, p.32)

102 Shepperson's, Geis's and Davidson's reading of Horton lead to the conclusion that he basically represented imported ideas.

103 Ayandele 1971, p.691

104 Ayandele says of the West Africans: "[their] ideas and hopes were determined essentially, quite exclusively, by the African milieu and the events on the continent. Hence the provincialism of Horton's *West African Countries and Peoples*." (Ayandele 1971, p. 695)
only to the observer who thinks in terms of fundamental differences between the African and the non-African. According to Horton's universalist view on civilization, however, no such fundamental differences exist. Propagating Christianity, science and middle class values is not 'deserting the fatherland' but working for its modernization.

When it came to concrete choices, it is clear that Horton was not an apostle of foreign political schemes. The discrepancy emerged, for instance, on the issue of the exchange of forts between the British and the Dutch on the Gold Coast, which was much resented in Africa. The *African Times* welcomed this move because it could facilitate a more coherent trade policy. Horton, however, fulminated against the exchange, as it was arranged without the involvement of the Africans concerned and was considered as harming their interests.105

Rather than imitating a European discourse, Horton embodied a quite consistently developed and actively militated discourse on Africa from a particular West African point of view. Fair enough, the discourse concerned the political struggles of a small group situated in only a handful of peculiar spots on the Coast, but it discussed issues that became a concern for the whole of Africa.106 To overlook the specifically African roots of Horton's discourse results from a preoccupation with European intellectual history rather than with particular West African condition in Horton's time. Non-Europeans are assumed to imitate European standards if they sometimes hold the same views as Europeans.

The interpretation of Horton's ideas as voicing elite interests encounters similar problems. Let me first examine the elite. The educated elite was a rapidly rising class consisting of businessmen, church pastors or local government employees, and later including lawyers and journalists. Education was the main avenue of progress for this elite, and mission schools (Fourah Bay College in Freetown and the Wesleyan Boys School in Cape Coast) were breeding places for the rising intelligentsia. In the coastal cities there was an animated social life, following British examples, for instance with debating clubs. From a sociological point of view, the educated elite were intermediaries between the Western powers and the indigenous leaders and peoples. They were ambassadors of Christianity and modernisation, as well as protagonists of African interests.107 The position of the elite became endangered towards the end of the century, when whites could survive better in Africa due to improved medical knowledge, thus reducing the need for African brokers. The growing influence of the racist ideology even cultivated an outright disdain among the British colonialists, introducing such malign expressions as 'hybrids', 'trousered niggers' etcetera.

Horton's ideas exactly reflected the period in which the educated elite

105 For instance in Horton 1870, p. 27. See also Ayandele 1968, p. 26-27.
106 The political struggles expressed more than only educated elite concerns. The Fanti Federation, which Horton defended, is generally seen as a key event in African history.
107 See, e.g. the interesting collection: De Moraes Farias 1990.
could have its highest hopes, namely in the period following the 1865 Select Committee when there seemed to be an option of actually gaining the leadership of independent African nations. Horton expressed educated elite interests, but more than that, he formulated a political alternative in that particular historical situation.

Both interpretations of Horton, as being alienated from African realities, a 'Black Englishman', and as ideologist of the educated elite, share the serious flaw that they do not derive their interpretation from the texts and the specific historical circumstances. They rather develop conjectures about lines of historical influencing, or advance interest theories, and then ascribe ideas to 'sources' or to 'interests'. However sophisticated the historians' ideas and theories may be (which they are often not), the objects which they have to explain, i.e. the texts themselves, have to be grasped first. Texts are only comprehended when we understand the meaning of the words, ideas and acts involved. Hermeneutics precedes explanation.\textsuperscript{108} At this point, I will provide such a basic, hermeneutical understanding of the optimistic Krio discourse.

The drive and message of Horton's ideas is brought to life when his texts are read as part of the collective experiences, the hopes and fears, images and ambitions shared by the Krios in the West African coastal enclaves during the eighteen sixties and seventies.\textsuperscript{109} The key collective experiences of the Krio community was that of the success of the 'recaptives'. Horton epitomizes this experience in the following words:

\begin{quote}
Fancy a lot of slaves - unlettered, rude, naked, possessing no knowledge of the useful arts - thrown into a wild country, to cut down the woods and build towns; fancy these ragged, wild natives under British, and consequently, civilised influences, after a lapse of a few years, becoming large landowner, possessing large mercantile establishments and money, claiming a voice in the legislative government, and giving their offspring proper English and foreign education; and dare you tell me that the African is not susceptible of improvement of the highest order, that he does not possess in himself a principle of progression and a desire of perfection far surpassing many existing nations - since it can not be shown in the world's history that any people with so limited advantages has shown such results within fifty years.\textsuperscript{110}
\end{quote}

The recaptive story embodies in a nutshell Horton's whole conception of African advancement from a 'barbarious' starting position, under civilising influence, to civilised, rich, politically articulate nations. The individual rocketing careers exemplify what the continent as a whole can achieve. The

\textsuperscript{108}See chapter 2 on methodology
\textsuperscript{109}Speaking in terms of the 'social roots of ideas' may not be correct when it concerns the Krio. Horton's views are as much an expression of the collective experiences of that group as a contribution to the constitution of that group.
\textsuperscript{110}Horton 1868, p.25-26
vision of a 'modern' African future was not an abstractly constructed possibility nor a cheap import from Britain. It had a concrete meaning for those whose collective political memory was marked by this recaptive experience.

Here, we have an exemplar as discussed in chapter II. Core political concepts are coined by the way they are used in the exemplary story (in the case of Horton, the Krio success story). This exemplar is not an abstract idea, since the story refers to a key real-life situation or collective experience. This social reference provides the exemplar and its concepts with political and emotional fuel. The exemplar plays a constitutive role in the discourse by representing, 'verbalizing' one could say, key collective experiences. The recaptive success story is precisely such a discourse-animating exemplar.111

The first methodological gain of this analysis is that the discourse is not simply ascribed to (assumed) interests. The keys to understanding a discourse are literally read from the text. My reading can, therefore, also be criticized by drawing from textual analysis. Horton recounts the story of the 'recaptives' of Sierra Leone at several points in the text as the proof for the possibility of rapid African advancement.112 Within a short period of time, they [the missionaries] have brought up a race of men for whom destiny has mapped out an important mission in Africa. Later in the book he again recounts the recaptive story at length.113 Here the recaptives are:

landed naked and in a state of abject rudeness and poverty, without the least knowledge of civilization...they begin slowly to throw off their air of serfdom....they [their children]...seek after and obtain justice; preach loudly the Christian ethics...buy up the former abodes of their European masters; carry on extensive mercantile speculations...look out for a better form of government administration.114

A second revenue of my reading of Horton through the recaptive exemplar is that a number of curious details of his views begin to make sense. Horton's quite positive image of Britain, even in the face of contrary evidence is often explained invoking the allegation that Horton was an 'unrepentant anglophile'. The recaptive exemplar, however, shows that the idea of 'Britain the civilizer' is constitutive for the discourse. The recaptive success story already includes the benevolent outside civiliser (Britain). The impending advancement of Africa as a whole requires such a civilizing agent. The model of Horton's whole

111 As discussed in chapter II, the methodological conjecture of this study is that an 'exemplar' in political thought is a nodal point in two respects. Firstly, it embodies 'in a nutshell' the disciplinary matrix (Kuhn), the basic heuristic of a political conception. Secondly, it indicates the social roots, the key collective experiences which give political meaning to the ideas expressed (Skinner/Nauta). An 'exemplar', which is textual, thus refers to an 'exemplary situation' or 'exemplary collective experience', a shared social 'drama'.

112 Horton 1868, p. 25, 29, 59/60
113 Horton 1868, p. 29 and p. 59-61
114 Horton 1868, p. 60
conception resembles that of a chemical reaction where 'barbarious' Africa is transformed into 'modern' Africa. This reaction only works under the influence of certain catalysts, such as Christianity, Western education, a modern developmentalist state, trade, communication and industry. All these elements were embodied in Horton's Britain.

The place of Britain in the optimistic Krio discourse, as the world-historically appointed catalyst of African progress, explains why Horton maintained his "platonic conception of British presence in West Africa," as Ayandele complains, rather than making a realistic assessment of the British role. Horton's 'Britain' was essentially what it had to be in his conception of African development. When the British behaved differently from what Horton's theory required, this could not simply be accepted as a fact by Horton so it was turned into a moral issue, namely that Britain was 'forgetting its world-historical mission'. The discursive role of Britain in the Krio discourse can be compared to the position of the 'proletariat' in Marxist theory: the proletariat is given certain properties and tasks in the theory. The fact that the actual proletariat acted differently did not, for Marxists, refute the theory, but was turned into a moral and political problem of the proletariat not taking up its 'real' historical task.

Another peculiar aspect of Horton's thought, namely his negative view of contemporary indigenous African societies, can also be understood in terms of the exemplar. These societies were by definition barbarious, backward and weak, and were seen as the raw material that had to be civilized and strengthened. Just like the case of the exemplary recaptives, who made their 'great leap ahead' through an external missionary activity, Horton envisioned transforming traditional societies through an infusion of European civilization. Consistent with this view, he considered the nature and details of indigenous traditions quite irrelevant for development. Horton believed in Africans but not in African cultures.

The final advantage of analyzing the Krio discourse through its exemplar, the recaptive success story, is that it can clarify its limited presence in African history. To which groups did the discourse appeal, and why did this appeal suddenly disappear so completely that Horton was quickly forgotten and

---

115 Ayandele 1968, p. 19
116 It is interesting to note that Horton, the medical man, saw education mainly as instruction: infusing new elements into a receptive mind. Blyden, the man of letters who was also a great supporter of educational development, saw education basically as self-development: unfolding what is potentially already inside.
117 It cannot be excluded that had Horton lived longer he would, like his fellow Krios, have concluded that Africa had to do without the British help and that, consequently, he would have shown a more definite interest in African cultural traditions. In fact, very little is known about how Horton's views developed between 1873 and his death ten years later. The fact that the Ashantihene honoured him with the "Title and Dignity of Prince" (letter of 1879, quoted in Fyfe 1972, p. 133/134) indicates that he developed good contacts with Ashanti, which may have changed his views.
not even quoted by the next generation of African intellectuals?\textsuperscript{118} This exemplar of recaptive success expressed the particular historical situation of the coastal elites in the 1860s and 1870s. With the establishment of Western powers on the coast, they could have great hopes for the future, namely by creating wealth, by gradually Africanizing the whole state administration and by taking over from the whites, who could not survive the African climate. The leadership of modern African societies would be the task for the educated elites.

Buy up the former abodes of their European masters; carry on extensive mercantile speculations; seek after the indulgences of civilized life, and travel in foreign countries to seek after wealth...look out for a better form of government administration.\textsuperscript{119}

These specific historical roots also explain the rapid decline of the optimistic Krio discourse in the 1870s. In the last three decades of the 19th century, the British were clearly more interested in colonial expansion than in their so-called civilizing mission. Racist assumptions became dominant which, among other things, resulted in discriminating against educated Africans and even eliminating them from higher positions in government, administration and missionary organizations. In fact, the negative attitude of the British towards the Fanti Federation, the Native Pastorate controversy in the early 1870s, and the forcing out of the first African Bishop, the Yoruba recaptive Ajayi Crowther, were early instances of conflict between educated elite and colonial administration. Resentment among the educated elites grew steadily. In such an atmosphere, the optimistic Krio discourse lost appeal and it became completely obsolete following the subsequent actual colonial rule throughout most of Africa.

Lacking an outside benevolent civiliser, only two options concerning African development remained towards the end of the nineteenth century. Firstly, to forget the whole dream of a 'modern' Africa and strive for an authentic indigenous Africa; this is the road proposed by Edward Wilmot Blyden. Secondly, to accept the modernisation ideal, but try to find resources for modernisation in African traditions and social life itself; this idea was developed later by intellectuals such as John Mensah Sarbah and Joseph E. Casely Hayford. Let me turn to these intellectual options now.

\textsuperscript{118}Fyfe 1972, p. 156-159
\textsuperscript{119}Horton 1868, p. 60
The Discourse of African regeneration: Edward Wilmot Blyden

In visions of the future, I behold those beautiful hills - the banks of those harming streams, the verdant plains and flowery field, the salubrious highlands in primeval innocence and glory, and those fertile districts watered everywhere as the garden of the Lord: I see them all taken possession of by the returning exiles from the West, trained for the work of re-building waste place under severe discipline and hard bondage. I see, too, their brethren hasting to welcome them from the slopes of the Niger...Mohammedans and Pagans, chiefs and people, all coming to catch something of the inspiration the exiles have brought...and to march back hand-in-hand with their returned brethren towards the sunrise for the regeneration of a continent...raised from the slumber of the ages and resqued from a stagnant barbarism...Ethiopia shall suddenly stretch out her hands unto God'.

Edward Wilmot Blyden 120

The proud republic of Liberia, founded in 1817 and declared independent in 1847, was rather less idyllic than Blyden's vision suggests, expressed on a mission to stimulate American Blacks to return to Africa. Liberia's capital, Monrovia, was a small settlement living in near constant antagonism with the inland African population and its internal politics marked by a new color-line between lighter and darker skinned Liberians. 121

The arrival of Edward Wilmot Blyden in 1851, only a few years after independence, infused Liberian life not only with a flamboyant public figure but with an intellectual of much more than Liberian, or even West African, stature. For decades, this self-made and self-educated man became the most prominent West African ideologue opposing dominant European paternalism. Blyden's biographer H.R. Lynch called him "the greatest nineteenth century black intellectual" and the historian A. Ayandele termed him an "African celebrity". Blyden was admired by the next generation of African intellectuals, yet he provoked quite negative valuations as well. 122

Blyden was born in a family of free, educated blacks on the Danish Caribbean island of St. Thomas in 1832. He went to the USA for studies in Theology, but could not enter university because of racial discrimination and so decided instead to go to the free 'negro' republic of Liberia in 1850. Blyden began teaching at the Presbyterian Alexander High School in 1854 and was ordained a Presbyterian minister in 1858. He taught himself Latin and Greek (to read the scriptures), later Arabic as well, and devoured contemporary popular and political writings. 123

120 Blyden 1887, p. 129
121 see e.g. Lynch 1967, chapter II
122 compare e.g. Hargreaves 1969 and Geiss 1968, to Ayandele 1971 in their comments on Blyden.
Blyden expected African-Americans never to attain equal status in America and strongly supported the call for a return to Africa. He visited the USA twice on Liberian government missions to attract immigrants. Within Liberia, Blyden, being very black, sided against the 'mulatto' ruling caste in often bitter struggles. In one of these, Blyden's friend Alexander Crummell aspired to become Episcopal Bishop of Liberia, but was effectively blocked by the American mother church and Liberian 'mulattos'. Another issue which divided blacks and 'mulattos' in Liberia was the position of native Africans. These Africans held no citizenship rights (unless 'acculturated') and were discriminated against in various ways. Crummell's and Blyden's church work among indigenous Africans taught them to respect indigenous cultures. In addition, they saw the complete integration of 'natives' in educational and missionary efforts as central to the Pan-Africanist and Pan-Negroist movement that was to spread from Liberia to the rest of Africa.

Blyden was involved in the election of the black president Roye and held high political offices, but he had to fly to Sierra Leone when Roye was overthrown and killed in 1871. In Freetown, Blyden established his newspaper 'The Negro' and made several official government missions into the interior, always urging the British government to expand its influence. He also became involved immediately in the 'Native Pastorate Controversy'.

Back in Liberia Blyden was appointed Liberian ambassador to England for several years and President of the Liberia College. He ran for presidency of the republic in 1885 but lost and lived mostly in Sierra Leone for the rest of his life. However, Blyden travelled frequently, exemplified by his visit to the USA in 1889 where he was celebrated by conservative whites as "the heaven-appointed medium for helping to solve the ('negro') problem." In 1890 Blyden visited Lagos which was quickly becoming the most important centre in West Africa. Blyden was received with much honour 'as the highest intellectual representative and the greatest defender and uplifter of the African race' and he preached on relations with muslims, on the need for an African institution of higher learning and on an independent African Church which should appoint Bishop Crowther, an African, as its head. Laymen founded the United Native African Church that same year.

Blyden remained a highly respected man with contacts among most of the important politician figures in West Africa, yet he was practically penniless when he died in 1912 in Sierra Leone.

It is tempting, at this point, to assemble Blyden's views into one coherent

---


124 Lynch 1967, p. 29
125 By then, African-Americans had the new option of emigrating to the black republic of Haiti.
126 Lynch 1964
127 Lynch 1967, p. 128
128 see Lynch (ed.) 1978, p.9 and Geis 1968, p. 127
position. Such a position would then be termed 'anti-racist racism' or 'nineteenth century Négritude' (expressions used in interpretations of Blyden). Typically, however, such terms refer to twentieth century intellectual events and may result in an anachronistic interpretation. I want to stay closer to the actual situations in which Blyden operated and to reconstruct Blyden's discourse as an event in African intellectual and political history. An additional advantage of analyzing Blyden's discourse in this way is that important shifts in his position can be revealed. Rather than presenting one paradigmatic position, Blyden radically changed his ideas during his long life, which shows the remarkable force and originality of his thought.

When Blyden arrived in Liberia, 'for love of his Fatherland' and to serve the Pan-Negroist cause, his frame of mind fully expressed Christian abolitionism. He preached that *Negritia* should "Stretch out her hands unto God." In the divine plan for the rebirth of Africa, the civilised, Christianized and educated ex-slaves from the Americas played a primary role. Slavery itself was considered to have been part of this divine plan, because it was through the New World slavery experience that 'the sons of Ham' could absorb Christianity in order to effect the regeneration of the continent. In the political field, this divine plan involved the Republic of Liberia, as well as the attempts of European powers to penetrate into, and Christianize, Africa.

Next to being an abolitionist civilizer, Blyden was a 'Pan-Negroist' from the very beginning. Pan-Negroism, the idea that all black people in the world are essentially one and should reunite, had quite a different origin from abolitionism. It derived from the African New World slavery experience, involving the 'color-line' and a self-definition 'as blacks'. Within Africa itself, a person's identity would generally derive from belonging to a *particular* people, culture or language group. People from African descent in the Americas, however, could mostly trace their ancestry only in a *general* way to 'Africa', which was seen as the 'home continent' or the 'fatherland' of the black people. This idea of 'Africa' was based on colour or race, rather than on the actual hundreds of cultures and peoples inhabiting the geographical space of Africa. The Pan-Negroist 'Africa' was conditioned by the social situation from which it derived, a racial self-definition as the counterpart to the white oppressor.

This particular self-definition 'as blacks' was initially brought to Africa by 'Pan-Negroists' such as Blyden and Crummell. *Pan-Negroism* as well as *Abolitionism* is a view of Africa from a position outside of Africa. In both cases Africa and Africans are positioned in grand dichotomies, namely civilized - primitive and black - white respectively.

The Abolitionist and the Pan-Negroist discourses do not automatically conform, however. The early Christian Pan-Negroists, such as Blyden and Crummell, aligned the two in an interesting way by applying the civilized -

---

129 One of his key articles in this period is entitled "Ethiopia stretching out her hands unto God". A magnificent piece, where Blyden argued that the Bible text "Ethiopia stretches out her hands" really should be read as "stretches out soon", thus announcing the new times for the black race. 'Negrita' is used in Blyden 1887, p. 6.
primitive dichotomy within the black race, namely between the New World 'exiled brethren' 'trained for the work of re-building waste place under severe discipline and hard bondage' (= the civilized), and the indigenous Africans who had to be 'raised from the slumber of the ages and rescued from a stagnant barbarism' (= the primitive). The intellectual framework of Blyden and Crummell consisted thus of a peculiar combination of a Pan-Negro discourse on African identity and an abolitionist discourse on civilization.

The most remarkable achievement of Blyden's intellectual career was that he managed to gradually distance himself from almost every aspect of the Christian abolitionist discourse. The key to the development of Blyden's thought was that he actually sought exposure to African life and cultures. Blyden participated in Church work among indigenous communities in Liberia, travelled inland, studied African cultures and history, learned Arabic and travelled to Egypt. This first-hand knowledge of Africa corrected his negative idea of African cultures. Thus, a constitutive element of the Christian abolitionist discourse (which needed a negative idea of African culture in order to justify the claim that this culture should be replaced by Christianity) was undermined. In fact, Blyden gradually developed a very positive view of African culture. African culture should not be replaced by Christian 'civilized' culture but be protected against this 'alien' influence. Blyden contended that, in its own way, African culture is superior to Western culture.

Blyden thus challenged a core element of the abolitionist - humanitarian 'civilizers' discourse and created the possibility of a new, what can be called an 'Afrocentric' or 'African Regeneration' discourse. This new discourse of racial and cultural self-consciousness could become a vehicle for a critique of the missionary (and in principle also the colonial) establishment in West Africa. It could define a separate African position.

The idea of a basic difference between cultures or races was central to Blyden's new African regeneration discourse. Every race is a natural unit, having its own 'home' continent, character and mission. The idea of 'race' in Blyden's discourse was not simply the modern biological concept. For Blyden race had a number of references: biological, cultural and religious, all of which established racial identities as God-created units of humanity. The specificity of races should unfold, each developing in its own way, complementing the other races and thereby shaping the complete creation according to the dictates of providence.

Each race is endowed with peculiar talents, and watchful to the last degree is the great Creator over the individuality, the freedom and independence of each. In the music of the universe, each shall give a different sound, but necessary to the grand symphony. There are several sounds not yet brought out, and the feeblest of all is that hitherto produced by the Negro; but only he

---

130 Even the common notion of race is quite mistaken, see e.g. Appiah 1992, chapter 2
can furnish it. And when he furnishes it in its fullness and perfection, it will be welcomed with delight by the world.\textsuperscript{131}

As a consequence of his view on race, Blyden saw nothing wrong with the term 'negro'. He even insisted on writing it with a capital N and made it the title of the journal he founded in Freetown. According to Blyden 'Pride of race' was essential for 'Negro' progress, a dictate of nature as well as a divine commandment. The great challenge for the self-conscious 'Negro' was to bring out, discover and develop this specifically 'African' mode in all aspects of life. This would mean developing African religious expression, African education, African social organization and political order. Blyden found many succinct expressions for this idea, such as: "Be yourselves...if you surrender your personality, you have nothing left to give the world," and "the African must advance by the methods of his own. He must possess a power distinct from the European."\textsuperscript{132}

The more radical implications of this view were developed only later in Blyden's life, such as the idea of a specifically African Personality. The African personality was defined in contrast to the European which was identified as harsh, individualistic, competitive, combative, non-religious and materialistic. Africans are by nature softer and cheerful, they have sympathy, a willingness to serve and are spiritual. Their orientation is towards agriculture, not industry.\textsuperscript{133}

In a letter to Booker T. Washington, Blyden wrote:

The spirit of service in the black man is born of his spiritual genius....the supple, yielding, conciliatory, obedient, gentle, patient, musical spirit that is not full of offensive resistance - how sadly the white man needs it!...Let him fight the battle of government on the stump, at the polls and in the legislative halls. Our kingdom in America is not this world. We cannot compete with the Anglo-Saxon. He is so dreadfully determined, so intolerant and self assertive, intent upon carrying his point at all hazards, having good in view of course; but the wheels of his mind and understanding need oiling sadly with the oil of African good nature.\textsuperscript{134}

The contributions of 'the Negro' towards world culture would therefore be that of peacemaker and conserver of the spirituality of the world. Thus, Ethiopia and Ethiopians, having always served, will continue to serve the world. The Negro is, at the moment, the opposite of the Anglo-Saxon. Those everywhere serve the world; these everywhere govern the world....And in the light of the ultimate good of the universe, I do not see why the calling of the one

\textsuperscript{131}Blyden 'Africa and the Africans' quoted in Mosley 1995, p. 24
\textsuperscript{132}The first quote is from a speech "Race and Study" given in Sierra Leone in 1895. Lynch 1967, chapter 4; the second is from the opening speech for the Liberia College in 1881 "The Aims and Methods of Liberal Education for Africans" Blyden 1887, p. 71-93
\textsuperscript{133}Lynch 1967, p. 58-62 and chapter 5.
\textsuperscript{134}Lynch 1971, p. 207. Print of a letter to Booker T. Washington of November 28th, 1894.
should be considered the result of a curse, and the calling of the other the result of special favour. The one fulfils its mission of domination, the other of submission. The one serves mankind by ruling; the other serves mankind by serving. The one wears the crown and wields the sceptre; the other bears the stripes and carries the cross. Africa is distinguished as having served and suffered. In this, her lot is not unlike that of God's ancient people, the Hebrews... The lot of Africa resembles also His who made himself of no reputation, but took upon himself the form of a servant. 

Consistent with Blyden's idea of cultural difference, Christianity, as a Western religion, could not be the universal norm. His contention that Christianity is not fit for Africa shocked his contemporaries, both black and white. "The so-called Christian public are not yet prepared for such a catastrophe to their enterprise, which nevertheless, so far as Africa is concerned, is hopeless." Although originally ordained as a Presbyterian minister, Blyden became increasingly critical about the role of the Christian mission on the Coast. Complementarily, his esteem for Islamic culture grew. For some time Blyden appears to have considered Islam as preparatory for what he considered "in essence the highest form of religion," namely Christianity. It is unclear whether Blyden ever really abandoned the ideal of a Christian Africa and converted to Islam. Mudimbe maintains that "in spirit Blyden was a Muslim." 

In any case, Blyden saw Islam as better suited to the needs of the African continent because it could civilize Africa while respecting its traditions. Islam could bind tribes together, suppress savage practices, as well as promote egalitarianism and abstination. Islam also has not resulted in 'Moorish' domination over Africans. Great African warriors have expelled the conquerors and adjusted Islam to accommodate the social peculiarities of the people. Blyden claimed not to have experienced discrimination during his travels throughout the muslim interior and the Middle East and to have observed full black participation in the administration. For his practical endeavours, however, Blyden continued to depend on financial support from British and American Christians. Even if Blyden was not a Christian anymore, he could not have afforded to stress this openly.

The shift to a new discourse on African regeneration evolved parallel to changing views on the remigration of African-Americans. Originally, Blyden's Christian Abolitionist and Pan-Negroist orientation made him strongly favour remigration. Shedding his Abolitionist missionarism, however, made him more reluctant. Blyden even developed an aversion to accepting mixed bloods,
'mulattos', as full 'negroes' (or indeed as full humans!)

Such discriminatory views severely complicated Blyden's dealings with the black leadership in the USA, in which persons of 'mixed blood' were prominently present. In fact, Blyden did not accept the common definition of 'negro' as someone having 'negro' blood. To qualify as a 'Negro' Blyden required majority- or even pure 'negro' decent, hence his use of notions such as 'pure negroes', 'genuine negroes', and 'half-casts'. In his later life Blyden even favoured the prohibition of inter-racial marriages.

Such discrimination is consistent with Blyden's theoretical framework. His concept of race suggests that the divine mandate for the authenticity and the purity of African culture also involves the purity of race. For Blyden, biological and cultural issues (which, in the late 20th century, are considered quite separate things) were mixed from the beginning.

In educational matters, Blyden's ideas worked out clearly too. He favoured a curriculum specially designed for African students to be taught in indigenous institutions by Africans. Blyden's idea of an African curriculum included the study of Arabic and African culture and history, as well as that of the Greek and Roman classics (sic!). Since African students should not be distracted from their own 'racial instincts' the study of later European culture should be excluded. Towards the end of his life, Blyden increasingly stressed the appropriateness of the industrial arts for African students.

The political views involved in the new African regeneration discourse were ambiguous. On the one hand, they stressed 'negro' self-assertion and unity. In Blyden's view, the world of his lifetime developed according to the logic of 'racial' identities, which he saw as a great support for African liberation. Regaining African historical and cultural identity and developing indigenous institutions could help to constitute the regeneration of Africa. On the other hand, a consistent elaboration of Blyden's philosophy of racial/cultural difference implied the idea that Africans should leave politics to the race that excels in this area, namely the Europeans. "The one serves mankind by domination, the other by submission. The one serves mankind by ruling, the other serves mankind by serving." Especially towards the end of his life, Blyden drifted towards a philosophical position which denies the relevance of political power for Africans (even proposing white governance for the free black state of Liberia) and calls for British colonial expansion inland. Whites, according to Blyden's racial framework of ideas, could not settle permanently on the African continent so that colonialism was considered 'by nature' temporary. At the same time, according to the providential scheme of

141An example of the biological interpretation of cultural matters is Blyden's severe critique of the Krio, or 'Aku tribe' in a letter to the Assistant Undersecretary at the British Colonial Office in 1910. See Lynch (ed.) 1978, p. 498-502
142Blyden 1887, p. 89, 90
143Lunch 1967, chapter 4.
144Lynch 1967, chapter 9
things, the British had a historical task in Africa to facilitate education, trade and the creation of a great unified West African state. Every care should be taken, however, to ensure that throughout this process the basic African social system would remain intact. The political logic of the African regeneration discourse allows, ultimately, two alternatives: either proceeding towards an outspoken anti-colonial ideology around the idea of 'Africa for the Africans', or becoming an ideology of resignation on account of the African's special personality and 'lot to serve'. The first option was expressed by Marcus Garvey in the USA after the First World War. Blyden gradually developed a version of the second option. In his quite long-term view, African could benefit from colonialism. Blyden neither believed that political action was appropriate nor that Africans were ripe for political leadership.

The exemplary text for Blyden's conservative position towards the end of his life is the book *African Life and Customs* (1908), originally published as a newspaper series in Sierra Leone. The book is a superbly elegant, idealized presentation of 'the' African way of life, covering its various aspects one by one, and clearly showing its intricate balance, wisdom and perfect adaptation to the African situation. Most of what has been written on 'the' African in the framework of *African Socialism*, or *Ethnophilosophy* in the 20th century pales in comparison to Blyden's *African Life and Customs*.

Blyden's long journey from abolitionist cultural imperialism to cultural nationalism came to its consistent conclusion in *African Life and Customs*. His philosophy developed from a view of Africa as still having to acquire everything to a view of Africa that, in principle, has everything already, shifting from a profoundly evolutionary discourse to an essentialist discourse. The style and structure of Blyden's texts also inverted. His early texts represent a standard narrative of an outsider preaching to Africans ("Christianize!", "Civilize!") while he turned towards a standard narrative of an African preaching to outsiders ("We Africans") later. The 'external' aim of *African Life and Customs* is shown in the text itself since every paragraph begins with an exposition of problems in European (British) society, before presenting the African way as the perfect alternative. This strategy reveals Blyden's creative polemical mind at its best: he inverted the roles so that Europe is not exemplary for Africa, but rather Africa is exemplary for Europe.

The foregoing presentation of Blyden's development suggests an 'internalistic' interpretation. It maintains that Blyden's views consistently developed towards

---

145 Lynch argues that, especially after the Berlin conference of 1885, Blyden stressed the need to preserve African culture and was supported by friends of Africa such as Mary Kingsley and the Africa Society. (Lynch 1967, p. 200-210)

146 Especially Blyden's letters, published in collections by Lynch (Lynch 1978), show Blyden's views in his later life rather bluntly.

147 Langley (ed.) 1979 p.35 also stresses the importance of the book, quoting Lynch: "the greatest single effort at "unfolding the African...through a study of the customs of his fathers"."
one of the logical conclusions allowed by a discourse based on the idea of race. Such an interpretation, however, ignores that Blyden was very much part of the intellectual and cultural developments of his time. He was well read, participating in contemporary debates and arousing great enthusiasm. In terms of Quentin Skinner, one could say that Blyden's 'retailoring' of the paradigm of scientific racism had a specific political meaning and arousing strong sentiments in his time. As I hope to show here, in order to understand Blyden's African regeneration discourse, it is essential to trace its place throughout the ideas and the politics in the last decades of the nineteenth century.

The African regeneration discourse builds on an intellectual heritage of nineteenth century scientific racist theory, as much as on an understanding of the world in terms of ethnically-based nationalities, which was shared among the contemporaries. Within the last thirty years, the sentiment of race and of nationality has attained wonderful development. Not only have the teachings of thinkers and philosophers set forth the importance of the theory, but the deeds of statesmen and patriots have, more or less successfully, demonstrated the practicality of it. The efforts of men like Garibaldi and Cavour in Italy, of Kossnuth in Hungary, of Bismarck in Germany, of the Ashantees and Zulus in Africa, have proved the indestructible vitality and tenacity of race.

Blyden perceived himself to be part of a grand global process of peoples, nations, and races reclaiming their legitimate place in this world. "The feeling is in the atmosphere - the plane in which races move. And there is no people in whom the desire for race integrity and race preservation is stronger than in the Negro."

The intellectual tradition in which Blyden's views were shaped was the discourse of scientific racism, but he altered the discourse to suit his agenda. While accepting its key concepts ('race', 'instinct', 'natural order'), dichotomies (black - white) and theories (on the 'serving' nature of blacks, the natural home continents of races, the degenerating effects of mixing of races), he toppled, as it were, the structure of racist discourse by replacing a hierarchical order of races with an order of difference. The modern reader will be astonished by Blyden's complicit quotations of the crudest racists. According to Blyden's own intellectual framework, however, these racist theorists were not mistaken about the facts (racial differences) but about the interpretation and valuation of these facts (a hierarchy of races).

In order to understand Blyden, it is necessary to recognize the political context in which the African regeneration discourse functioned. Blyden, it was felt by his contemporaries, explicated the essence of their historical situation

---

148 Especially in the prominent Fraser's Magazine. See the list of Blyden's works at the end of Lynch 1971.
149 Blyden 1887, p. 121
150 Blyden 1887, p. 122, and Lynch 1967, p. 65
with striking accuracy. The last decades of the nineteenth century not only had the 'sentiments of race and nationality' as a 'feeling in the atmosphere', they were also the decades in which the colonial 'empires of race' were actually being established. For the African educated elite the establishment of colonial rule meant segregation and eviction from all but the lowest ranks in colonial and missionary administrations. Blyden's African regeneration discourse expressed these experiences of segregation and feelings of race, as much as it helped to interpret the experience of colonial subjugation in terms of race.

Blyden's key instrument to represent the emerging colonial situation was the exemplary idea of the color-line, suggesting a basic opposition of a white master and a black slave. From the very beginning, Blyden's 'Pan-Negroist' thought embodied a key historical experience, namely that of New World slavery. This experience suggested the exemplar of the color-line as a mould for understanding every other aspect of the world. Its psychology revolved around the idea of alienation and authenticity. Its geography suggested that continents 'belong to' races. Its history suggested that blacks were originally in their natural state of togetherness, became caught in the diaspora, a passing, abnormal state, but would be reunited as a race.

When Pan-Negroism was transferred from an American to an African context, in the early period of Liberia, it landed in quite a different environment. The division between lighter and darker Liberian citizens (expressed in two political parties and in anti-elite struggles) could be described as some kind of color-line, which may include the divide between immigrant, Christian citizens and indigenous non-citizens as well. Outside of Liberia, the idea of a color-line failed to be relevant, however. There the issue of colour was not 'charged' with social and political meaning to establish it as foundational and inspirational for a discourse.

The historical situation in Africa changed rapidly, however, with the rise of colonial racism in the last three decades of the nineteenth century. Colonial expansion and 'scientific racism' created 'empires of race'. The African educated elite especially suffered from discrimination. The idea of the color-line thus acquired new relevance, expressing, not slavery-related racism, but colonial racism.

The nature of the color-line was different, however, in both cases. For example, in the African situation the 'black' side of the color-line was less tainted with extreme pain, violence and alienation than in the American situation. After all, the experience of being black in Africa did not belong to a battered minority, but rather to a self-conscious and resourceful majority. Even visual appearance shows the difference in division between black and white on the two continents. In Africa (except for South Africa) white spots would appear tiny, isolated and vulnerable. Because Europeans were poorly adapted to the African environment physically, European presence tended to be perceived as a temporary arrangement. As noted earlier, in Africa identity referred to specific African cultures, whereas the New-World color-line tended to shape the black identity as a 'negative', or a negation of the white identity.
Probably, in the African case the idea of the black-white divide has always been more of a 'culture-line' than of a color-line. Blyden's thought itself, although consistently framed in a terminology of race, can support such an interpretation. If Blyden's notion of race is translated into present-day concepts, it tends to have at least as many connotations of 'culture' as of 'biology'. If one would consistently replace Blyden's word 'race' with a general concept of 'culture', then his argument would remain basically unchanged!

It is, thus, important to note that the new African Regeneration discourse in Africa in the 1880s and 1890s was not simply a return to a Pan-Negroist position. The latter expressed a New World experience, while the former expressed an African experience (an experience, at least, that was, within a few decades, shared by the whole continent). Blyden's new African Regeneration discourse itself did much to make the educated elite interpret their collective experiences in terms of grand racial and cultural oppositions. Their thinking turned towards positions that were much more race, colour and culture conscious than during the previous decades. For instance, many took African names, the African Dress Society was formed, African cultural, religious and political systems were studied. The African Regeneration discourse was very much an African discourse.

The interpretation of the African Regeneration discourse in terms of the elite's experience of a colonial color-line can explain the loss of appeal of the regeneration discourse around the turn of the century. Blyden's forceful positions on such issues as an African Church, an African curriculum, an African personality, history and high culture, as well as his ideas on race pride and non-accluturation, were striking the heart of paternalistic rule in the proto-colonial enclaves on the West African Coast between 1870 and 1900. However, when colonialism became established around 1900, when fully fledged administrative, legal, military and economic structures were being imposed, then the political rather than the cultural aspects of colonial rule became the primary issue. Blyden's grand ideological warfare was still inspiring but did not really address the most urgent problems of the day, namely the enforcement of colonial rule and the issue of representation of African interests within the new system.
There was a theoretical policy and a practical one, the latter having as its aim such a shaping of circumstances as would for ever make the Ethiopian in his own country a hewer of wood and a drawer of water unto his Caucasian protector and so-called friend.

Casely Hayford

The division of Africa and the imposition of colonial rule around the turn of the century created new conditions for political thought. The Berlin Conference, deciding about the division of Africa, took place in 1885. Actual occupation of the assigned territories was concluded only around 1900. For political thought in Africa, the hard fact of absolute colonial rule put an end to the nineteenth century view that oversees colonial powers and indigenous rulers, despite the difference in power, could in fact negotiate, sign treaties and expect to be respected as equal partners. This harsh message was, however, not received without protest. It gave rise to an interesting political discourse which formulated a grand (although aborted) option for Africa's future.

By focusing on the movement of the Aboriginals Rights Protection Society (ARPS) and its struggles in the Gold Coast around 1900, this third type of political discourse, different from the Optimistic Krio and African Regeneration discourses, discloses itself. The discourse represents the end of the old nineteenth century political horizon which was 'open' in the sense that it left room for African aspirations "to work out our own salvation." At the same time, however, the discourse absorbed several fundamental assumptions that betray its tribute to the colonial situation, and it can thus be said to represent the beginning of a new type of political discourse. In this paragraph I will try to unravel the intricacies and contradictions of this highly interesting answer to the question of "Whither Africa".

On the shop-floor of history, a number of changes took place around the turn of the century. Within the realm of British power in West Africa the importance of Nigeria as compared to Sierra Leone increased. The Gold Coast remained intellectually of great importance. A further shift was the rising importance of the press. A multitude of newspapers appeared in Nigeria, Gold Coast and Sierra Leone. Some of them, like The Lagos Weekly Record of John Payne Jackson, remained for some 40 years a strong advocate of nationalist interest. Most of the leading political figures were themselves active journalists. The westernised elite had grown in size. In urban centres, such as Lagos, Accra and Cape Coast, there was an animated social and public life with debating clubs and societies British style.

The major players in African politics were the 'educated elite' and the

---

151Hayford 1911, p. 98
'traditional rulers'. It has been habitual to judge negatively about the 'elitist' or 'westernised' educated class\textsuperscript{152} because of their alleged alienation from the people and indigenous rulers. These cleavages should not be overstated, however. The educated were mostly closely related with their home areas, and with their 'traditional' rulers. Furthermore, they cannot be taken as a homogeneous group. The ARPS paper, The Gold Coast Aborigines of 8 Febr. 1902, for instance, stated "We want Educated Fantis not europeanized natives. We simply want our education to enable us to develop and to improve our native ideas, customs, manners and institutions.\textsuperscript{153} Similarly, The Times of Nigeria, in an editorial, differentiated between " ..two categories of African educated natives: the sophisticated ones who were losing touch with their indigenous systems and betraying their fellow Africans (and these abounded in Lagos) and those who were patriotic, inwardly agitating.\textsuperscript{154}

A historical need for such 'patriotic, inward' agitation presented itself in the Gold Coast in the 1890s with the issuing of colonial Land Laws that declared, among other things, 'waste-lands' to be Crown Lands. Educated elites and traditional rulers alike realized that these laws affected the heart of traditional systems of rule and they rose to "defend both land rights and the social structure based upon them.\textsuperscript{155} The Aboriginals Rights Protection Society, which was established in 1896 to fight this cause, was in fact an early example of a 'modern' political movement in Africa.

The ARPS revived the spirit of the Fanti Confederation of 25 years before.\textsuperscript{156} The old confederationists joined the younger generation of intellectuals such as John Mensah Sarbah, Joseph Casely Hayford and Kobina Sekyi. From his death bed King Gartey IV of Winneba, who had been elected the first president of the Fanti Confederation and continued to be one of the most important 'traditional' rulers of the Gold Coast, confirmed the historical link between the ARPS case and the Fanti Confederation.

Now that the big struggle before us re the Land Bills &c. the history past, present and future call with one loud voice for Loyalty, Unity of purpose, and perseverance in actions .. Hopefully therefore I fall in this battle field with many wounds fresh and old and deep scars of the defunct Fanti Confederation. Kindly convey my last farewell to all true patriotic native kings and friends of the countries cause, here and elsewhere and to the Aborigines Society in England. Be constitutional. God bless you,

\textsuperscript{152}The critique of the educated elite, whether justified by some anti-elitist political theory or by reference to cultural roots, is seldom convincing, if only because the critic himself is mostly very much part of this class.

\textsuperscript{153}Quoted in Kimble 1963, p. 360.

\textsuperscript{154}An editorial of 22-3-1920 quoted by Ugonna 1966, p. XV

\textsuperscript{155}Kimble 1963, p. 331. On the ARPS also Kimble's chapter IX and Langley 1973 chapter III and IV.

\textsuperscript{156}The Fanti Confederation was discussed in this chapter in the context of Horton. The ARPS emerged from the \textit{Mfantsi Amanbuhû Féku} (the Fanti National Political Society).
our Country and the Queen. Amen.\textsuperscript{157}

The Society was constitutional and successful. After active agitation and a deputation to London, the laws were withdrawn. This victory, however, could not stop the process of gradual usurpation of African sovereignty. Gold Coast was declared to be a Crown Colony in 1901, and the Native Jurisdiction Law of 1910 legalized the inferior position of 'traditional' rulers.

In fact, the Land Laws signified, within the Gold Coast context, the harsh awakening to the realities of colonial subjugation. The agreement of the famous \textit{Bond of 1844} that the indigenous rulers and the British (at first the merchant Captain George Maclean) would sit together as equals "to administer the affairs of the country and dispense justice"\textsuperscript{158} was over. As the Gold Coast intellectual J.B. Danquah's subtle analysis showed:

\begin{quote}
The Gold Coast people and their natural rulers were gradually reduced from the relation of independent states friendly with the Queen-Empress to the level of subject states in a Crown Colony, the inhabitants of which can only seek for a share in the government of their own country at the hands of red-tape Governors "on the spot", who live in Castles and Forts\textsuperscript{159} and demand loyalty from the people and their rulers, like conquered vassals in the palace of the Great Mogul.
\end{quote}

The age in which an independent national consciousness dawned upon the Gold Coast people came to an end in 1897, but it was natural that the great reaction that set in should have resulted in a period of sustained and organized criticism of British intentions and good faith, of dissatisfaction with the new regime, a constitutional and standing protest against the flagrant departure from the Bond of 1844. The aim of the new policy tended gradually to encroach upon the rights and liberties of the Gold Coast people, to close their courts, to seize their lands, and to curtail the inherited independence of the native states in the continued enjoyment of which neither the people nor the natural rulers had divested themselves, either by conquest, cession or sale to the British.\textsuperscript{160}

The ARPS is not only interesting as a case of successful 'constitutional' agitation against a colonial power but even more so for the ideas that carried this movement. "West Africans felt cheated of their land, deprived of their right of self-government, defrauded of their economical resources and stripped of the very essentials of their culture and way of life."\textsuperscript{161} The political thought of

\begin{footnotes}
\item[157] quoted in Kimble 1963, p. 348.
\item[158] Danquah 1932, p. 24-25
\item[159] Danquah adds a footnote here: "Hence the native name for foreign European Government is "Aban", i.e. Castle or fortification".
\item[160] Danquah 1932, p. 16-17
\item[161] July 1968, p. 435-6
\end{footnotes}
nineteenth century Africans, however, did not provide a useful tool to transform this frustration into effective political action. The Horton-type modernizationist optimism would be anachronistic, even a form of collaboration in this situation. Blyden's cultural conservatism was popular, expressing African frustrations with colonial paternalism and racism, but his political conservatism, especially in his later years, was a poor tool for effective political action.

The nineteenth century ideologies suggested a choice between modernisation and African tradition, while neither provided a forceful framework for political action in a situation characterized by enforced colonial penetration. The way out was shown by ARPS intellectuals such as Mensah Sarbah and Casely Hayford. They suggested that there is no contradiction between tradition and modernization. African traditions, they argued, are perfectly able to adjust in their own way to modern times, if only given the chance. It is this fair chance which was denied to them.

The reasoning of the ARPS intellectuals located the key issue, and therefore the focus of the struggle, in the political sphere. Whereas for Horton economic and technological modernisation was the key to Africa's future, and for Blyden cultural authenticity, for the ARPS the key issue was political, namely the liberty of 'working out our own salvation' as a people. The ARPS aimed at the concrete political option that the British should "confine themselves more to external administration, leaving the internal government of the people to develop upon the natural lines of their own institutions." The Japanese, while facing the threat of modernized Europe, revolutionized their own culture under Mēidji rule. In the same way, the ARPS intellectuals wanted to renovate indigenous political traditions as the basis for an indigenous path to modernization.

This grand ideological option of modernization-from-indigenous-roots involved a statement of the vitality belonging to indigenous traditions that is reminiscent of Blyden. Blyden, in fact, was very popular among the ARPS intellectuals. When looked at more carefully, however, their own argument was quite different from Blyden's argument. Rather than affirming a general African identity as different from the European, the ARPS intellectuals wanted to show the vitality of specific Fanti and Ashanti traditions as a basis for actually organising social and political life on the Coast. 'Going Fantee' in names, clothes, religion and language, including the propagation of traditional political institutions, was a political programme. Whereas Blyden was making a cultural statement (in a broad sense), the ARPS intellectuals were formulating a

---

162 Modernization chaperoned by the 'benevolent' British had proven to be mere subjugation.
163 The causes of this suppressed liberty were often not pursued using 'deep' theories of imperialism or capitalism but located in misplaced white superiority feeling and a failing colonial administration that contradicted 'true imperialism'. Practical political action, therefore, was directed at these apparent factors, rather than at the possible 'deeper' causes.
political alternative.

Blyden invited his contemporaries to admire the African tradition and follow the logic and instincts of their race, but he did so using the English (or Arab) language exclusively and wearing only the best British suits, often having a British audience in mind. Blyden's much younger admirer Casely Hayford praised the specific Fanti-Ashanti tradition while frequently wearing neo-traditional garb, quoting indigenous songs and sayings, while occasionally, in brackets, signing with his African name 'Ekra-Agiman'.

Joseph Casely Hayford was an exemplary representative of the ARPS discourse. Hayford was a journalist, Cambridge trained lawyer and an important politician, the "uncrowned king of West Africa" during the first three decades of this century. Beyond being a political leader, Casely Hayford was probably the most comprehensive and representative political theorist of these decades in British West Africa: eloquent, sophisticated, witty and, where necessary, he made extensive reference to historical fact. He wrote, among other works *Gold Coast Native Institutions* (1903), *Ethiopia Unbound* (1911), *The Truth about the West African Land Question* (1913) and *United West Africa* (1919). After the 'Great War' he shifted to a more pragmatic and Pan-West-African position, which will be discussed in the next chapter.

Hayford's *Gold Coast Native Institutions* described the highly sophisticated Ashanti and Fanti political procedures, containing their own 'checks and balances', and mechanisms that promote thorough political deliberation. Typically, Casely Hayford gave an enthusiastic description of the role of the "Linguist" (or "Speaker"), especially in the Ashanti system. The Linguist is the most important personage of the Native State. He is in some cases more influential than the Chief....He is generally the repository, or, if you like, a walking encyclopedia, of all traditional knowledge...his knowledge embraces the political history of the whole State, as well as of sister States.  

His speeches will sparkle with humour. He is the master in "the art of 'linguistic' oratory" and creative in guiding the discussion to reach a balanced conclusion. Casely Hayford's inspired representation suggests that the educated were not outside the traditional system, competing with it, but right at its centre. Thus, he welded together the two major forces in indigenous politics in one model. For the 'educated sons of the nation' there was an important role "to serve his countries cause" as councillor, advisor, or linguist.

In a second way, Casely Hayford's *Native Institutions* effected a skilful integration of different political forces. Whereas John Mensah Sarbah, his senior contemporary, titled his famous scholarly study "Fanti Customary Law", Casely Hayford used the general title "Gold Coast Native Institutions". Old divisions, such as between Fanti and Ashanti, were surpassed in favour of the

---

165 Hayford 1903/1970, p. 68
166 Graft Johnson 1928/1971, p. 107
new encompassing unit 'Gold Coast'. Casely Hayford's *description* is simultaneously a nationalist *construction*, namely a conscious attempt to establish a *national* Fanti-Ashanti tradition.

Whereas *Gold Coast Native Institutions* provided the scientific proof for the existence of an indigenous Gold Coast political heritage, the appeal for Africans to actually turn to this heritage to create their future was expressed in Casely Hayford's magnificent fictional and partly autobiographical work *Ethiopia Unbound*. The main character of the story, travelling to England and through his home country, proves at every point that his indigenous background and inspiration is more humane, natural, sensitive and logically consistent than the British-Christian influences. When it comes to practical achievements in administration, the foreign tradition is criticized as disastrous for the Gold Coast. Casely Hayford's conclusion was clear: there is no alternative for the Gold Coast except to build on the indigenous tradition. There is "no healthy growth except from within."\(^{167}\)

This 'healthy growth', however, was blocked by colonial administration. The colonial power claimed to have a civilizing mission. Casely Hayford, however, showed that this mission consisted rather of the suppression of civilization, of *indigenous* civilization. For Casely Hayford, Colonial Africa was...Ethiopia chained. His political theory was that with Africans assuming control of their own affairs and developing their indigenous institutions, fettered Ethiopia would be unbound and eventually emerge as a giant among other nationalities.\(^{168}\)

The price of not taking this course would be costly: the people of the Gold Coast would forever be 'hewers of wood and drawers of water in their own country'.

Although far from a revolutionary, Casely Hayford was convinced of the essential illegitimacy of colonial rule. This is illustrated dramatically in *Ethiopia Unbound*, where the narrative recounts how Kwamanka is teaching his son about the "Black Peril", the "Yellow Peril" and the "Russian Bear", and the boy asks "But why don't you expose these things, dad?" The father, giving "vent to some utterance from the very recesses of his soul," answers "the hour has not yet come. Pray for thy father, that when it comes, he may be found strong and faithful."\(^{169}\)

Taken together, the ARPS discourse as represented by Casely Hayford's ideas, constitutes a remarkable and consistent alternative for development. This alternative of modernization-from-indigenous-roots, summarized in my own words, runs as follows: We are a nation, we have always ruled ourselves, and will rule ourselves again. We have our own civilization and our own set of

\(^{167}\)Hayford 1911/1969, p. 8

\(^{168}\)Ugonna 1966, p. xxii. Pages xxiii- xxvi give a very clear description of the idea of Ethiopianism; see also Essien-Udom 1962.

\(^{169}\)Hayford 1911/1969, p 119
political institutions. These can be revived and modernized to cater for the needs of today in an African way, analogous to the Japanese modernizing in a Japanese way. Our problem is shortsighted and biased British governors and politicians who fail to see that our natural place is that of a free nation within the Empire.  

In the days of the ARPS movement, this idea of modernization-from-indigenous-roots was not simply a theoretical conception. Several concrete exemplary situations fixed the idea in contemporary historical consciousness. In Fanti history itself, the idea could be traced back to the inspiration of the abortive Fanti Confederation. Internationally, it had its great examples in Japan and Ethiopia. Japan had avoided becoming 'chained' by colonialism through a strategy of 'modernization from its own roots'. Its power was proven by Japan's historic victory over the Russians in 1904. The state of Ethiopia had preserved its independence by beating the Italians in the equally historic battle at Aduwa in 1896. These actual examples of a successful strategy to escape colonial subjugation and to identify an indigenous path of development gave social meaning to the idea of an 'Unbound Africa'. They shaped the political horizon of the ARPS and their success stories are thus the exemplars of the idea of modernization-from-indigenous-roots.

In my discussions about the optimistic Krio discourse and the African Regeneration discourse, I showed that exemplars are important references in the texts themselves. This is also the case for the inspiration of the Fanti Confederation and the success story of Japan. These were frequently invoked by Sarbah and Casely Hayford in arguing the ARPS case. Danquah, later, expressed the same view by saying that King Garthey "tried to do for the Gold Coast in 1867 what Meiji did for Japan in 1867." The grand metaphor that is the title of Casely Hayford's book *Ethiopia Unbound* already expresses the whole idea of modernization-from-indigenous-roots. Firstly, Africa embodies an old and superb civilization, i.e. it is 'Ethiopia'; secondly, it is bound, or chained, that is, fettered not by natural but by human factors so that the issue is political liberation; thirdly once unbound it will flourish: "prosperous cities will grow up...vast wealth will be created...and between the races there will be mutual respect."  

---

170 The comparison with the Japanese case does not hold completely. In fact, Casely Hayford aimed at a status within the British empire, similar to that of Canada or Australia.  
171 The renewed popularity of the word 'Ethiopia' in Casely Hayford's time, which is in fact an archaic and mythical word for Africa, points directly to Ethiopia's historical victory over the Italians, which is often (probably incorrectly) seen as the first time a colonial army was beaten by an African army.  
173 Hayford 1911/1969, p. 130-131. De Graft Johnson expressed his Pan-West-African vision thus: "With progress in Native institutions, Education and Wealth, the citizens of these territories, the land of radiant energy and sunshine, would be welded into one federal unit, each colony retaining its individual local autonomy but joining together in one unbroken chain of glory!" de Graft Johnson 1928/1971, p. 127.
Proud as the idea of modernization-from-indigenous-roots may be, it was probably already an illusion by 1900. The rapid political developments increasingly made irrelevant the option of escaping from colonialism and successfully reclaiming the historical rights of 'traditional' rulers, as in the Bond of 1844. As Danquah stated in 1932: "the age in which an independent national consciousness dawned upon the Gold Coast people came to an end in 1897." The ARPS was a last upsurge of this assessment of colonial expansion, which Danquah called the "historical school" in African thought at the time. From then on political struggle would necessarily occur from a position as a colonized people.

The Gold Coast people had effectively become part of the Empire, and for weal or woe, what they could best do to foster the national cause and liberty was to work from within the British constitution itself for a liberal recognition of our right and capacity to direct our destiny within an Empire of free nations and not as a subject Colony forming the "pocket borough" of the English Parliament.

In a similar vein, the historian David Kimble stated that "the form of government and the peoples under its rule had changed beyond recognition during the few years 1897 - 1902," while, in terms of the ARPS, "its leaders hardly realized that power was slipping away from them, in favour of those who were more concerned with a fundamental change in the colonial relation than with the preservation of traditional rights."

In a peculiar way, however, the ARPS discourse was not only the grand end of an era of essentially pre-colonial rule. It was also the beginning of a twentieth century discourse of nationalist liberation. It was a swan song, so to say, but already largely in a musical notation of the new era. The way in which the indigenous alternative was presented, the notions used and the arguments advanced were new. It was a discourse in terms of 'countries', 'nations', 'constitutions', 'rights' etcetera. The Gold Coast nation itself, which should be 'unchained', was a product of the colonial power uniting, among others, Fanti and Ashanti, which were peoples with a history of mutual strife. In The Gold Coast Nation, the journal of the ARPS, Attoh Ahuma cried out in capitals "WE ARE A NATION" and added: "If we were not one it was time to invent one." 

Again, like in most historical cases, 'national' consciousness basically arose here out of the struggle itself. The ARPS statement "we are a nation

---

174 Danquah 1932, p. 17
175 Danquah 1932, p. 21 explains: " the "historical school" (i.e. those who swear by none but "the Bond of 1844")".
176 Danquah 1932, p. 20
177 Kimble 1963, p. 358
178 Ahuma 1911, p. 1
having its own tradition’ is the product of the specific historical situation in which the threat of colonial subjugation forced this Gold Coast nationality upon the people. Like in many other historical cases, however, this consciousness came too late to raise a political power strong enough to resist further colonial subjugation.

The ARPS discourse also pays tribute to the new colonial situation in the arguments used to defend African rights. For instance, the ‘ardent nationalist’ and editor of The Gold Coast Chronicle Atto Ahuma stated: ‘we are being welded together under one umbrageous Flag....The Gold Coast under the aegis of the Union Jack is the unanswerable argument to all who may incontinently withhold from us the common rights, privileges, and status of nationality.’ It is the Union Jack which provides the argument for national liberation! This is not that strange if we look at the specific political actions which Ahuma’s statement supports: namely petitioning the governor, representing grievances within the Legislative Council of the colony and going to London, while declaring over and over again that they were strictly 'constitutional', which meant adhering to the constitution of the colonial Empire. In fact, the form of action taken by the ARPS was already similar to that of a nationalist opposition movement within the colonial system.

My point here is that the message of the ARPS is to escape colonial usurpation of ‘native’ power which entails a pre-colonial-rule political horizon, as explained above. On the other hand, the wording and much of the actual political action of the ARPS made it a nationalist liberation discourse and an early example of anti-colonialism in a colonial situation.

This interesting ambiguity in the ARPS discourse also explains its fate in history. The inspiring message that there is an indigenous road to modernity, as a national enterprise based on the ‘Gold Coast Native Institutions’, could be formulated only towards the end of the century when the Gold Coast as a unit actually came into being, i.e. when colonial administration also became established in the territories outside the vicinity of the coastal Forts. The establishment of colonial rule and the formation of a national consciousness went hand in hand. A quarter of a century earlier, in 1874, the Fanti Confederation could not yet rely on such a national consciousness; when their leaders were arrested, the population did not emerge to rescue ‘the nation’.

On the other hand, the appeal of the discourse aimed at re-establishing indigenous self-rule could not last long. Concrete political issues in the colony required political organization within the logic of that system: "for weal or woe, what they could best do to foster the national cause and liberty was to work from within the British constitution itself," as I quoted J.B. Danquah. At the same time, the colonial administration incorporated the chiefs in this administration, but on its own terms. The alternative of rebuilding indigenous political institutions thus became quite a theoretical one. De Graft Johnson’s

---

180 Ahuma 1911, p. 2
Towards Nationhood in West Africa is a case in point. This book probably provided the most complete proposal for adjusting indigenous institutions to the format of a modern nation-state. But it did so in 1928 and, despite its sophistication, it remained an intellectual exercise lacking political importance.

In the first decade of the 20th century, the ARPS could not attain much. There was a need to fight using more effective political organizations, and to confront the system on its own ground. This is the context of the next phase of political struggle, for instance in the form of the African National Congress (ANC) in South Africa, or the National Congress of British West Africa (NCBWA), established in 1920 as the first transnational and Pan-West-Africa organization in that era.

**Conclusion**

This chapter recounts the first round of African political discourses addressing the challenge of European confrontation. Political discourses in this era shared what I called an 'open historical horizon', i.e. the assumption that various developmental options were open and total colonial subjugation could be avoided. I argued that three basic discourses can be identified, each shaped by a particular historical situation and a specific struggle. The optimistic Krio discourse, which operated in a situation where the establishment of independent African states seemed a possibility after the Select Committee proposal, in 1865; Blyden's African Regeneration discourse which opposed colonial racism and paternalism in the last decades of the nineteenth century; and the African Rights Protection Society discourse which struggled to preserve indigenous land rights and systems of rule in the Gold Coast in the 1890s.

The analysis of this first round has been a methodological adventure as well. I had set myself the task to avoid a simple history of ideas that ignores the actual political situations which shaped the meaning and 'pointe' of political discourses. On the other hand, I wanted to avoid a description of political ideas as simply the ideological expression of class interests (see chapter 2). I reconstructed historically situated discourses as they addressed political issues perceived by contemporaries, and traced the heuristic that conditions the framework of ideas of the discourse concerned. As a tool for such a reconstruction, I attempted to identify the exemplars, that is those crucial stories or metaphors which articulate key real-life situations of collective concern.

In each of the three cases, such constitutive exemplars turned out to be operative. The image of the successful recaptive appeared to be the model for Horton's view of Africa's great leap towards universal modernity. The idea of

---

181 de Graft Johnson 1928/1971, especially chapter XVI.
182 Historical details of political movements and thinkers in this period are represented excellently in e.g. July 1968, Langley 1973, Geiss 1968, Padmore 1953.
the \textit{color-line} became the model for Blyden's view of a uniquely African civilizatory mission. Similarly, Casely Hayford's image of \textit{Ethiopia Unbound} models the ARPS conception of the political problem at hand, namely breaking the colonial chains in order to reinstate self-rule and develop-from-our-own-roots. In each case, also the rise and fall of the discourse could be explained by the emergence and decline in social history of the collective experience which the key exemplar articulated.

In all three cases, finally, the highly local and temporal relevance of the discourse concerned did not preclude the emergence of a grand view of African development. The ideas of a 'modern' Africa, of an 'authentic' Africa and of an Africa modernizing from indigenous roots have \textit{general} relevance. Every revival during the next one hundred years of the specific nineteenth century variants of these ideas, however, will lack an essential precondition which the nineteenth century discourses had, namely the idea that the colonial experience could be avoided.\footnote{Of course similar options have been advanced in the 20th century but only in an indirect way, as ‘an inspiration for’ a new African society, never again with the realism and self-confidence derived from a situation where such options could still be part of a political programme.} Around 1900 it was clear that this was not to be the case. Colonial subjugation was a reality, and politics would, for the time being, be politics within, even if about, the colonial system. These conditions shaped the second round of African political discourse to be discussed in the next chapter of the present book.